



Cairo University

SYMPATHETIC TRIPPING IN DISTRIBUTION NETWORKS, CAUSES, ANALYSIS, AND SOLUTION

By

Hossam El-din Mohamed Ali Sabra

A thesis submitted to the
Faculty of Engineering at Cairo University
In Partial Fulfillment of the
Requirements for the Degree of
MASTER OF SCIENCE

In

Electrical Power and Machines Engineering

FACULTY OF ENGINEERING, CAIRO UNIVERSITY

GIZA, EGYPT

2017

**SYMPATHETIC TRIPPING IN
DISTRIBUTION NETWORKS, CAUSES,
ANALYSIS, AND SOLUTION**

By

Hossam El-din Mohamed Ali Sabra

A thesis submitted to the
Faculty of Engineering at Cairo University
In Partial Fulfillment of the
Requirements for the Degree of
MASTER OF SCIENCE

In

Electrical Power and Machines Engineering

Under supervision of

**Prof. Dr. Mahmoud Ibrahim
Gilany**
Electrical Power and Machines
Department
Faculty of Engineering,
Cairo University

Prof. Dr. Doaa Khalil Ibrahim
Electrical Power and Machines
Department
Faculty of Engineering,
Cairo University

**FACULTY OF ENGINEERING, CAIRO UNIVERSITY
GIZA, EGYPT**

2017

**SYMPATHETIC TRIPPING IN
DISTRIBUTION NETWORKS, CAUSES,
ANALYSIS, AND SOLUTION**

By

Hossam El-din Mohamed Ali Sabra

A thesis submitted to the
Faculty of Engineering at Cairo University
In Partial Fulfillment of the
Requirements for the Degree of
MASTER OF SCIENCE

In

Electrical Power and Machines Engineering

Approved by the

Examining Committee:

Prof. Dr. Mahmoud Ibrahim Gilany	Thesis advisor	main
Prof. Dr. Doaa Khalil Ibrahim	(Member)	
Prof. Dr. Ahdab Mohamed Kamel El-Morshedy	Internal Examiner	
Dr. Bahaa El-din Hassan Ibrahim Soudy	External Examiner	

**FACULTY OF ENGINEERING, CAIRO UNIVERSITY
GIZA, EGYPT**

2017

Engineer: Hossam El-din Mohamed Ali Sabra
Date of Birth: 23 / 07 / 1987
Nationality: Egyptian
E-mail: sabra.hosam@yahoo.com
Phone. : +201007959203
Address: Fysal – Giza – Egypt
Registration Date: 01 / 10 / 2014
Awarding Date: / /
Degree: Master of Science
Department: Electrical Power and Machines Engineering
Supervisors: Prof. Dr. Mahmoud Ibrahim Gilany
Prof. Dr. Doaa Khalil Ibrahim
Examiners: Prof. Dr. Mahmoud Ibrahim Gilany
Prof. Dr. Doaa Khalil Ibrahim
Prof. Dr. Ahdab Mohamed Kamel El-Morshedy
Dr. Bahaa El-din Hassan Ibrahim Soudy



Title of Thesis:

Sympathetic Tripping in Distribution Networks, Causes, Analysis and Solution

Key Words:

Network Protection, Custom Logic Scheme, Distribution Networks, Earth Faults, False Trip, Sympathetic Trip.

Summary:

In this thesis, problems that affecting the proper operation of the earth fault protection elements in distribution network are reported. One of these problems is the unnecessary sympathetic tripping phenomena to the healthy feeders during or after fault occurrence on an adjacent feeder. A relay-based solution is proposed and implemented for MV distribution network to overcome the sympathetic tripping phenomena. Two proposed custom logic schemes are applied, one for outgoing relays and another one for incomer-relay. The proposed solution is based on extensive analysing of actual recorded cases of sympathetic tripping phenomena that are reported from a 22 kV real distribution network located in Giza, Egypt.

The proposed custom logic scheme is extensively examined on the simulated network using ATP Program. Symmetrical and unsymmetrical faults are simulated to present different types of the sympathetic tripping phenomena. The proposed scheme is modelled using MODELS language in ATP to evaluate its capability to overcome the false tripping. The final results demonstrate the suitability of the proposed solution in avoiding the unnecessary false sympathetic tripping of both incoming and outgoing feeders on distribution systems.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

First of all, thanks to Allah who supported and strengthened me in all of my life and in completing my studies for the Master of Science (M.Sc.) degree.

I would like deeply to express my thanks and gratitude to my supervisors; Prof. Dr. Mahmoud Gilany and Prof. Dr. Doaa Khalil Ibrahim, Electrical Power and Machines Department, Faculty of Engineering, Cairo University for their faithful supervision, enormous efforts, and their great patience during the period of the research.

Finally, I would like to thank my family for their great inspiration, kind support, and continuous encouragement.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	iv
TABLE OF CONTENTS	v
LIST OF TABLES	ix
LIST OF FIGURES	x
LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS	xv
ABSTRACT	xviii

CHAPTER (1): INTRODUCTION	1
1.1. Medium Voltage Distribution Networks	1
1.2. Protection System in Distribution Network	2
1.2.1. Earth fault protection scheme of distribution panels and difficulties.....	3
1.3. Sympathetic Tripping in Distribution Networks	4
1.4. An overview of sympathetic trips causes	5
1.5. Problem Statement.....	7
1.6. Thesis Objectives.....	7
1.7. Thesis Organization.....	8

CHAPTER (2): LITERATURE REVIEW ON SYMPATHETIC TRIPPING IN DISTRIBUTION NETWORKS	9
Part-1: Description of Sympathetic Tripping Scenarios	9
2.1. Unnecessary Sympathetic Tripping Scenarios	10
2.1.1 Unnecessary trip of outgoing feeder as a result of unbalanced voltage sag condition	10
2.1.2. Unnecessary trip of outgoing feeder as a result of stall condition.....	12
2.1.3. Unnecessary trip of outgoing feeder as a result of capacitive discharge current.....	13
2.1.4. Unnecessary trip of incoming feeder as a result of voltage recovery starting current	14
2.1.5. Unnecessary trip of as a result of mutual coupling	15
2.1.6. Engaged tripping case.....	16
Part-2: Solutions of Sympathetic Tripping Phenomena as Reported in Literature.....	17
2.2. Solutions implemented by the Protection Sector.....	17
2.2.1. Solutions based on using simple overcurrent relays.....	17
2.2.1.1. By making the overcurrent protection less sensitive	18

2.2.1.2.	By reducing the clearing time of external faults	18
2.2.1.3.	By increasing the time delay of the earth fault element	18
2.2.1.4.	By applying additional protection logic for the feeders supplying significant induction motor loads	18
2.2.2.	Solutions based on using current and voltage signals	19
2.2.2.1.	Using of under voltage detector	19
2.2.2.2.	Using directional elements of negative sequence current detection	19
2.2.2.3.	Multi settings groups	20
2.2.3.	A Solution based on using IEC 61850 protocol-based smart distribution protection.....	21
2.3.	Solutions Implemented by Power Sector	21
2.3.1.	Solutions based on reducing the voltage sag	22
2.3.1.1.	Fault level reduction by using neutral grounding impedance	22
2.3.1.2.	Reducing voltage sag by decreasing the power system impedance	22
2.3.2.	Installing under voltage relay for motors contactors by customers	23
2.4.	Recommendations for Network Operation.....	23
2.4.1.	Reducing individual feeder currents as much as feasible.....	23
2.4.2.	Balancing each feeder load as much as possible to reduce pre-fault unbalance current	23

CHAPTER (3): SYMPATHETIC TRIPPING IN EGYPTIAN DISTRIBUTION NETWORK

24

3.1.	Introduction	24
3.2.	Typical Egyptian Distribution Network	24
3.3.	Typical Distributor Components	25
3.3.1.	Panel Components	25
3.3.1.1.	Incoming feeders	26
3.3.1.2.	Outgoing feeders	26
3.3.1.3.	Bus coupler and bus riser	26
3.3.1.4.	Potential and current transformers	26
3.3.1.5.	Protection and measurement devices	27
3.3.1.6.	Charger and batteries	27
3.3.2.	Protection setting adjustment.....	27
3.3.3.	Needs of Directional Relays	29
3.4.	Recorded Incoming and Outgoing Sympathetic Tripping Scenarios	30

Scenario No. 1: Unnecessary trip of outgoing feeder as a result of unbalanced voltage sag condition	31
Scenario No. 2: Unnecessary trip of outgoing feeder as a result of stall condition	33
Scenario No. 3: Unnecessary trip of outgoing feeder as a result of capacitive discharge current	34
Scenario No. 4: Unnecessary trip of incomer-feeders as a result of voltage recovery starting current condition	35
3.4.1. Other Practical Sympathetic Tripping Scenarios Not Covered by Published Research Studies	35
Scenario No. 5: Unnecessary trip for parallel incoming-feeders under normal condition	35
Scenario No. 6: Unnecessary trip of parallel incomer-feeders due to mutual coupling	37
Resonance between cable capacitance and loads inductance	38
3.5. Scenario No.7: Engaged Tripping	39

CHAPTER (4): SYSTEM MODELING USING ATP/EMTP PROGRAM

41

4.1. Introduction	41
Part-1: Modeling the Different Elements in the Network Under-Study	42
4.2. Modeling of the System Under-Study	42
4.2.1. Equivalent system modeling	43
4.2.2. Transformers modeling	43
4.2.3. Cables modeling	44
4.2.4. Mutual coupling modeling	45
4.2.5. Parallel incomer-feeders modeling	46
4.2.6. Loads modeling	47
Part-2: Evaluation of the Modeled Network Under-Study	49
4.3. Analysis and Modeling of Simulated Events	49
4.3.1. Applying real unsymmetrical fault on feeder No. (11), DP (1)	49
4.3.2. Unbalanced voltage sag condition on feeder No. (3), DP (2)	51
4.4. Evaluation of the Simulated Sympathetic Tripping Scenarios	52
4.5. Modeling of the Proposed Custom Logic Scheme	53
4.5.1. MODELS simulation language in ATP	54

CHAPTER (5): Proposed Custom Logic Scheme

56

Part-1: Description of the Proposed Custom Logic Scheme	57
5.1. Full Description of the Proposed Custom Logic Scheme	57

5.1.1.	For outgoing feeders	58
5.1.2.	For incoming feeders	59
Part-2: Evaluation of the Proposed Custom Logic Scheme.....		61
5.2.	Evaluation of the Proposed Custom Logic Scheme	61
5.2.1.	For unsymmetrical real fault case	61
5.2.1.1.	Examining a real unsymmetrical fault case	61
5.2.1.2.	Examining of voltage sag condition scenario	62
5.2.1.3.	Examining of stall condition scenario	63
5.2.1.4.	Examining of capacitive discharge current scenario	65
5.2.1.5.	Examining of unnecessary trip caused by voltage recovery starting current	66
5.2.1.6.	Examining of mutual coupling condition scenario	68
5.2.2.	For symmetrical real fault case	70
5.2.2.1.	Examining a real symmetrical fault case	70
5.2.2.2.	Examining of voltage sag condition scenario	71
5.2.2.3.	Examining of stall condition scenario	72
5.2.2.4.	Examining of capacitive discharge current scenario	73
5.2.2.5.	Examining of voltage recovery starting current scenario	74
5.2.2.6.	Examining of mutual coupling condition scenario	75
5.2.3.	Examining of circulating current during normal loading scenario	76
CHAPTER (6): CONCLUSIONS AND FUTURE WORK		79
6.1.	Conclusion	79
6.2.	Main Features of the Proposed Scheme	80
6.3.	Suggestions for Future Work.....	80
REFERENCES		81
PUBLISHED WORK		86

LIST OF TABLES

Table 3-1: Protection settings of outgoing feeders of substation transformer	28
Table 3-2: Protection settings of incoming feeders of the distribution panel	28
Table 3-3: Protection settings of outgoing feeders of the distribution panel	29
Table 4-1: Calculated values for transformers T1 and T2	44
Table 4-2: Cable parameters required for LCC model	45
Table 4-5: Cables resistivity required for LCC model	47
Table 4-6: Parameters of 100 HP induction motor using (UMIND) model	48

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1-1: General view of electrical power network including distribution system	1
Figure 1-2: Protection scheme of a typical distribution panel	3
Figure 1-3: Measuring the residual current using three CTs	4
Figure 1-4: Single line diagram for a part of typical MV distribution network.....	6
Figure 2-1: SLG fault has occurred in one of outgoing radials feeder (feeder No. 1)	11
Figure 2-2: Voltage sag caused by SLG fault on feeder No. 1	11
Figure 2-3: Sympathetic tripping case to feeders No. (1, 4) caused by group of single phase induction motors	13
Figure 2-4: Sympathetic tripping of feeders No. (1 and 2) as a result of capacitive discharge current caused by a ground fault on feeder No. (3)	14
Figure 2-5: Mutual coupling between three lines located in the same pole structure.....	16
Figure 2-6: Directional element of negative sequence current on radial feeders	20
Figure 2-7: GOOSE messages flow from each PIED and connections WAN between substations	21
Figure 2-8: Current limiting impedance connected to the secondary winding of 66/11 kV substation transformer	22
Figure 3-1: Single line diagram of Egyptian 22 kV distribution network in Cairo zone	25
Figure 3-2: Picture of typical distribution panel 22 kV	26
Figure 3-3: The operation of the directional relay for the parallel incoming feeders	30
Figure 3-4: A typical 22-kV electrical distribution system network	31

Figure 3-5: Fault recorders for DLG fault occurrence on feeder No. (11), DP (1)	32
Figure 3-6: Fault records for unbalanced voltage following a real fault on feeder No. (11), DP (1)	32
Figure 3-7: The resulted unbalanced currents in the healthy feeder No. (14), DP (1)	33
Figure 3-8: The unbalanced currents in healthy outgoing feeder No. (1), DP (2) as response to a real DLG fault on adjacent feeder No. (2), DP (2)	34
Figure 3-9: Unbalanced currents in healthy outgoing feeder No. (14), DP (1) as response to a real SLG fault on an adjacent feeder No. (12), DP (1)	35
Figure 3-10: Fault recorder for feeder No. (5) under zero sequence circulating current during normal loading	36
Figure 3-11: Fault recorders for a healthy feeder No. (5), DP (1) affected by mutual coupling current of a faulty feeder.....	38
Figure 3-12: Fault recorders for feeder No. (4), DP (1) for single line to ground fault created by the increased voltage due to fault on feeder No. (1), DP (1)	39
Figure 4-1: Single line diagram of a part of Egyptian distribution network.....	41
Figure 4-2: ATP-Draw model of the distribution network under study	42
Figure 4-3: Single core armored 22kV (XLPE) Stranded aluminum conductor.....	44
Figure 4-4: General view of the two incoming cables that are lying in the same trench.....	46
Figure 4-5: A-B-G fault current on outgoing feeder No. (11), DP (1)	50
Figure 4-6: Voltage sag on the two faulty phases (A and B) caused by A- B-G fault on feeder No. (11), DP (1)	50
Figure 4-7: Unbalanced 3-phases currents on the outgoing healthy feeder No. (3), DP (2)	51

Figure 4-8: Residual current on the outgoing healthy feeder No. (3), DP (2)	52
Figure 4-9: Comparison between real reported record and simulated case of unbalanced voltage sag scenario.....	53
Figure 4-10: ATP MODELS of proposed outgoing protection relay	55
Figure 4-11: ATP MODELS of proposed incoming protection relay	55
Figure 5-1: Single line diagram of typical 22 kV Egyptian distribution system.....	57
Figure 5-2: Schematic logic diagram for outgoing feeders (Scenarios 1, 2 and 3).....	58
Figure 5-3: Schematic logic diagram for incoming feeders (Scenarios 4, 5 and 6).....	60
Figure 5-4: Simulated data on the faulty feeder No. (11), DP (1) for double lines to ground fault	62
Figure 5-5: The response of the conventional and proposed relays to the real double lines to ground fault	62
Figure 5-6: Simulated data on the healthy feeder No. (3), DP (2) that is exposed to voltage sag condition	63
Figure 5-7: The response of the conventional and proposed relays to voltage sag condition on healthy feeder No. (3), DP (2)	63
Figure 5-8: Simulated data on the healthy feeder No. (1), DP (2) that is exposed to stall condition.....	64
Figure 5-9: The response of the conventional and proposed relays to stalled motors condition on healthy feeder No. (1), DP (2).....	64
Figure 5-10: Simulated data on the healthy feeder No. (12), DP (1) that is exposed to capacitive discharge current.....	66
Figure 5-11: The response of the conventional and proposed relays to capacitive discharge current on healthy feeder No. (12), DP (1)	66
Figure 5-12: Simulated data on the healthy feeder No. (1), DP (2) that is exposed to voltage recovery starting current condition	67

Figure 5-13: The response of the conventional and proposed relays to voltage recovery starting current condition on healthy feeder No. (5), DP (2)	68
Figure 5-14: Simulated data on the healthy feeder No. (6), DP (1) that is exposed to mutual coupling condition	69
Figure 5-15: The response of the conventional and proposed relays to mutual coupling condition on healthy feeder No. (6), DP (1)	69
Figure 5-16: 3-phases to ground fault on feeder No. (13), DP (1)	70
Figure 5-17: Voltage sag on the 3-phases caused by LLL-G fault on feeder No. (13), DP (1)	70
Figure 5-18: Simulated data on the faulty feeder No. (13), DP (1) for 3-L-G fault.....	71
Figure 5-19: The response of the conventional and proposed relays to the real double lines to ground fault	71
Figure 5-20: Simulated data on the healthy feeder No. (3), DP (2) that is exposed to voltage sag condition	72
Figure 5-21: The response of the conventional and proposed relays on healthy feeder No. (3), DP (2).....	72
Figure 5-22: Simulated data on the healthy feeder No. (1), DP (2).....	73
Figure 5-23: The response of the conventional and proposed relays on healthy feeder No. (1), DP (2).....	73
Figure 5-24: Simulated data on the healthy feeder No. (1), DP (2) that is exposed to voltage recovery starting current condition	74
Figure 5-25: The response of the conventional and proposed relays to voltage recovery starting current condition on healthy feeder No. (5), DP (2)	75
Figure 5-26: Simulated data on the healthy feeder No. (6), DP (1) that is exposed to mutual coupling condition	76

Figure 5-27: The response of the conventional and proposed relays to mutual coupling condition on healthy feeder No. (6), DP (1)	76
Figure 5-28: Simulated data on the healthy feeder No. (9), DP (1) that is exposed to circulating residual current during normal loading.....	77
Figure 5-29: The response of the conventional and proposed relays to circulating current during normal loading on healthy feeder No. (9), DP (1)	77