



AIN SHAMS UNIVERSITY
FACULTY OF ENGINEERING

EFFECT OF CHANGE ORDER ON THE CONSTRUCTION PROJECTS

By

MOHAMMED ELSAYED ABDEL-HAMID SALEH

B. Sc., Military Technical College 1991
M. Sc., Ain Shams University 1998

A Thesis

Submitted in partial fulfillment
for the requirements of the degree of
Ph. D. in Structural Engineering

Supervised By

Dr. Ibraheem Abdel –Rasheed

Prof. of Construction Project Management
Department of Structural Engineering
Faculty of Engineering-Ain Shams University

Dr. Mohammed Ahmed El-Mikawi

Associate Prof. of Construction Project Management
Department of Structural Engineering
Faculty of Engineering-Ain Shams University

Cairo
2012

STATEMENT

This dissertation is submitted to Ain Shams University in partial fulfillment for the requirements of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Structural Engineering.

The work included in this thesis was carried out by the author in the Structural Engineering Department, Ain Shams University.

No part of this thesis has been submitted for a degree or a qualification at any other University or Institution.

Date: / /2012

Name: Mohammed El Sayed Abdel-Hamid Saleh

Signature:



AIN SHAMS UNIVERSITY
FACULTY OF ENGINEERING
STRUCTURAL ENGINEERING DEPARTMENT

Abstract of the Ph.D. Thesis submitted by: Eng. Mohammed El-Sayed
Abdel-Hamid Saleh

Title: Effect of Change Order on the Construction

Projects

Supervisors:

Prof. Dr. Ibraheem Abdel –Rasheed Ass. Prof. Dr. Mohammed Ahmed El-
Mikawi

ABSTRACT

A Change Orders in the construction projects have a very serious problems and bad effects on the quality, time, and cost of the projects. The basic steps of this study were made questionnaire from (33) expertise in sports construction projects to rank the Change Order reasons list according to some factors such as impact on project cost and time, deviation from execution plan of the project, frequency of occurrence. Youth Sport Center Construction Project (YSCCP) in Egypt as example of sports construction industry have faced quit number of Change Orders leading to cost increasing and time extension. (9) Groups of youth sport center construction projects experienced (151) Change Orders. These groups of projects were utilized to contemplate different causes of Change

Orders, the frequency of their occurrence, the responsible of this Change Order, the cost of Change Orders, and the time extension attributed to these Change Orders. It was found that, there is a relationship between project cost and construction time within construction projects. This study tried to develop a time-cost relationship model to be valid on the Youth Sport Center construction project. The model was included Change Orders categories; Work disciplines (Civil work, Electrical work, Structural work, Architectural work) and Project parties (Owner, Consultant, Contractor, Local Authorities).

Keywords: Change Order, Construction, Impact, Cost, Time, Sports Facility

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The author would like to declare his genuine thanks and gratefulness to doctoral advisor, **Prof. Dr. Ibraheem Abdel –Rasheed** professor of Construction Project Management Ain Shams University, for his valuable guidance and assistance during the long course of this work.

The author is also very grateful to **Associate Prof. Dr. Mohammed Ahmed El-Mikawi** professor of Construction Project Management, Ain Shams University, for his inspiration, encouragement, excellent guidance and endless support through all phases of this research.

In Addition, special thanks and appreciation to my family for their never-ending love and support at all times.

I am also thankful to everyone, who made it easy for me.

Contents

LIST OF FIGURES	vi
LIST OF TABLES	xiv
Chapter (1).....	1
Introduction.....	1
1.1. General	1
1.2. Change Order Effect on Project and Parties.....	4
1.3. Change Order Definition.....	6
1.4. Change Order Causes	7
1.5. Problem Statement	9
1.6. Scope and limitations	10
1.7. Research objectives.....	10
1.8. Deliverables	11
Chapter (2).....	12
Literature Review	12
2.1. Introduction.....	12
2.2. Identification of Change Order.....	12
2.3. Causes of Change Orders.....	15
2.4. Causes of Change Orders Attributed to the Construction Project Parties.....	17
2.5. Predicting Change Orders.....	21
2.6. Change Order Compensation	21

2.7. The Effect of Change Order on Productivity.....	23
2.8. The Effect of Change Order on Cost and Time	24
2.9. Changes Order Always Cost More.....	26
2.10. Reduction No of Change Orders before Design	27
2.11. Reducing Change Orders During Construction.....	28
2.12. Industry Change Order Rates	30
2.13. Reducing Change Order Claims	31
2.14. Similar Studies	31
2.14.1. Effective Project Management.....	32
2.14.2. Cumulative Impacts of Change Orders.....	33
2.14.3. Circumventing Claims	33
2.14.4. Accuracy and Contingency	34
2.15. Summary.....	36
Chapter (3).....	39
Research Methodology and Data Base Collection	39
3.1. Introduction.....	39
3.2. Problem Statement	39
3.3. Scope of Research	40
3.4. Objectives of Research	40
3.5. Methodology	40
3.6. Back Ground Information on the Youth Sport Center Construction Project.	42

3.7. Contents of Youth Sport Center Construction Project	42
3.8. Development of the Change Order Data Base	43
3.8.1. Change Order Data Base Coding	44
3.8.2. Information Fields for the Change Order Database	45
Chapter (4).....	60
Identification of Main Reasons of Change Order during Construction Project life Cycle	60
4.1. Introduction	60
4.2. Change Order Identification and Classification.....	61
4.3. Expert Background	62
4.3.1. Company Ownership Types	62
4.3.2. Company Nationality	63
4.3.3. Company Representative Role	63
4.3.4. Respondent Designation.....	64
4.3.5. Respondent Experience of Experts	66
4.4. Causes of Change Orders	66
4.5. Measurement of the Change Order Parameters	73
4.5.1. Change Order Probability and Degree of its Cost Impact: ...	74
4.5.2. Data Analysis Method	74
4.5.3. Analysis of Results:.....	76
4.5.4 The Results of Statistical Analysis for Probability and Impact of Change Order in Youth Sport Center Construction Projects (YSCCP):.....	77

4.6. The Top Twenty Change Orders which have Great Impact on the Project.....	116
4.7. The Responsible for Great Change Order Impact	119
4.8 Validation of the Questionnaire Results using the YSCCP Data Collection.....	120
Chapter (5).....	123
Analysis and Discussion	123
5.1. General	123
5.2. Additives and Deductive Change Orders.....	123
5.5. The Relationships between Additive Change Order Variables.....	135
5.6. Reasons for Additive Change Orders.....	140
5.6.1 Additive Change Order due to Additional Work	145
5.6.2 Additive Change Orders Due to Design Revisions	150
5.6.3. Additive Change Order due to Differing Site Conditions.....	154
5.7. Additive Change Order Categorization Based on Work Disciplines ...	157
5.7.1. Additive Change Orders Attributed to Civil Work	160
5.7.2. Additive Change Orders Attributed to Structural Work.....	164
5.7.3. Additive Change Orders Attributed to Electrical Work	168
5.7.4. Additive Change Orders Attributed to Architectural Work.....	171
5.8. Additive Change Orders Attributed To Project Parties	175
5.8.1. Additive Change Orders Generated by the Owner	179
5.9. Empirical Model for Prediction of Construction Time.....	183
5.9.2. Change Orders Due to Different Reasons	189

5.9.3	Change Orders due to Different Work Disciplines	193
5.9.4	Change Orders due to Different Participating Parties.....	197
Chapter (6).....		200
Conclusion and Recommendation.....		200
6.1.	Conclusions.....	200
6.2.	Recommendations.....	206
REFERENCES		208
Appendix.....		212

LIST OF FIGURES

<u>FIGURE</u>		<u>PAGE</u>
Figure (1.1)	Difference between the Actual time and cost expended to complete the project and the estimated base time and cost-----	8
Figure (2.1)	Main Causes for Construction Project Change Order-----	24
Figure (2.2)	General Causes of Change Order Attributed to the Project Entities-----	25
Figure (4.1a)	Frequency histogram for the numbers of companies' ownership-	64
Figure (4.1b)	Percentage of frequency for the numbers of companies' ownership-----	64
Figure (4.2a)	Frequency histogram for the numbers of companies-----	64
Figure (4.2b)	Percentage of frequency for the numbers of companies' nationality-----	64
Figure (4.3a)	Frequency histogram for the numbers of companies' representative-----	65
Figure (4.3b)	Percentage of frequency for the numbers of companies' representative role-----	65
Figure (4.4a)	Frequency histogram for the numbers of respondent designation-----	66
Figure (4.4b)	Percentage of frequency for the numbers of respondent designation-----	66
Figure (4.5a)	Frequency histogram for the numbers of respondent experience	67
Figure (4.5b)	Percentage of frequency for the numbers of respondent experience-----	67
Figure (4.6)	Effect of distribution of additional Client request during the project life cycle-----	80

Figure (4.7)	Effect of stopped, disrupted or interrupted work during the project life cycle-----	81
Figure (4.8)	Effect of Owner financial difficulties during the project life cycle-----	81
Figure (4.9)	Effect of accelerated performance requested by the Owner during the project life cycle-----	82
Figure (4.10)	Effect of delays from the Owner's acts during the project life cycle-----	83
Figure (4.11)	Effect of initiated value engineering change during the project life cycle-----	84
Figure (4.12)	Effect of design revisions (change) by the Designer/ Consultant during the project life cycle-----	87
Figure (4.13)	Effect of design errors or omissions by the Designer/ Consultant during the project life cycle-----	88
Figure (4.14)	Effect of design deficiencies during the project life cycle-----	88
Figure (4.15)	Effect of unanticipated works during the project life cycle-----	89
Figure (4.16)	Effect of discrepancies in the contract drawings during the project life cycle-----	90
Figure (4.17)	Effect of unavailable specified products during the project life cycle-----	90
Figure (4.18)	Effect of work required to be performed on one particular method while specifications allow one or more methods during the project life cycle-----	91
Figure (4.19)	Effect of incomplete scope definitions during the project life cycle-----	92
Figure (4.20)	Effect of over inspection during the Project life cycle-----	92
Figure (4.21)	Effect of differing site conditions during the project life cycle---	93
Figure (4.22)	Effect of work method restrictions during the project life cycle--	94
Figure (4.23)	Effect of construction errors by the Contractor during the project life cycle-----	98

Figure (4.24)	Effect of construction omissions by the Contractor during the project life cycle-----	98
Figure (4.25)	Effect of remedial work by the Contractor during the project life cycle-----	99
Figure (4.26)	Effect of work out of sequence by the Contractor during the project life cycle-----	99
Figure (4.27)	Effect of material & equipment late delivery by the Contractor during the project life cycle-----	100
Figure (4.28)	Effect of following new or different schedule by the Contractor during the project life cycle-----	101
Figure (4.29)	Effect of Contractor financial difficulties during the project life cycle-----	101
Figure (4.30)	Effect of lack of skilled labor during the project life cycle-----	102
Figure (4.31)	Effect of increased risks by the Contractor during the project life cycle-----	102
Figure (4.32)	Effect of lack of coordination by the project management during the project life cycle-----	104
Figure (4.33)	Effect of difference in contract interpretation by the project management during the project life cycle-----	105
Figure (4.34)	Effect of errors in contract documents by the project management during the project life cycle-----	105
Figure (4.35)	Effect of Third party permits during the project life cycle-----	107
Figure (4.36)	Effect of Governmental actions during the project life cycle----	108
Figure (4.37)	Effect of restrictions in site access by the Local Authorities during the project life cycle-----	108
Figure (4.38)	Effect of utility relocation during the project life cycle-----	109
Figure (4.39)	Effect of Stakeholders during the project life cycle-----	110
Figure (4.40)	Effect of unexpected events during the project life cycle-----	112
Figure (4.41)	Effect of acts of God during the project life cycle-----	113

Figure (4.42)	The top Twenty change orders which have great impact on the construction project-----	116
Figure (4.43)	Percentage of frequency for the causes which gives great impact on the project-----	117
Figure (4.44a)	Frequency of change orders attributed to project parties-----	119
Figure (4.44b)	Percentage of frequency for change orders attributed to different reasons-----	119
Figure (5.1)	Distribution of total additive and negative change orders in the study projects-----	124
Figure (5.2)	Net cost increasing due to total additive and negative change orders in the Study Project-----	125
Figure (5.3)	Distribution of additive change order in the study projects-----	129
Figure (5.4)	Original cost vs. cost increasing in this study projects-----	131
Figure (5.5)	Original duration vs. time extension in the study projects-----	131
Figure (5.6a)	The Relationship between Original Cost and Cost increasing (Linear Equation)-----	134
Figure (5.6b)	Figure 5.6.(b) The Relationship between Original Cost and Cost increasing (Quadratic Equation)-----	134
Figure (5.7a)	The Relationship between Original duration and Time Extension (Linear Equation)-----	134
Figure (5.7b)	The Relationship between Original duration and Time Extension (Quadratic Equation)-----	134
Figure (5.8a)	The relationship between total cost increasing and total time extension (Linear Equation)-----	135
Figure (5.8b)	The relationship between total cost increasing and total time extension (Quadratic Equation)-----	135
Figure (5.9)	Frequency of additive change orders attributed to different reasons-----	137

Figure (5.10)	Frequency of cost increasing attributed to different reasons-----	140
Figure (5.11)	Frequency of time extension attributed to different reasons-----	140
Figure (5.12a)	The relationship between original cost and cost increasing attributed to the additional work (Linear Equation)-----	143
Figure (5.12b)	The relationship between original cost and cost increasing attributed to the additional work (Quadratic Equation)-----	143
Figure (5.13a)	The Relationship between Original Duration and Time Extension Attributed to the additional Work (Linear Equation)--	144
Figure (5.13b)	The relationship between original duration and time extension attributed to the additional work (Quadratic Equation)-----	144
Figure (5.14)	The Relationship between Original Duration and Cost Increasing Attributed to the additional Work (Quadratic Equation)-----	145
Figure (5.15a)	The relationship between original cost and increasing cost attributed to the design revisions (Linear Equation)-----	147
Figure (5.15b)	The relationship between original cost and increasing cost attributed to the design revisions (Quadratic Equation)-----	148
Figure (5.16a)	The relationship between original cost and increasing cost attributed to the differing site conditions (Linear Equation)-----	150
Figure (5.16b)	The relationship between original cost and increasing cost attributed to the differing site conditions (Quadratic Equation)--	150
Figure (5.17)	Distributions of additive change orders to work disciplines-----	153
Figure (5.18)	Cost increasing distributed to different work discipline-----	153
Figure (5.19)	Time extension to different work discipline-----	154
Figure (5.20)	The relationship between original cost and cost increasing attributed to civil work-----	156
Figure (5.21)	The relationship between original duration and time extension attributed to civil work-----	156