

**Objective Structured Clinical Examination (OSCE) versus
Traditional Clinical Examination in Assessing
Nursing Students Surgical Clinical Competence**

Thesis

Submitted In Partial Fulfillment of the
Doctorate Degree
in
Nursing Science
(Medical – Surgical Nursing)

By

Mona Mohamed El Sayed Ali
B. Sc. Nursing, M.Sc. Nursing

Assistant Lecturer
Faculty of Nursing - British University in Egypt

Faculty of Nursing
Ain Shams University
٢٠١٢

**Objective Structured Clinical Examination (OSCE) versus
Traditional Examination in Assessing Nursing Students
Surgical Clinical Competence**

Thesis

Submitted In Partial Fulfillment of the
Doctorate Degree
in

Nursing Science
(Medical – Surgical Nursing)

Supervised by

Prof. Dr. Kamelia Fouad Abdalla
Professor of Medical Surgical Nursing
Vice Dean of Postgraduates Studies& Research
Faculty of Nursing
Ain Shams University

Prof. Dr. Cheherezade Mohamed Ghazi
Professor of Medical Surgical Nursing
Dean of Faculty of Nursing
Faculty of Nursing
The British University in Egypt

Ass. Prof. Dr. Nesreen El Sayed Osman
Ass. Prof. of Medical Surgical Nursing
Faculty of Nursing
Ain Shams University

Faculty of Nursing
Ain Shams University
٢٠١٢

الإمتحان العملى المخطط الهادف عكس الإمتحان التقليدى

فى تقييم كفاءة طلاب التمريض الجراحى

رسالة دكتوراة
توطنها للحصول على درجة الدكتوراة فى علوم التمريض
(تمريض باطنى جراحى)

المقدمة من الطالبة

منى محمد السيد على ميهوب

مدرس مساعد
قسم تمريض باطنى جراحى
كلية التمريض
الجامعة البريطانية

التمريض

جامعة عين شمس

٢٠١٢

ABSTRACT

Clinical competence is a complex concept that includes such attributes as knowledge, skills, and attitudes. Objective structured clinical examination (OSCE) is considered the most reliable method for assessing skills for health profession. OSCE is a tool to objectively and fairly assess nursing students' clinical competences. This study aimed to evaluate the effectiveness of the Objective Structured Clinical Examination versus traditional examination in assessing nursing students' surgical clinical competence. Four tools for data collection. Clinical Competence Level Sheets one for the delineation of the nursing students knowledge and the second to observe nursing students practice. An Evaluation Sheet was used to record Patients' Complications resulting from Intravenous Therapy. Finally a Perception Scale was used consisting of two sheets, the first for the Perception of students, and the second for the perception of teachers. A convenient sample of 22 students was selected to apply the traditional method to assess clinical practice in academic year 2010-2011, and 22 nursing students formed the study sample exposed to the OSCE method of assessment in academic year 2011-2012 at the Faculty of nursing at the British University in Egypt. The results revealed that, 50% of the students in the control group assessed through the traditional method had a satisfactory level of total knowledge related to intravenous therapy, while, 50% of the study group assessed through the OSCE had a satisfactory level of total knowledge related to IV therapy. Moreover, the 81,82% of the students utilizing the traditional method had satisfactory level of performance. While, 96,88% of the students utilizing OSCE had a satisfactory level of performance. As regards students' perception towards method of assessment, 40,45% of the students had a positive perception towards the traditional method, while 50% of the students who utilize OSCE had a positive perception toward the method. As regards to patients' complications resulting from IV therapy the study revealed that, higher percentage among students who utilized the traditional method as compared to the patients who received IV therapy from students exposed to the OSCE method at $P < 0.001$. The study concluded that Objective Structured Clinical Examination has statistically significant positive effect in assessing nursing students' surgical competence regarding IV therapy (IV cannula insertion and IV fluids administration) which reflect positively on patients receiving IV therapy by decreasing complications resulting from this therapy versus traditional method. The study recommends that the OSCE should be implemented in all faculties of nursing for enhancing the level of students' competence.

LIST OF APPENDIX

Appendices	Page
Protocol.....	1- 11
Part I - Demographic Characteristics Sheet & Learning Style Self Assessment Questionnaire.....	1- 5
Part II – Self- Administered Nursing Students' Knowledge Questionnaire.....	1- 8
Part III - Observational Checklist for Nursing Students Performance (IV Cannula Insertion).....	1- 3
Part IV - Observational Checklist for Nursing Students Performance (Intravenous Fluid Administration).....	1- 2
Part V – Students' Perception Sheet (Part A).....	1- 2
Part VI - Teachers' Perception Sheet (Part B).....	1- 2
Part VII - Evaluation Sheet for Patient's Complications result from Intravenous Therapy.....	1- 3
Part VIII – OSCE Documents.....	1- 3

LIST OF CONTENTS

	Page
Introduction	1
Significance of the study.....	3
Aims of the Study.....	3
Research Questions.....	4
Review of Literature	5
Overview about clinical practice assessment	5
Definition of assessment in nursing practice.....	6
Criteria for effective clinical practice assessment.....	6
Purposes of clinical practice assessment.....	7
Principles of clinical practice assessment.....	8
Clinical practice competence assessment.....	9
Methods of Clinical Practice Competence Assessment	
A. Traditional method clinical practice competence assessment	11
Strategies of Clinical Practice Competent Assessment	17
Observational Method.....	18
Rating Scale Method.....	23
Anecdotal Method.....	26
B. Objective Structured Clinical Examination	
Background of Objective Structured Clinical Examination.....	32
Definition of Objective Structured Clinical Examination.....	33
Advantages/ disadvantages of Objective Structured Clinical Examination.....	36
Validity & Reliability of Objective Structured Clinical Examination..	39
Marking of Objective Structured Clinical Examination.....	41
Types of Objective Structured Clinical Examination Station.....	46
Preparation for Objective Structured Clinical Examination.....	47
- Preparation for the Staff.....	47
- Preparation for the students.....	50

- Role of the Stakeholders of OSCE.....	٥٧
- Preparation of the standardized patient.....	٦٣
- Preparation for the environment.....	٦٩
Subjects and Methods	٧٥
Results	١٠٠
Discussion	١٢٦
Conclusion and Recommendations	١٤٨
Summary	١٥١
References	١٥٨
Research Protocol	
Appendices	
Tools appendix.....	
Arabic Summary	

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure No.:

	Page
١. Comparison between the control and study groups regarding to total mean score of their knowledge, skills, and perception toward method of assessment	١١٨
٢. Correlation between teachers' perception and their demographic characteristics towards each method of Assessment	١٢١
٣. Types of IV therapy complications observed among two groups of patients	١٢٤

LIST OF TABLES

Table No.

	Page
١. Distribution of Sample Characteristics among the control and study groups	١٠٢
٢. Comparison between the control and study groups knowledge about IV therapy	١٠٣
٣. Comparison between the control and study groups total mean scores of knowledge about IV therapy.....	١٠٤
٤. Comparison between level of skills in intravenous cannula insertion among the control and study groups.....	١٠٥
٥. Comparison between the control and study groups regarding their level of skills as related to IV fluids administration.....	١٠٨
٦. Comparison between the control and study groups total mean score of satisfactory skills in relation IV cannula insertion and IV fluids administration	١١٠
٧. Comparison between competence level of the control and study groups as regarding the total score of skills about IV therapy.....	١١١
٨. Comparison between the control and study groups perception toward each method of assessment	١١٢
٩. Comparison between total mean values of total perception in the control and study groups for each method of assessment.....	١١٤
١٠. Relation between educational level of the control and study groups and total mean score of their knowledge, skills, and perception.....	١١٥
١١. Relation between gender of the control and study groups and total mean score of their knowledge, skills, and perception.....	١١٦
١٢. Relation between learning style in the control and study group and total mean score of knowledge, skills, and perception.....	١١٧
١٣. Comparison between teachers' perception toward each method of assessment	١١٩
١٤. Correlation between teachers' perception toward each method of assessment and their demographic characteristics.....	١٢١

١٥. Characteristics of the patients receiving IV therapy from the control and study groups	١٢٢
١٦. Comparison between clinical competence of the control and study groups regarding to IV cannula insertion and IV fluids administration in the clinical area	١٢٣
١٧. Types of IV therapy complications observed among the two groups of patients	١٢٤

LIST OF ABBERVATIONS

OSCE	Objective Structure Clinical Examination
SP	Standardized Patient
VAK	Visual, Auditory, and Kinesthetic
IV	Intravenous

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

My sincere gratitude should be submitted first for "ALLAH" who always helps and cares for me.

I gratefully acknowledge Prof. Kamelia Foaud Professor of Medical-Surgical Nursing Faculty of Nursing, Ain Shams University for her support throughout my thesis with her patience, her meticulous guidance, her valuable knowledge, huge effort that she exerted with me, motivation, enthusiasm, and valuable input in this thesis. I gratefully thank and appreciate Prof. Cheherezade Ghazi Professor of Medical-Surgical Nursing, Faculty of Nursing, British Universality in Egypt for her advice, supervision, and crucial contribution from the very early stage of this thesis as well as giving me extraordinary experiences throughout the work, which made her a backbone of this thesis. At the same time, I would like to express my sincerest gratitude to I am heartily thankful to the soul of my supervisor Dr. Nessrien Ossman Assistant professor of Medical- Surgical Nursing Faculty of Nursing Ain shams University for her encouragement, supervision, may god bless her soul.

I would to thank my colleagues, students, and standardized patients so much for their valuable contribution in this study, and everybody who had an important role to the successful realization of thesis, as well as expressing my apology that I could not mention personally one by one.

Mona Mayhob

DEDICATION

To

The soul of my mother, may God bless her soul

INTRODUCTION

Assessment of clinical practice performance continues to create a challenge for nursing educators. The traditional clinical examination has been criticized for focusing simply on nursing students' knowledge and their abilities to memorize, while ignoring other important characteristics such as problem solving, critical thinking, and communication skills. Furthermore, the results of several assessment tools tend to be subjective in nature, and many have not been validated. The assessment of clinical competence has been greatly advanced over the past two decades. The advent of several structured performance exams has enabled some of the limitations to be overcome. One of the most popular forms of the structured performance exams is the Objective Structured Clinical Examination (OSCE) (*Bhatnagar, Saoji, & Banerjee, 2017*).

Objective Structured Clinical Examination (OSCE) is a well – established approach that has been successfully used, in nursing education, to assess knowledge, and clinical practice competencies. OSCE integrates knowledge and skills, enabling components of clinical competence and performance to be identified and assessed under standardized conditions allowing a large number of students to be assessed simultaneously. OSCE

allows the students an opportunity to demonstrate their clinical skills and it is a motivation for learning (*Clarke, Rainey, & Traynor, 2007*).

Competence assessment is a systematic process, many factors can detract from a valid and reliable measurement, and the competence level of student nurses could be influenced by many situational factors. The clinical competence of nursing students has become a central issue closely related to professional standards and public safety (*Yanhua, & Watson, 2007*).

Clinical practice competence assessment is to-day a fundamental aspect of student training. Clinical practice competence involves a sophisticated combination of theoretical knowledge and professional skills. Clinical practice competence assessment continues to be a major focus in nursing education, although it may reveal a complex process, which has undergone many changes. The ultimate aim of producing competent nurses is to ensure that patients receive a high level of care as nowadays, nurses' clinical roles may be multifaceted according to the setting they work in, or the patients they are responsible for (*Cassidy, 2007*).