IMPACT OF OVERLOADING ON OPERATIONAL PAVEMENT LIFE IN FLEXIBLE PAVEMENT

By

Eng. Amr Muhammad Mahmoud Fathy

A Thesis Submitted to the Faculty of Engineering at Cairo University in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of

MASTER OF SCIENCE

In

CIVIL ENGINEERING - PUBLIC WORKS

Acknowledgments

At the beginning, The author thank Allah Almighty for the many blessings and strengthen me to complete this research.

The author is deeply grateful to Prof. Dr. Laila Salah-El Din Radwan, (Prof. of highways, airports and traffic engineering, Cairo University), for her support, for her kind guidance, continuous encouragement, supervision of this study, her valuable suggestions, freely given during the work, and assistance throughout this thesis. Her devotion to the academic work was my inspiration to always thrive to the best.

Table of Contents

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	I
TABLE OF CONTENTS	II
LIST OF TABLES	V
LIST OF FIGURES	VI
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	IX
ABSTRACT	X
Chapter 1: INTRODUCTION	1
1.1. General	1
1.2. Problem statement	1
1.3.Research objectives	2
1.4. Research methodology and tasks	
Chapter 2: LITERATURE REVIEW	3
2.1. General	2
2.1.1 Overloading effect on roads	
2.1.2 Allowable axle loads around the world	
2.2. The 1993 AASHTO Guide	
2.2.1. AASHO Road Test and Early Versions of the Guide	
2.2.2. Current Design Equation.	
2.2.3. Input Variables	
2.2.4. Reliability	
2.2.5. Additional Considerations.	15
2.3. Overloading Reference in Egypt	16
2.3.1. Transportation system in Egypt	16
2.3.2. Installation of weighbridges	17
2.3.3. Impact of vehicle overloading	17
2.3.4. Overloading control management	18
2.4. Previous studies about Overloading Freight Transportation	19
2.4.1. Indonesia Overloading Freight Transportation	19
2.4.1.1.General	
2.4.1.2. Damage factor (DF) and deficit design life (DDL)	21
2.4.1.3. Damage factor cost (DFC) and deficit design life cost(DDLC)	24
2.4.1.4. Conclusion.	
2.4.2. South Africa overloading Freight Transportation	
2.4.2.1. General	
2.4.2.2. The Road Network	
2.4.2.3. Road Deterioration Factors	
2.4.2.4. Limiting Road Deterioration.	31
2.4.2.5. Axle Load Regulations	31
2.4.2.6. The Effects of Axle Loads	
2.4.2.7. The Effects of Tyle Flessure off Roads	33

2.4.2.8. South African Heavy Vehicle Overloading Statistics	
•	
Chapter 3: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	36
3.1. Selection of Roads	36
3.2. Cases of Load Application	
3.3. Scope of work	
3.3.1. Traffic data	
3.3.2. Pavement chacteristics data for both roads	
3.4. Calculating design life from W18	
3.5. Research limitations	38
Chapter 4: RESULTS AND ANALYSIS	39
4.1. CAIRO-SUEZ ROAD.	39
4.1.1. Impact of increasing excess load on pavement life	39
4.1.1.1. Annual growth rate (r) = 1 %	
4.1.1.2. Annual growth rate (r) = 2 %	
4.1.1.3. Annual growth rate (r) = 3 %	
4.1.1.4. Annual growth rate (r) = 4 %	
4.1.1.5. Annual growth rate (r) = 5 %	
4.1.1.6. Annual growth rate $(r) = 6\%$	
4.1.1.7. Annual growth rate (r) = 7 %	
4.1.1.8. Annual growth rate (r) = 8 %	
4.1.1.9. Annual growth rate (r) = 9 %	
4.1.1.10. Annual growth rate (r) = 10% .	
4.1.2. Impact of increasing annual growth rate on pavement life	
4.1.2.1. Excess load = 1 ton	
4.1.2.2. Excess load = 2 tolls 4.1.2.3. Excess load = 3 tons	
4.1.2.4. Excess load = 4 tons	
4.1.2.5. Excess load = 5 tons	
4.1.2.6. Excess load = 6 tons	
4.1.2.7. Excess load = 7 tons	
4.1.2.8. Excess load = 8 tons	53
4.1.2.9. Excess load = 9 tons	
4.1.2.10. Excess load = 10 tons	
4.2. ZAGAZIG-BILBIS ROAD	55
4.2.1. Impact of increasing excess load on pavement life	55
4.2.1.1. Annual growth rate (r) = 1 %	
4.2.1.2. Annual growth rate $(r) = 2 \%$	
4.2.1.3. Annual growth rate (r) = 3 %	58
4.2.1.4. Annual growth rate (r) = 4 %	
4.2.1.5. Annual growth rate (r) = 5 %	60
4.2.1.6. Annual growth rate $(r) = 6 \%$	
4.2.1.7. Annual growth rate $(r) = 7 \%$	
4.2.1.8. Annual growth rate $(r) = 8 \%$	
4.2.1.9. Annual growth rate $(r) = 9 \%$	
4.2.1.10. Annual growth rate (r) = 10%	
4.2.2. Impact of increasing annual growth rate on pavement life	
4.2.2.1. Excess load = 1 ton	66
/1///HVCOSSIO90 = /tons	hh

4.2.2.3. Excess load = 3 tons	67
4.2.2.4. Excess load = 4 tons	68
4.2.2.5. Excess load = 5 tons	68
4.2.2.6. Excess load = 6 tons	69
4.2.2.7. Excess load = 7 tons	
4.2.2.8. Excess load = 8 tons	
4.2.2.9. Excess load = 9 tons	
4.2.2.10. Excess load = 10 tons	
4.3. Essential comparisons between Cairo-Suez road and Z	Zagazig-Bilbis
road	72
4.3.1. Operational life comparison between Cairo-Suez road and	Zagazig-Bilbis
road at $r = 4\%$	
4.3.1.1. Overloading on 2-axles trucks only	73
4.3.1.2. Overloading on 3-axles trucks only	
4.3.1.3. Overloading on 4-axles trucks only	
4.3.1.4. Overloading on 5-axles trucks only	
4.3.1.5. Overloading on 6-axles trucks only	75
4.3.1.6. Overloading on all trucks	75
4.3.2. Relation between type of overloaded truck and pavement	operational life
at 10 tons excess load at $r = 4\%$	
4.4. Comparison between income from overloading fines due t	
on 2-axles trucks and operational pavement life cost at $r = 4$	
4.4.1. Cairo-Suez road	
4.4.2. Zagazig-Bilbis road	
4.4.2. Zagazig-Diibis ibad	//
Chapter 5: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	79
5.1. Conclusions	79
5.2. Recommendations.	
5.2. 1000mmondurono	
REFERENCES	81

List of Tables

Table 2.1: Recommended values for regional factor R (AASHTO, 1972)	7
Table 2.2: Ranges of structural layer coefficients (AASHTO, 1972)	7
Table 2.3: Recommended drainage coefficients for unbound bases and	subbases in
flexible pavements (Huang, 1993)	13
Table 2.4: Suggested levels of reliability for various highway classes	
1993)	
Table 2.5: ZR values for various levels of reliability (Huang, 1993)	14
Table 2.6: Traffic of operating freight vehicle	
Table 2.7: Comparison of wood transporting vehicle to non-wood	transporting
vehicle	
Table 2.8: Number of heavy vehicle by axle type	20
Table 2.9: MAL of operating heavy vehicle (wood truck)	21
Table 2.10: Scenario and cost of road maintenance in normal traffic condit	ion21
Table 2.11: The excess of overloading and damage factor	22
Table 2.12: Normal ESAL for operating truck vehicle	23
Table 2.13: ESAL for overloading truck vehicle (Sikijang Mati - Sp.	Largo road
section)	23
Table 2.14: ESAL for overloading truck vehicle (Sp. Largo – Sorek road se	ection)23
Table 2.15: ESAL for overloading truck vehicle (Sorek – Sp. Japura road s	
Table 2.16: Total normal ESAL (Sikijang Mati – Sp. Largo road section)	25
Table 2.17: Total normal ESAL (Sp. Largo – Sorek road section)	25
Table 2.18: Total normal ESAL (Sorek – Sp. Japura road section)	25
Table 2.19: Damage factor cost (DFC) by vehicle axle type	25
Table 2.20: Improvement cost resulted from overloading	27
Table 2.21: Loss cost resulted from service lifetime decrease	27
Table 2.22 : Deficit design life cost (DDLC)	
Table 2.23: Deficit design lifetime cost (DDLC) by vehicle axle type	
Table 2.24: Structural distress improvement cost the overload car user bear	
Table 2.25: Axle load and length regulations for various countries	32
Table 4.1: Comparison between Income from overloading fines due to ex	
2-axles trucks and operational pavement life cost at $r = 4\%$ or	n Cairo Suez
road	
Table 4.2: Comparison between Income from overloading fines due to ex	
2-axles trucks and operational pavement life cost at $r = 4\%$	~ ~
Bilbis road.	78

List of Figures

Figure 2.1 : Examples of overloading effect on roads
Figure 2.2 : Allowable axle loads in some countries
Figure 2.3 : General procedure for computing thickness9
Figure 2.4 : Chart for estimating layer coefficient for asphalt concrete based on elastic
modulus (AASHTO, 1993)12
Figure 2.5: Transportation system in Egypt
Figure 2.6: Impact of vehicle overloading on pavement damage factor (WB study)17
Figure 2.7: Impact of vehicle overloading on pavement expected life time (JICA
study)
Figure 2.8: Analysis of road distress betterment cost due to overloading heavy
vehicle
Figure 2.9: Improvement scenario of road distress resulted from design lifetime
decrease
Figure 3.1 : Flow chart representing the different cases of loading in the research36
Figure 4.1: Relation between additional loads on various types of trucks and pavement
• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •
operational life for flexible pavement for CAIRO-SUEZ road at R=1%39
Figure 4.2: Relation between additional loads on various types of trucks and pavement
operational life for flexible pavement for CAIRO-SUEZ road at R=2%40
Figure 4.3: Relation between additional loads on various types of trucks and pavement
operational life for flexible pavement for CAIRO-SUEZ road at R=3%41
Figure 4.4: Relation between additional loads on various types of trucks and pavement
operational life for flexible pavement for CAIRO-SUEZ road at R=4%42
Figure 4.5: Relation between additional loads on various types of trucks and pavement
operational life for flexible pavement for CAIRO-SUEZ road at R=5%43
Figure 4.6: Relation between additional loads on various types of trucks and pavement
operational life for flexible pavement for CAIRO-SUEZ road at R=6%44
Figure 4.7: Relation between additional loads on various types of trucks and pavement
operational life for flexible pavement for CAIRO-SUEZ road at R=7%45
Figure 4.8: Relation between additional loads on various types of trucks and pavement
operational life for flexible pavement for CAIRO-SUEZ road at R=8%46
Figure 4.9: Relation between additional loads on various types of trucks and pavement
operational life for flexible pavement for CAIRO-SUEZ road at R=9%47
Figure 4.10: Relation between additional loads on various types of trucks and
pavement operational life for flexible pavement for CAIRO-SUEZ road at
R=10%48
Figure 4.11: Relation between annual growth rate and pavement operational life for
flexible pavement for CAIRO-SUEZ road at 1 ton additional load on
various types of trucks
Figure 4.12: Relation between annual growth rate and pavement operational life for
flexible pavement for CAIRO-SUEZ road at 2 tons additional load on
various types of trucks50
Figure 4.13: Relation between annual growth rate and pavement operational life for
flexible pavement for CAIRO-SUEZ road at 3 tons additional load on
various types of trucks
Figure 4.14: Relation between annual growth rate and pavement operational life for
flexible pavement for CAIRO-SUEZ road at 4 tons additional load on
various types of trucks
Jr

Figure 4.15: Relation between annual growth rate and pavement operational life for
flexible pavement for CAIRO-SUEZ road at 5 tons additional load on
various types of trucks52
Figure 4.16: Relation between annual growth rate and pavement operational life for
flexible pavement for CAIRO-SUEZ road at 6 tons additional load on
various types of trucks52
Figure 4.17: Relation between annual growth rate and pavement operational life for
flexible pavement for CAIRO-SUEZ road at 7 tons additional load on
various types of trucks
Figure 4.18 : Relation between annual growth rate and pavement operational life for
flexible pavement for CAIRO-SUEZ road at 8 tons additional load on
various types of trucks
Figure 4.19: Relation between annual growth rate and pavement operational life for
flexible pavement for CAIRO-SUEZ road at 9 tons additional load on
various types of trucks54
Figure 4.20: Relation between annual growth rate and pavement operational life for
flexible pavement for CAIRO-SUEZ road at 10 tons additional load on
various types of trucks55
Figure 4.21: Relation between additional loads on various types of trucks and
pavement operational life for flexible pavement for ZAGAZIG-BILBIS
road at R=1%56
Figure 4.22: Relation between additional loads on various types of trucks and
pavement operational life for flexible pavement for ZAGAZIG-BILBIS
road at R=2%
Figure 4.23: Relation between additional loads on various types of trucks and
pavement operational life for flexible pavement for ZAGAZIG-BILBIS
•
road at R=3%
Figure 4.24: Relation between additional loads on various types of trucks and
pavement operational life for flexible pavement for ZAGAZIG-BILBIS
road at R=4%59
Figure 4.25: Relation between additional loads on various types of trucks and
pavement operational life for flexible pavement for ZAGAZIG-BILBIS
road at R=5%60
Figure 4.26: Relation between additional loads on various types of trucks and
pavement operational life for flexible pavement for ZAGAZIG-BILBIS
road at R=6%61
Figure 4.27: Relation between additional loads on various types of trucks and
pavement operational life for flexible pavement for ZAGAZIG-BILBIS
road at R=7%62
Figure 4.28: Relation between additional loads on various types of trucks and
pavement operational life for flexible pavement for ZAGAZIG-BILBIS
road at R=8%
Figure 4.29: Relation between additional loads on various types of trucks and
pavement operational life for flexible pavement for ZAGAZIG-BILBIS
road at R=9%
Figure 4.30: Relation between additional loads on various types of trucks and
pavement operational life for flexible pavement for ZAGAZIG-BILBIS
road at R=10%65

List of Abbreviations

AASHTO American Association of State Highway Transportation Officials CBR California Bearing Ratio
GARBLT General Authority of Roads, Bridges and Land Transport
WB World Bank
JICA Japan International Cooperation Agency

Abstract

The main objective that motivated this study is to assess the impact of overloading on operational pavement life in flexible pavement. This research includes two roads, Cairo Suez road with weighbridge and Zagazig Bilbis road without weighbridge. There are three objectives required to achieve the main object. First, calculating the reduction in the pavement operational life due to trucks overloading under various cases of loading, truck type and annual growth rate. Second, operational life comparison between Cairo Suez road with weighbridge and Zagazig Bilbis road without weighbridge. Third, comparison between income from overloading fines according to GARBLT method due to excess load and reduction in operational pavement life cost.

The AASHTO method is applied to calculate the reduction in the pavement operational life on the two roads under various cases of loading, truck type and annual growth rate. The results for the two roads have been analyzed and operational life comparisons between the two roads have been held. Also, comparisons between expected income from overloading fines according to GARBLT method due to excess load and reduction in operational pavement life cost have been held.

Conclusions can be summarized in the following:

- 1. Traffic composition is the most effective element in the reduction of pavement life due to overloading which Egyptian traditional method only co-relates with the excess load without knowing the other elements of roads.
- 2. The impact of overloading of 2 axles trucks will be almost equal or less than overloading all trucks types.
- 3. In case of overloading on 2 axles trucks by max. available load 10 tons the reduction in operational lifetime will be from 5 to 9 years at various values of annual growth rate.
- 4. The Egyptian overload fine pricing method does not represent the real impact of overloading on the operational pavement life on roads.
- 5. Cairo Suez road with weighbridges and Zagazig Bilbis road without weighbridges have similar behavior under different overloading conditions which mean that both roads must have weighbridges.
- 6. Income from overloading fines due to excess load according to GARBLT method covers the cost of additional asphalt layer due to overloading and maintenance required along road pavement life.

The following recommendations can be derived based on the study as follows:

- 1. A new study must be conducted for the relation between overloading and material properties and climate conditions.
- 2. Economic study should be conducted to compare between the Egyptian overload fine pricing method and AASHTO design method.
- 3. Many alternatives must be achieved by other researches to knowing the impact of axle truck percentage on pavement design life.
- 4. New truck roads should be added to Egyptian road network which can allow maximum overloading and accident decreasing.

Chapter 1: Introduction

1.1. General

Roads and streets are the most important transport communication medium in the country and are used by almost everyone on a daily basis. Besides the fact that roads are provided for the benefit of the road user, they also play a significant role in promoting economic growth and the living standards of the population. By means of roads, people have access to markets, places of work, clinics and hospitals, educational institutions, places for sport and leisure activities and vacations. The structural design of roads is a very important issue. A 20-year pavement life represents the total anticipated load applications the pavement will be subjected to over a 20-year period. For the purpose of thickness design, the total number of load applications is the defining parameter. Trucks are considered the most determining type of vehicles in the structural design of roads. Overloading in Egypt not only causes considerable damage to the road network, but also contributes to serious road safety problems. Furthermore, heavy vehicle operators that do not overload are placed at a disadvantage, as they cannot compete fairly with unscrupulous operators that follow a policy of deliberate overloading. A fine must be imposed against overloading trucks but the Egyptian overload fine pricing method used by GARBLT does not represent the real effect of overloading on the operational lifetime of road.

The Egyptian payment method based on experience of specialists in this domain regarding the resulted performance concerning the defects occurs at the road. In the past, there was no easy way to analyze the reduction in the operational lifetime that may occur, but now using computer programs, the proposed pricing method became easier to be implemented.

This study aims to evaluating the effect of overloading on pavement operational lifetime.

1.2. Problem Statement

The absence of evaluation of the impact of overloading on the operational pavement life of road, and whether the Egyptian pricing method represents the impact of overloading on the operational pavement life of road. Egyptian roads network is very huge on which safety some roads have weighbridges and some others with similar conditions not.

The effect of overloading extends to include reduction in the operational pavement life and the result is very big losses in the budget of the road owners represented in the government. The traditional payment method based on experience of specialists in this domain regarding the resulted performance concerning the defects occurs at the road.

1.3. Research Objectives

Calculating the reduction in the pavement operational life due to trucks overloading under various cases of loading, truck type and annual growth rate, consequently holding operational life comparison between Cairo Suez road with weighbridge and Zagazig Bilbis road without weighbridge and comparison between Income from overloading fines due to excess load and reduction in operational pavement life cost.

1.4. Research Methodology and Tasks

To achieve these objectives the following steps have been performed:

- 1- Traffic data and road pavement characteristics for Cairo-Suez road with weighbridges and Zagazig-Bilbis road without weighbridges has been used to calculate number of ESALs application over design period.
- 2- Ten annual growth rate values have been assumed.
- 3- For each annual growth rate value, ten values have been assumed for the excess load which are from 1 ton to 10 tons.
- 4- For each value of excess load, six cases of the excess load application are assumed.
 - First case: the excess load is applied on 2-axles trucks only.
 - Second case: the excess load is applied on 3-axles trucks only.
 - Third case: the excess load is applied on 4-axles trucks only.
 - Fourth case: the excess load is applied on 5-axles trucks only.
 - Fifth case: the excess load is applied on 6-axles trucks only.
 - Sixth case: the excess load is applied on all types of trucks.
- 5- Operational pavement life is calculated under the previous conditions.

Chapter 2 : Literature Review

2.1. General

Trucks are considered the most determining type of vehicles in the structural design of roads. The concerning authorities in many countries including Egypt attempt to control overloading. Overloading in Egypt not only causes considerable damage to the road network, but also contributes to serious road safety problems.

2.1.1 Overloading effect on roads

Overloading has harmful effect on road pavement. It can causes some pavement distresses such as rutting, shoaving, corrugation, depression, cracks, and etc. Figure 2.1 shows some examples of overloading effect on roads.



Figure 2.1 : Examples of overloading effect on roads (3)

2.1.2 Allowable axle loads around the world

Concerning authorities in most countries have put limits of axle load to reduce overloading harmful effect on road network. Figure 2.2 shows allowable axle loads in some countries including Egypt, USA, and some Asian and European countries.

Tandem load					Single load (4 tires)		
المزدوج (الترادفي)					الحمل المفرد (؛ عجلة)		
						United Nations*	
						الأمم المتحدة	8
						14.5	
						United States	
						الولايات المتحدة	9.1
						15.5	
	Japan	Switzerland	Germany	United Kingdom	Sweden	Netherland	
	اليابان	سويسرا	ألمانيا	المملكة المتحدة	السويد	هولندا	10
	_	14	16	20	16	18	
						Italy	
						إيطاليا	12
						19	
Espane	France	Belgium	ESCWA members	Yemen	Jordon	Egypt	
أسباتيا	فرنسا	بلجيكا	اتفاقية الأسكوا	اليمن	المملكة الأردنية الهاشمية	مصر	13
14.7	21	20	20	21	20	20	

Figure 2.2 : Allowable axle loads in some countries (3)

2.2. The 1993 AASHTO Guide

The 1993 AASHTO Guide is the latest version of the AASHTO Interim Pavement Design Guide, originally released in 1961. The evolution of the AASHTO Guide is outlined, followed by a description of the current design equation and input variables. At the end of this section, a summary of recent evaluation studies of the AASHTO guide is also presented.

2.2.1 AASHO Road Test and Early Versions of the Guide

After two successful road projects, the Road Test One-MD and the WASHO Road Test (Western Association of State Highway Officials), in 1955 the Highway Research Board (HRB) approved the construction of a new test track project located in Ottawa, Illinois. This test facility was opened to traffic in 1958. Traffic operated on the pavement sections until November, 1960, and a little more than 1 million axle loads were applied to the pavement and bridges. (HRB, 1961) The main objective of the AASHO Road Test was to determine the relation between the number of repetitions of specified axle loads (different magnitudes and arrangements) and the performance of different flexible and rigid pavement structures.

The test track consisted of 6 loops, each with a segment of four-lane divided highway (two lanes per direction) whose parallel roadways were connected with a turnaround at both ends. Five loops were trafficked and loop 1 received no traffic during the entire experiment. Test sections were located only on tangents separated by short transition lengths. The inner and outer lanes had identical pavement sections. Each lane had its own