The Relationship between Nurse - Patient Ratio, Nursing Care Organization systems and the Hospital Ward Organizational Environment

A Thesis

Presented to the Faculty of Nursing,
Alexandria University,
In Partial Fulfillment of the
Requirements for the Degree

Of

Doctoral of Nursing Science

In

Nursing Administration

By

Yaldez Khairy Zakaria

2009

The Relationship between Nurse - Patient Ratio, Nursing Care Organization systems and the Hospital Ward Organizational Environment

Presented by

Yaldez Khairy Zakaria

For the Degree of

Doctoral of Nursing Science

In

Nursing Administration

 $\mathbf{B}\mathbf{y}$

Faculty of Nursing

Examiners' committee: Prof. Dr. Magda Elwy Nassar Professor of Nursing Administration Faculty of Nursing Alexandria University	Approved
Prof. Dr. Ahmed Maher Ramadan Professor of Community Medicine Faculty of Medicine Alexandria University	
Prof. Dr. Seham Ibrahim Hamouda Professor of Nursing Administration Faculty of Nursing Tanta University	
Prof. Dr. Aisha Mohamed Awad Professor of Nursing Administration Faculty of Nursing Helwan University	•••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••

Advisors' committee:	Approved
Prof. Dr. Magda Elwy Nassar Professor of Nursing Administration Faculty of Nursing Alexandria University	
Prof. Dr. Ahmed Maher Ramadan Professor of Community Medicine Faculty of Medicine Alexandria University	
Prof. Dr. Noura Ahmed Bassiouni Professor of Nursing Administration Faculty of Nursing Alexandria University	

العلاقة بين نسبة الممرضات للمرضى وطرق تنظيم الرعاية التمريضية و البيئة العلاقة بين نسبة المتنظيمية لأقسام المستشفى

رسالة علمية

مقدمة الى كلية التمريض - جامعة الاسكندرية استيفاء للدراسات المقررة للحصول على درجة

الدكتوراه في علوم التمريض

في

ادارة التمريض

مقدمة من

يلدز خيري زكريا

4 . . 9

العلاقة بين نسبة الممرضات للمرضى وطرق تنظيم الرعاية التمريضية و البيئة التنظيمية لأقسام المستشفى مقدمة من مقدمة من يلدز خيري زكريا

للحصول على درجة الدكتوراه في علوم التمريض في الدكتوراه في التمريض الدارة التمريض

موافقون	<u>لجنة المناقشة و الحكم على الرسالة:</u>
•••••	۱.د / ماجدة علوي نصار
	أستاذ إدارة التمريض
	كلية التمريض – جامعة الاسكندرية
	ا.د/ أحمد ماهر رمضان
	أستاذ طب المجتمع
	كلية الطب - جامعة الاسكندرية
	ا.د / سهام ابراهیم حمودة
	أستاذ إدارة التمريض
	كلية التمريض – جامعة طنطا
	ا.د / عائشة محمد عوض
	أستاذ إدارة التمريض
	كلية التمريض – جامعة حلوان

موافقون	<u>لجنة الاشراف:</u>
	ا.د / ماجدة علوي نصار
	أستاذ إدارة التمريض
	كلية التمريض - جامعة الاسكندرية
	ا.د/ أحمد ماهر رمضان
	أستاذ طب المجتمع
	كلية الطب - جامعة الاسكندرية
	ا.د / نورا أحمد بسيونى
	أستاذ إدارة التمريض
	كلية التمريض - جامعة الاسكندرية

ACKNOWLEGEMENT

Thanks for the help and support of **Allah** the most beneficial, the most merciful.

I would like to express my sincere thanks to **Prof. Dr. Soheir Mokabel** who inspired me and provided me with the precious knowledge during the development of the idea of this thesis.

I wish to express my deepest appreciation, my profound gratitude to **Prof. Dr. Magda Nassar** for her valuable advices, and encouragement throughout this thesis.

I was delighted to interact with **Prof. Dr. Ahmed Ramadan**. I want to express my appreciation for his continuous support, advice, guidance, and his meticulous review throughout the course of this study.

My deepest gratitude goes to **Prof. Dr. Noura Bassiouni** for her persistent support, direction and guidance throughout the study.

I am also grateful to **Prof. Dr. Hoda Ghareeb** for her valuable guidance regarding the statistical representation and consultation for this work.

I would like to thank my parents, my husband, my children, my family and my friends who have helped and inspired me during my doctoral study. I especially want to thank the four demonstrators from the Nursing Administration department, Faculty of Nursing who have carried out the observation with me.

LIST OF CONTENTS

Chapter	Page
Chapter I: Introduction	1
Chapter II: Review of Literature	4
Nursing shortage	4
Different staffing methodologies	5
i. The descriptive method	5
ii. Industrial Engineering	6
iii. Management Engineering	6
iv. The operations research	6
v. Top- Down methods	7
vi. Bottom- Up methods	9
 Nursing care organization system 	14
 Ward organizational environment 	17
Chapter III: Material and Methods	21
Chapter IV: Results	27
Chapter V: Discussion	60
Chapter VI: Conclusion and Recommendations	70
Chapter VII: Summary	71
Chapter VIII: References	74
Appendices	
Chapter IX: Arabic Summary	

LIST OF TABLES

	Table	Page
1.	Distribution of nurses working in medical and surgical wards according to their age, qualifications and years of experience.	28
2.	Distribution of medical and surgical wards according to the level of mean nurse to patient ratio.	29
3.	Comparison between medical and surgical wards in relation to the components of ward profile namely ward facilities, ward management and organization of work.	30
4.	The association between the percent scores of the components of ward profile and the level of mean nurse to patient ratio.	31
5.	Distribution of medical and surgical wards according to aspects of nursing care organizational systems.	33
6.	Distribution of medical and surgical wards according to scores of aspects of nursing care organizational systems.	36
7.	Distribution of aspects of nursing care organizational systems in relation to level of mean nurse to patient ratios.	38
8.	Correlation between scores of nursing care organizational systems and mean nurse to patient ratios.	41
9.	Comparison between medical and surgical wards in relation to percent score of nurses' perception toward the sub items of physical environment.	42
10.	Comparison between medical and surgical wards in relation to percent score of nurses' perception toward the sub items of professional nursing practice.	43
11.	Comparison between medical and surgical wards in relation to percent scores of nurses' perception toward ward leadership.	44
12.	Comparison between medical and surgical wards in relation to percent score of nurses' perception toward the sub items of professional relationships.	45
13.	Comparison between medical and surgical wards in relation to percent score of nurses' perception toward the sub items of influence over ward life.	46

	Table	Page
14.	Comparison between medical and surgical wards in relation to percent scores of nurses' perception toward job satisfaction.	47
15.	1 1	48
16.	The associations between the percent score of nurses' perceptions toward items of ward organizational feature scale and the level of mean nurse to patient ratios.	49
17.	Comparison between nurses in different age group in relation to the percent score of their perceptions toward the items of ward	51
18.	organizational feature scale. The percent score of the nurses' perceptions toward the items of ward organizational feature in relation to their qualifications.	53
19.	The percent score of the nurses' perceptions toward their ward organizational environment in relation to their years of experience.	55
20.	Correlations between WOFS sub items.	57
	Correlation coefficient values for the relationship between total	
21.	WOFS, its sub items; ward profile and its sub items; scores of aspects nursing care organization systems and the mean nurse to patient ratios.	59

I.INTRODUCTION

Nurses represent the primary caring system in hospitals 24 hrs a day. An adequate caring system provides enough nurses to observe patients directly so that they can recognize an impending or actual problem. These nurses are the first to mobilize an intervention that often requires the coordination of the activities of others including physicians, to save a patient's life. In spite of that, health care facilities have the potential to achieve large financial savings by reducing the number of nurses they employ. However, this may have negative consequences for staff, patient and the organization as a whole.

In hospitals, as well as in other health care settings, staffing is one of the most pressing challenges nurse managers face. The importance of viewing personnel as an expandable resource, addressed in an organization's strategic plan, is crucial to meet challenges faced in a rapidly changing health care environment. The current health care environment is limited in options for dealing with nurse staffing issues. As well as, the changes in the structure and composition of the nursing workforce as a result of hospital downsizing and restructuring in the 1990s have prompted concern in the nursing community regarding the quality of the nursing work environment.

Health care management research emphasizes understanding "The bigger pictures" with regard to staffing issues as example recruitment, retention and workforce planning. The American Nurses Association (ANA) has promoted the adoption of legislation that mandates hospitals to develop and implement nurse staffing plans. Also, various ratios have been recommended in the literature and through law and policy makers, there continues to be a lack of empirical evidence to support these recommendations, also no one has defined a method to establish "adequate" staffing, how to continuously provide it and what the appropriate staffing characteristics (ratios, skill mix, etc...) are. (12,13)

It's widely clear that when describing nurse staffing, the concept of a one-size fits all is not appropriate and many factors need to be considered including for example, factors related to the nursing units where care is delivered characteristics of staff providing the care (including the autonomous role and decision making role that the directed care the nurse assumes pertaining to staffing and workload decisions) and factors related to the organization. (14,15)

A growing concern by the adequacy on nurse staffing has led to an increased emphasis on research exploring the relationship between the staffing levels and patient outcomes. Also, between the staffing levels and nurses' outcomes including job satisfaction, job pressure, job threat burnout, work place injury and role tension. These researches were able to determine that there is a link between nurse staffing levels and the well-being of nurses.

Aiken et al (2002) studied the impact of nurse staffing levels on factors that influence nurse retention. They found that a more favorable nurse to patient ratios are associated with lower burnout and higher job satisfaction among registered nurse. (16)

Although these findings, it is difficult to generalize because nurse staffing levels depend on factors that can vary, including characteristics of the nurse and the patient and the work environment. (14,15,22) Curtin (2003) assured that ratios must be modified by the nurses' level of experience, the organizations' characteristics and the quality of interaction between the staff. Also, Aiken et al (2002) found that structural factors in hospitals, such as hospital and ward size, nurse staffing levels and the organization of work are thought to impact directly on patient outcomes. Suhonen et al (2007) found that the hospital characteristics, nurse staffing and care delivery model affect patient outcomes. Considering all these variables, the ward as a physical, social and organizational unit probably remains the most significant unit of analysis.

In addition to previously mentioned researches, in relation to nurses' staffing levels and its relationship with patient and nurses' outcomes. There are extensive researches that study the types of nursing care organization in the hospitals' wards. (24,29-42) Other studies were developed to identify the organizational features either at the hospital level or at the ward level. (15,24,43-47) Less attention has been paid to factors in the nursing work environment which may have direct effect on nurses' outcomes and consequently, influence patients' outcomes. These factors can be explored by examining the quality of work environment (e.g. the configuration of care delivery models, the quality of the coordination of care among the staff) in relation to outcomes experienced by the nurse. Nurses' outcomes have been associated with changes to nurse staffing, care delivery models and the quality of nursing work environments. Although the number of studies developed, there has been a lack of synthesis in nursing literature about the combined effects of number of staff and organizational systems in relation to the effectiveness at ward level. It remains important to examine the more immediate work unit –the ward- and that interactions between staffing, work organization and work environment at this level are important for care provision and outcomes. (9)

At the national level, studies developed discovered many variables independently. In relation to nurse staffing, Nassar (1978) studied models for staffing various in patient units at Alexandria Main University Hospital. Regarding the methods of organizing nursing care, a study developed to assess the impact of two different methods of nursing assignment and its relation to the quality of nursing care. Considering the work environment, Bassiouni (1988) studied the nurses' perceptions toward variable related to work environment. Abdel Aziz (1990) studied the relationship between time scheduling patterns and nurses' job satisfaction. El Sebaey (1996) examined the relationship between nurses' perception for decision making and propensity to leave. Abdou (2001) studied the nurses' burnout and their coping strategies.

In addition to, Dawood (2001) who conducted a research to identify predictors for nurses' turnover in private and governmental hospitals. (54)

There has been a lack of synthesis in nursing literature about the combined effects of number of staff and organizational systems in relation to effectiveness at ward level. In previous work, the impact of staffing resources and systems of ward nursing organization on care processes and outcomes have been considered separately. Yet, it remains important to examine the interactions between staffing, work organization and work environment at the ward level; because these interactions are important for care provision and outcomes.

Thus, the current study aims to examine the relationships between nurses' number represented as nurse to patient ratio, nursing care organization systems and nurses' perceptions of their environment. Findings from such a study will deal with the impact of numbers of staff on perceptions about standards of professional practice, working relationships, nurses' influence within the ward and their job satisfaction.

II. REVIEW OF LITERATURE

If management means to get work done through others, a primary managerial function is to staff, or assemble and ready those "others" who perform agency work. Each divisional nursing director and head nurse is responsible for developing an appropriate staffing plan for the nursing division or unit. (5,55) Staffing is the process of balancing the quantity of staff available with the quantity and mix of staff needed by the organization. (4) It also means assembling and readying the employees needed to fulfill the agency's mission.

Lack of appropriate staff is a key stumbling block to the provision of effective nursing care. When developing a staffing plan, many variables should be taken into consideration, including needs and numbers of the patient, acuity of patients, patient satisfaction, the care setting and its environment, competency and skill mix of the nursing staff, and availability of medical and support staff. (14,56)

Nursing Shortage:

Worldwide, healthcare settings face difficulties in recruitment and retention of nursing staff. This problem has two origins: the nursing shortage, and staff turnover. Nurses represent the largest group of healthcare professionals and the shortage of nursing personnel is having a direct impact on the health and work life of nurses and on patient safety. Restructuring of the health system, increasing workloads, cut-backs in staffing, financial pressures and increased demand for health services further exacerbate the effects of nursing human resources shortages. Also, nursing staff turnover is costly and it is one of the major issues facing any health care delivery system. (59)

The nursing shortage is a global phenomenon that is impacting health systems in most developed countries. In Victoria, Australia, several periods of nursing shortage over the last 40 years, with most lasting only a year or two. In the late 1980s, the public at large as well as clinicians and administrators grew concerned about what many calls a crisis in hospital care. Newspaper stories, and governmental, private and multidisciplinary professional groups devoted attention to the increasing burden of care on nurses in short-staffed hospitals. By the late 1990s, severe nursing shortages emerged, nurse management responded through further usage of often inexperienced agency nurses which placed even greater pressure on the remaining permanent nurses.

In 1999, additional time worked by nurses in the form of unpaid overtime and working through meal breaks. Work intensification led to incredible levels of stress amongst nurses. As a result, nurses suffered a serious decline in their ability to take pride from delivering high quality care to patients, leading many nurses to leave the profession "broken spirited and broken hearted". Between 2001 and 2003, there were the worst years of the nursing shortage and a time of poor job. A major reason for nurses' turnover and shortage is the perception of a lack of professional respect and recognition by hospital administrators, doctors and the broader community. Also, difficulty in implementing change, lack of influence or autonomy and instrumental communication have been identified as predictors of nurse turnover.

The current nursing shortage is occurring in an era of renewed concerns about quality of care. This offers unique opportunities for developing management, workforce and professional development policies to remedy problems with staffing and other longstanding workplace environment issues in hospital nursing. (63)

Different Staffing Methodologies:

To solve the shortage problems in Ireland, the situation is being mitigated by the introduction of large number of nurses from abroad, increased number of preregistration training places for nursing students, enhanced pay for specialist nurses and additional support for continuing education. A great deal of time, effort and resources have been invested in developing and refining methods of estimating the right number of nurses. In 1973, Aydelotte developed a review and critique for nurse staffing methodology, the author described the methodology to fall into four major classes which are descriptive, industrial engineering, managerial engineering, and operations research.

The descriptive method:

This methodology makes use of a number of data gathering devices about a large number of variables. The final decision about amount of staff resides in the subjective judgments of individuals who have had a background to experiences. The approach may use simple ratios, formulas, and suggested proportions between types of personnel. In the early days, these calculations were made on the basis of such statistical information as bed use, and lengths of stay, and took no account of local differences in workload or of variations in local practices which might affect workload. (65,67,68)

One example of the descriptive method is the simple steps that are entitled staffing by nursing care hours per patient day. That is each supervisor estimates the number of nursing personnel she believes necessary to do an adequate job at a specific census. Nursing hours per patient day are calculated and a daily basic staffing agreed upon. Staff is added or removed depending upon nursing care hours per day available. (66)