



EARLY ARCHITECTURE DESIGN QUALITY OPTIMIZATION USING BIM

By

Reem Mustafa AbdelAziz Mustafa

A Thesis Submitted to the
Faculty of Engineering at Cairo University
in Partial Fulfillment of the
Requirements for the Degree of
MASTER OF SCIENCE
in
Architectural Engineering

**FACULTY OF ENGINEERING, CAIRO UNIVERSITY
GIZA, EGYPT
2021**

**EARLY ARCHITECTURE DESIGN QUALITY
OPTIMIZATION USING BIM**

By

Reem Mustafa AbdelAziz Mustafa

A Thesis Submitted to the
Faculty of Engineering at Cairo University
in Partial Fulfillment of the
Requirements for the Degree of
MASTER OF SCIENCE
in
Architectural Engineering

Under the Supervision of

**Prof. Dr. Sherine Mohy Eldin
Wahba**

**Prof. Dr. Ayman Hassan Ahmed
Mahmoud**

.....
Professor of Architectural Design
Department of Architectural Engineering
Faculty of Engineering, Cairo University

.....
Professor of Architectural Design
Department of Architectural Engineering
Faculty of Engineering, Cairo University

FACULTY OF ENGINEERING, CAIRO UNIVERSITY
GIZA, EGYPT
2021

EARLY ARCHITECTURE DESIGN QUALITY OPTIMIZATION USING BIM

By
Reem Mustafa AbdelAziz Mustafa

A Thesis Submitted to the
Faculty of Engineering at Cairo University
in Partial Fulfillment of the
Requirements for the Degree of
MASTER OF SCIENCE
in
Architectural Engineering

Approved by the
Examining Committee

Prof. Dr. Sherine Mohy Eldin Wahba

Thesis Main Advisor**

Prof. Dr. Ayman Hassan Ahmed

Advisor**

A. Prof. Tarek Nasr Eldin Ibrahim

Internal Examiner**

Prof. Dr. Ayman Fathallah Wanas,
Prof. of Architecture
Arab academy of Science and Technology

External Examiner**

FACULTY OF ENGINEERING, CAIRO UNIVERSITY
GIZA, EGYPT
2021

Engineer's Name: Reem Mustafa AbdelAziz Mustafa
Date of Birth: 15/11/1992
Nationality: Egyptian
E-mail: Reem-mustafaa@live.com
Phone: 01111572520
Address: 21st Taha Hussein street, Haram district,
Giza, Egypt
Registration Date: 01/10/2017
Awarding Date: / / 2021
Degree: (Master of Science)
Department: Architecture Engineering



Supervisors:

Prof. Sherine Mohy Eldin Wahba
Prof. Ayman Hassan Ahmed

Examiners:

Prof. Sherine Mohy Eldin Wahba (Thesis main advisor)
Prof. Ayman Hassan Ahmed Mahmoud (advisor)
Prof. Tarek Nasr Eldin Ibrahim (Internal examiner)
Asst. prof. at faculty of Engineering-Cairo University
Prof. Ayman Fathallah Wanas (External examiner)
Prof. at Arab Academy for Science and Technology

Title of Thesis:

EARLY ARCHITECTURE DESIGN QUALITY OPTIMIZATION USING BIM

Key Words: (must be 5 words only)

Early architecture design, BIM, design quality optimization, design quality guidelines, design assessment

Summary: (not more than 150 word and the summary must be in the same page)

Architecture design quality is highly dependent on optimizing the early phases of the design process. For this purpose, it's important to identify the quality guidelines that could optimize architecture quality while being attainable at such early phases. Building information modeling (BIM) can easily contribute to optimizing early architecture design while providing a solution to the design challenges faced at the early design phases. Therefore, this thesis aims at maximizing the role of BIM in optimizing the architecture design process in the early phases; by providing a framework that clarifies the possible BIM contributions and potentials.

Disclaimer

I hereby declare that this thesis is my own original work and that no part of it has been submitted for a degree qualification at any other university or institute.

I further declare that I have appropriately acknowledged all sources used and have cited them in the references section.

Name: Reem Mustafa AbdelAziz Mustafa

Date: / /2021

Signature:

Acknowledgments

First of all, I would like to thank my **parents** for their continuous support and sacrifices so that I can be the person I am today and be able to finish this work.

I am deeply grateful to my supervisors, **Prof. Sherine Wahba** and **Prof. Ayman Hassan**, who have supported me with every possible way offering guidance and knowledge that have helped me all along the way.

Nevertheless, completing this thesis would have never been possible without the assistance of **Prof. Aly Gabr** and **Prof. Mohamed Anwar**. Their continuous support and care has been always present, all along the way, while working on this thesis. I could never thank them enough for their efforts and guidance; and most of all, for always being there to provide help and support whenever I needed.

Table of Contents

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION.....	1
1.1 BACKGROUND	1
1.2 OBSERVATIONS.....	4
1.2.1 Position of BIM in the AEC industry.....	4
1.2.2 Position of BIM in the architecture design practice.....	5
1.2.3 Availability of quality guidelines for the early architecture design phases	6
1.3 PROBLEM IDENTIFICATION	6
1.4 RESEARCH AIM AND OBJECTIVES.....	7
1.5 RESEARCH QUESTIONS.....	8
1.6 METHODOLOGICAL FRAMEWORK.....	8
CHAPTER 2: QUALITY IN ARCHITECTURE DESIGN PROCESS.....	12
2.1 INTRODUCTION	12
2.2 AN OVERVIEW OF THE ARCHITECTURE DESIGN PHASES	12
2.2.1 Definitions and phases of the AEC process.....	12
2.2.2 Definition and phases of the architecture design process.....	16
2.2.3 Understanding the “Early Architecture Design Phases”.....	18
2.2.3.1 Characteristics of the “Early Architecture Design Phases”.....	19
2.2.3.2 Challenges of the “Early Architecture Design Phases”.....	21
2.3 QUALITY DEFINITIONS WITHIN THE ARCHITECTURE DESIGN PHASES.....	22
2.4 EXISTING INTERNATIONAL “ARCHITECTURE DESIGN QUALITY ASSESSMENT SYSTEMS”.....	24
2.4.1 Definitions of “Architecture Design Quality Assessment Systems”.....	24
2.4.2 Examples of “Architecture Design Quality Assessment Systems”.....	25
2.4.2.1 LEED.....	25
2.4.2.2 BREEAM.....	26
2.4.3 Potentials and limitations of “Architecture Design Quality Assessment Systems”...	27
2.5 POSSIBILITY OF GENERATING “QUALITY GUIDELINES FOR EARLY ARCHITECTURE DESIGN PHASES”.....	30
2.5.1 Possibility of early design quality assessment.....	31
2.5.2 Process of early design quality assessment.....	32
2.5.3 Components of “Early Architecture Design Quality Guidelines”.....	33
2.6 IDENTIFYING QUALITY CATEGORIES FOR THE EARLY ARCHITECTURE DESIGN PHASES.....	34
2.6.1 The US. General service administration (GSA).....	34
2.6.2 Building sustainability assessment methods (BSAMs).....	35
2.6.3 Resulting quality categories for early architecture design phases.....	37
2.7 IDENTIFYING QUALITY CRITERIA AND INDICATORS FOR THE EARLY ARCHITECTURE DESIGN PHASES.....	38
2.7.1 Space efficiency criteria in early architecture design phases	39
2.7.2 Circulation efficiency criteria in early architecture design phases.....	43
2.7.3 Energy efficiency criteria in early architecture design phases.....	45

2.7.4	Cost efficiency criteria in early architecture design phases.....	49
2.7.4.1	<i>Early LCC estimation</i>	50
2.7.4.2	<i>Data required for LCC estimation</i>	50
2.8	CONCLUSION OF THE GENERATED “EARLY ARCHITECTURE DESIGN QUALITY GUIDELINES” FOR OPTIMIZING ARCHITECTURE DESIGN.....	52
	CHAPTER 3: AN INSIGHT ON BIM APPLICATIONS IN THE ARCHITECTURE DESIGN PROCESS.....	56
3.1	INTRODUCTION.....	56
3.2	UNDERSTANDING BIM.....	56
3.2.1	BIM definitions as part of the AEC practice.....	56
3.2.2	BIM dimensions offered to the AEC practice.....	58
3.2.3	BIM levels of data (LOD) within the AEC practice.....	60
3.3	THE ROLE OF COMPUTER IN THE AEC PRACTICE.....	60
3.3.1	Traditional CAD and BIM evolution within the AEC industry.....	61
3.3.2	Traditional CAD and BIM available software	62
3.3.3	Functions of BIM software in the AEC practice	63
3.4	BIM CONTRIBUTION TO THE AEC PRACTICE.....	65
3.4.1	Potentials of BIM in the AEC practice.....	64
3.4.2	BIM challenges in the AEC practice.....	67
3.4.2.1	<i>Barriers linked to the BIM product</i>	67
3.4.2.2	<i>Barriers linked to the BIM process</i>	68
3.4.2.3	<i>Barriers linked to the people using BIM</i>	69
3.5	BIM CONTRIBUTION TO THE EARLY ARCHITECTURE DESIGN.....	69
3.5.1	Potentials of BIM in early architecture design optimization	70
3.5.2	BIM challenges in early architecture design optimization.....	72
3.6	CLASSIFICATION OF BIM CONTRIBUTION TO EARLY ARCHITECTURE DESIGN OPTIMIZATION	73
3.6.1	BIM hierarchy of contribution to early architecture design optimization.....	74
3.6.2	BIM strategy of contribution to early architecture design optimization.....	74
3.6.2.1	<i>BIM-based basic design support</i>	75
3.6.2.2	<i>BIM-based interactive design support</i>	78
3.6.2.3	<i>BIM-based building performance simulation (BPS)</i>	81
3.6.2.4	<i>BIM-based model checking (BMC)</i>	83
3.7	CONCLUSION OF THE CLASSIFICATION OF BIM CONTRIBUTION TO DESIGN QUALITY OPTIMIZATION THE EARLY ARCHITECTURE DESIGN PHASES.....	87
	CHAPTER 4: FRAMEWORK FOR UTILIZING BIM IN EARLY ARCHITECTURE DESIGN QUALITY OPTIMIZATION	90
4.1	INTRODUCTION	90
4.2	UNDERSTANDING QUALITY CATEGORIES OF THE GENERATED “EARLY ARCHITECTURE DESIGN QUALITY GUIDELINES”.....	90
4.3	GENERATING MEASURABLE QUALITY INDICATORS FOR EARLY ARCHITECTURE DESIGN.....	92
4.3.1	Quantitative criteria for space design efficiency in early architecture design.....	93
4.3.2	Quantitative criteria for circulation design efficiency in early architecture design....	97
4.3.3	Quantitative criteria for energy design efficiency in early architecture design.....	99

4.4 DESIGN OPTIMIZATION USING BIM IN THE EARLY ARCHITECTURE DESIGN PHASES FOR SUBJECTIVE DESIGN CATEGORIES	101
4.4.1 Role of BIM in optimizing space design in early architecture design phases.....	102
4.4.1.1 <i>Interactive spatial design analysis and assessment applications</i>	104
4.4.1.2 <i>Interactive generative spatial design applications</i>	106
4.4.1.3 <i>Generating a list of BIM contributions to spatial design optimization in the early architecture design phases</i>	109
4.4.2 Role of BIM in optimizing circulation design in early architecture design phases.....	115
4.4.2.1 <i>Interactive circulation design analysis and assessment applications</i>	115
4.4.2.2 <i>Interactive generative circulation design applications</i>	116
4.4.2.3 <i>Generating a list of BIM contributions to circulation design optimization in the early architecture design phases</i>	117
4.5 DESIGN OPTIMIZATION USING BIM IN THE EARLY ARCHITECTURE DESIGN PHASES FOR OBJECTIVE DESIGN CATEGORIES	122
4.5.1 Role of BIM in optimizing energy design in early architecture design phases.....	122
4.5.2 Role of BIM in optimizing cost design in early architecture design phases.....	132
4.6 CONCLUSION OF THE CONTRIBUTION OF BIM TO DESIGN QUALITY OPTIMIZATION WITHIN THE EARLY ARCHITECTURE DESIGN PHASES: A FRAMEWORK.....	135
CHAPTER 5: EARLY ARCHITECTURE DESIGN OPTIMIZATION METHODOLOGIES USING BIM: RESEARCH INVESTIGATION.....	143
5.1. INTRODUCTION.....	143
5.2. FRAMEWORK TESTING METHODOLOGY.....	143
5.3. SURVEY POPULATION AND TARGETED SAMPLING.....	143
5.3.1 Type of sampling.....	144
5.3.2 The population of the sample.....	144
5.3.3 Size of the sample.....	145
5.3.4 Location of the sample	147
5.4. QUESTIONNAIRE DESIGN TO TEST GENERATED FRAMEWORK.....	147
5.4.1 Proposed questionnaire design and development.....	147
5.4.1.1 <i>Types of questions</i>	147
5.4.1.2 <i>Sequence of questions</i>	148
5.4.1.3 <i>Covering letter of the questionnaire</i>	148
5.4.2 Pre-testing the questionnaire	149
5.5. ANALYSIS AND PRESENTATION OF RESULTS.....	149
5.5.1 Analysis of results of the first survey targeting architecture professors.....	151
5.5.1.1 <i>Design categories of “Early Architecture Design Quality Guidelines”</i>	151
5.5.1.2 <i>Design criteria of the generated categories</i>	152
5.5.1.3 <i>Quality indicators of the generated criteria</i>	153
5.5.1.4 <i>Quantitative indicators of quality for the generated criteria</i>	157
5.5.2 Analysis of results of the second survey targeting BIM practitioners	158
5.6. CONCLUSION	160
CHAPTER 6: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	163
6.1. INTRODUCTION.....	163
6.2. RE-GENERATING THE FRAMEWORK.....	163
6.3. CONCLUSION.....	167
6.3.1. Conclusion of the theoretical part.....	167
6.3.1.1. <i>Generated “Early Architecture Design Quality Guidelines”</i>	167

6.3.1.2.	<i>Role of BIM in optimizing design quality in early architecture design phases</i>	168
6.3.2.	Conclusion of the analytical part.....	168
6.3.2.1.	<i>Initial generated framework of “Early Architecture Design Quality Optimization using BIM”..</i>	168
6.3.2.2.	<i>validating the initial framework</i>	169
6.3.2.3.	<i>Re-generated framework of “Early Architecture Design Quality Optimization using BIM” ...</i>	170
6.4	DISCUSSION.....	170
6.3.3.	Analyzing BIM contribution to “Early architecture design quality guidelines”.....	171
6.3.4.	Analyzing the classification of the role of BIM in optimizing design quality in the early architecture design phases.....	175
6.5.	RECOMMENDATIONS.....	178
6.6.	LIMITATIONS.....	178
6.6.1.	Limitations of the framework.....	178
6.6.2.	Limitations of the research.....	179
6.7.	FUTURE RESEARCHES.....	179
	REFERENCES.....	180
	APPENDIX: A.....	191

List of Figures

Figure 1.1: The difference between cost of design changes and work load distribution in “front loaded design process” and “traditional design process”	2
Figure 1.2: Coordination of tasks offered by BIM to the AEC process all along the project’s phases	3
Figure 1.3: Search rates on BIM technologies via Google search engine in 2021 [9].....	4
Figure 1.4: BIM usage and awareness graph in UK.....	5
Figure 1.5: BIM adoption over time in the AEC industry, UK.....	5
Figure 1.6: Common BIM intervention within an AEC project.....	7
Figure 1.7: Optimum BIM intervention within an AEC project	7
Figure 1.8: Research aim and objectives.....	8
Figure 1.9: Methodological framework of the thesis structure	9
Figure 2.1: Difference of workflow between Traditional and collaborative AEC processes.....	15
Figure 2.2: AEC project phases diagram.....	18
Figure 2.3: Cost and work load of design changes in an AEC project along its life time	20
Figure 2.4: Costs during a whole AEC project.....	20
Figure 2.5: Illustration of the research’s scope of optimizing Architecture Design Quality in the early Architecture design phases.	23
Figure 2.6: GSA model of early architecture design assessment workflow for early design optimization.....	33
Figure 2.7: BSAMs Model for assessing design quality at the architecture design phases	36
Figure 2.8: Illustration of the research’s scope of optimizing Architecture Design Quality in the early Architecture design phases by targeting the four main early design assessment categories.	38
Figure 2.9: Data criteria required for conducting LCC estimation	51
Figure 3.1: BIM definitions in the literature	58
Figure 3.2: clash detection between a wall and a pipe with different severity according to the wall type	84
Figure 3.3: clash detection with different severity grades according to the pipe diameter	84
Figure 4.1: Illustration of the center point of the space and the view angle.....	94
Figure 4.2: Circulation simplicity data in BIM showing number and angles of turns of each path [.....	98
Figure 4.3: Path environment data in BIM showing distance, volume of path and window sizes	98
Figure 4.4: Example of data derived from BIM containing the characteristics of space and circulation elements	103
Figure 4.5: A basic design presented through BIM software.....	104
Figure 4.6: Example of a space and circulation validation using Solibri software to compare two design alternatives	106
Figure 4.7: “Space plan generator tool” interface while generating spatial plans.....	108
Figure 4.8: Dynaspace interface when viewing a bubble diagram and applying design constraints on it to transform it into spatial relations	109
Figure 4.9: Packing strategies using space planning mode in “ Refinery toolkit” to generate different plan arrangements	109

Figure 4.10: Visibility analysis from different points in space using Space planning mode in “Refinery toolkit”	109
Figure 4.11: Revit interface while presenting shade and shadow of design according to its orientation	124
Figure 4.12: Design alternatives generated using "Three box massing tool” within Revit 2021	125
Figure 4.13: Daylight simulation interface in Revit 2021	125
Figure 4.14: Sefaira plugin in Revit 2021 performing daylight penetration simulation	126
Figure 4.15: Insight plugin in Revit 2021 interface analyzing PV potential design locations.....	127
Figure 4.16: Sefaira plugin for Revit interface showing energy performance, daylight analysis, and design materials efficiency	128
Figure 5.1: Ratio between number of respondents of the first survey targeted sample	146
Figure 5.2: Ratio between number of respondents of the second survey targeted sample	147
Figure 5.3: The 4 levels of the framework analysis	150
Figure 5.4: Respondents agreement on the validity of the four Design categories for assessing early architecture design quality	151
Figure 5.5: Respondents agreement on the validity of the design quality criteria of the 4 generated design categories for assessing early design quality	152
Figure 5.6: Respondents agreement on the validity of the indicators of the quality criteria for space design category	154
Figure 5.7: Respondents agreement on the validity of the Quality indicators of the quality criteria for Circulation design category	155
Figure 5.8: Respondents agreement on the validity of the Quality indicators of the quality criteria for Energy design category	156
Figure 5.9: Respondents agreement on the validity and sufficiency of the elements within each data criteria to conduct an efficient LCC analysis	157
Figure 5.10: Respondents agreement on the validity of expressing quality indicators of Space and circulation design categories with quantitative indicators	158
Figure 5.11: Respondents opinions regarding the BIM role of contribution to the generated design categories for enhancing early design quality	158
Figure 6.1: Re-generated framework of "Early Architecture Design Optimization using BIM" according to added weights	163
Figure 6.2 : Framework’s weights structure to illustrate the methodology of calculating the impact factor of BIM contribution to each design category, and overall early architecture design.....	165
Figure 6.3: BIM impact factors on optimizing the 4 Early Architecture Design categories	171
Figure 6.4: BIM impact factors on optimizing the 4 Early Architecture Design categories taking the weight of categories in affecting early architecture design into consideration.....	171
Figure 6.5: Contribution of each BIM Strategies to optimizing Early Architecture Design categories.....	175
Figure 6.6: Contribution of each BIM tool to optimizing Early Architecture Design categories (Space, Circulation, Energy)	176
Figure 6.7: Contribution of each BIM Hierarchy to optimizing Early Architecture Design categories.....	178

List of Tables

Table 2.1: Early architecture design phases’ challenges	21
Table 2.2: LEED certificate quality categories [33].....	26
Table 2.3: BREEAM certificate quality categories [33] [35].....	27
Table 2.4: Assessment categories of the generated “Early Architecture Design Quality Guidelines”	37
Table 2.5: Design criteria and quality indicators, for “Early Architecture Design Quality Guidelines”, to achieve efficient spatial design	42
Table 2.6: Recommendations for optimizing horizontal circulation design quality	44
Table 2.7: Design criteria and quality indicators, for “Early Architecture Design Quality Guidelines”, to achieve efficient horizontal circulation design	45
Table 2.8: Design criteria of the “Early Architecture Design Quality Guidelines” to optimize energy design.	46
Table 2.9: Design guidelines and quality indicators, for “Early Architecture Design Quality Guidelines”, to achieve efficient total energy performance.....	48
Table 2.10: Data required for conducting an efficient LCC estimation at the early design phases	51
Table 2.11: Concluded “Early Architecture Design Quality Guidelines” for optimizing design quality in early architecture design phases.	52
Table 3.1: Overview of the most popular BIM software available in the AEC practice [3]	63
Table 3.2: The five task categories for BIM software functions in the AEC process [101]	64
Table 3.3: BIM functions/capabilities within the AEC practice [89].....	64
Table 3.4: BIM benefits to the AEC process [103] [3]	66
Table 3.5: BIM utilization challenges in the Early Architecture Design phases.....	73
Table 3.6: Examples for BIM-based (basic and interactive) design support tools for early architecture design optimization	80
Table 3.7: BPS software characteristics and comparison [139].....	82
Table 3.8: Model checking concepts in BMC software [141].....	85
Table 3.9: BMC software and their functions [140].....	86
Table 3.10: BIM strategies, tools and hierarchy of contribution early architecture design quality optimization	87
Table 4.1: Early architecture design quality optimization categories and their characteristics.....	92
Table 4.2: Space design qualitative and quantitative quality indicators for early architecture design quality optimization	96
Table 4.3: Circulation qualitative and quantitative quality indicators for early architecture design quality optimization	99
Table 4.4: Energy quantitative and qualitative quality indicators for early architecture design quality optimization	101
Table 4.5: BIM tools utilized in spatial design optimization at the early design phases classified according to the strategy and hierarchy as listed before in table 3.10 ..	110
Table 4.6: Role of BIM in optimizing space design quality in the early design phases based on quantitative values	112
Table 4.7: BIM tools utilized in circulation design optimization at the early design phases classified according to the strategy and hierarchy as listed before in table 3.10 ..	118

Table 4.8: Role of BIM in optimizing circulation design quality in the early design phases based on quantitative values	119
Table 4.9: Role of BIM in optimizing Energy design quality in the early design phases based on quantitative values	129
Table 4.10: List of LCC estimation data required at the early design phases and can be derived from BIM	133
Table 4.11: Role of BIM in facing the challenges of LCC estimation in early design phases	134
Table 4.12: Generated framework for “Early Architecture Design Quality Optimization using BIM”	135
Table 4.13: Percentages of contribution of BIM (based on hierarchy and strategy) to each design category as concluded from the initial framework	141
Table 5.1: First survey population of architecture design professors in greater Cairo.	144
Table 5.2: Second survey’s list of most popular Architecture firms/offices in Cairo that utilize BIM in architecture design.....	145
Table 5.3: First survey targeted sample and actual respondents	145
Table 5.4: Second survey targeted sample and actual respondents.....	146
Table 5.5: weights assigned to the framework based on the survey’s responses percentages.....	150
Table 5.6: weights concluded from survey to validate the generated framework.....	162
Table 6.1: Impact factors of BIM contribution to the 4 design categories of the “Early Architecture Quality Guidelines” through each of the 7 classified tools of contribution.....	166
Table 6.2: Calculated impact factors for BIM contribution to each design categories in general and in early architecture design optimization	166