

Ain Shams University

Faculty of Engineering

Department of Planning & Urban Design



PARADIGMS FOR SPATIAL PLANNING

Thesis Submitted For Examination for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

By

Marwa M. Abdel-Latif

Supervisors

Prof. Dr. Youhansen Y. Eid

Professor of Urban Planning , Ain Shams University

Dr. Amr A. Attia

Associate Professor of Urban Planning , Ain Shams University

2013

to roots and sprouts,
to lilies and butterflies,
to sunshine and night breeze,
to the milky way and the colour spectrum.

Acknowledgements

I've been occasionally reminded that the PhD is not a life time project. While this could be right, it is definitely a life changing experience, at least for me. I wish to express my sincere appreciation to the many people who provided support, direction, and assistance towards the completion of this thesis. Without their words of encouragement and contributions, this research would not have been finished. First of all, I would like to express my gratitude to my supervisors. The exceptional knowledge of Prof. Youhansen Eid played a crucial role in stretching my personal boundaries in conceptual thinking. In addition, I would like to thank her for giving me the chance to test my hypothesis on the ground during her work as the consultant of Khanka city plan project. I'm indebted to Prof. Amr Attia for his unwavering inspiration understanding and support. Prof. Attia has been my mentor for more than 10 years, and helped to make my learning journey challenging and gratifying. I also wish to express my gratitude to the esteemed members of examination committee for their crucial comments on the draft of this thesis which led to substantial improvements on its final version. I thank Prof. Johannes Hamhaber for his valuable comments on the theoretical foundations of the research. I also wish to thank Prof. Shafak al-Wakil for sharing her long experience in physical planning. I also thank her for involving me as part of her team in the 'MISR' project which gave me firsthand knowledge on some experiences discussed in this thesis.

I wish to thank my professors in the department of planning, who contributed to my growth both as a student and as a person. Prof. Abdullah Attia gave me an exceptional chance to understand the dynamics of physical planning history of Egypt in the 1970s and the 1980s, in particular development of the North West Coast region. A special thank you goes to Prof. Mohamed Abdel-Baky Ibrahim. I always reflect on his course on city management. Additionally, I like to thank him for his dedicated efforts to build an online academic library for Egyptian researchers. I am particularly grateful to Prof. Mohamed Salheen for his inspirations and encouragement. A very special thanks goes to Prof. Germin Al-Gohary for her continuous support and motivation. I wish to thank Dr. Ahmad Shetawy for introducing me to the writings of Patsy Healey. I, also, wish to thank Dr. Marwa Khalifa for sharing her experience in city development plans. I couldn't have completed this work without the unlimited support of my colleagues in the department of urban planning and design. In particular, I am grateful to Mr. Ahmad Toima, Mr. Samy Afify, Mr. Mohamed Al-Shafie for their valuable inputs and contributions to the fieldwork.

A special expression of thanks to Prof. Lobna Abdel-Latif, professor of economics at Cairo University, for making her extensive knowledge and experiences available to me. Her tremendous contributions, comments and suggestions for improvements of this thesis are highly valued and gratefully acknowledged.

In the process of understanding the evolution of urbanisation and planning in Egypt, I'm grateful for Prof. Abou Zaid Rageh, professor of regional planning at Cairo University for his extensive knowledge and valuable insight. I extend my appreciation

to Mr. Salah Hegab for sharing his experience in physical planning practice in Egypt as well as providing me with copies of rare manuscript. I, also, wish to thank Dr. Maha Fahim, manager of regional planning department at the General Organisation of Physical Planning.

I wish to thank members of 'Namaa' Sustainable School, in particular Mr. Ayman Shehata, Ms. Engy Bahgat and Ms. Nesma Gewaily, for their support as well as valuable discussions and feedback. A special thank you goes to Dr. Heba Raouf, professor of political science for her inspiring talks about the trilogy of man, time and place.

I wish to thank all my PhD fellows for giving me access to many articles and books. I wish to thank Mr. Hazem Kamal for opening doors of philosophy during the early stages of this study. A very special thank you to my dear friend Ms. Mariam Al-Awa who has accompanied me in my academic quest, despite the distance. I, also, wish to thank Ms. Nahla Al-Atriby, Ms. Maha Tharwat and Ms. Gehan Khorshid for their support.

I'm thankful to all my teachers who escorted me during my learning journey. In particular, I wish to thank Mrs. Sanaa Khalil, my high school teacher of English who once taught me the art of words and continues to teach me the art of life. I'll be always grateful to my friends and my family members for their unconditional support and believing in me. Finally, I wish to thank all the wonderful people on the internet who make knowledge available for a better world.

**Marwa Mohammad Abdel-Latif, Paradigms for Spatial Planning, Ph.D. Thesis,
Urban Planning Department, Faculty of Engineering, Ain Shams University**

Abstract

The main objective of the study is to understand change in spatial planning and its conceptual underpinnings as well as to examine the change in plan-making activity and spatial planning systems within the wider context of spatial planning framework. Taking into consideration that the spatial planning system is influenced by the national legal structures and administrative system, this study postulates the partial change in the legal framework of the spatial planning jeopardises the achievement of expected outcomes of strategic spatial planning at the local level in Egypt.

To substantiate the research hypothesis, this study followed several research methodologies, including literature review to formulate the conceptual model to map the change in spatial plan-making activity and spatial planning systems; a retro-perspective approach to study to change of international spatial planning; a comparative analysis to examine the relation between changes in spatial plan-making activity and spatial planning system, in addition to interviews and field observations to investigate the change in the spatial planning activity in Egypt.

Part I established the theoretical foundation to understand change in spatial planning theory and practice. It offered a historical backdrop for development of contemporary spatial planning. In order to gain a deeper perception of change, a conceptual model was developed using a loose paradigmatic approach. The main themes addressed in this model are the driving forces for change, the dynamics of change and the nature of change in spatial plan-making activity and spatial planning systems.

Drawing on the theoretical framework, Part II analysed the changes in spatial planning thought, practice and systems during the twentieth century under three intellectual paradigms: positivism, structuralism and relationalism. . Furthermore, the international experience showed the interrelation between change in spatial plan-making activity and spatial planning system, as well as the synchronisation with the wider context of spatial planning framework.

Taking these findings into application, Part III examines the development of spatial plan-making activity and spatial planning system in Egypt between 1952 and 2011. The study focuses on examining the recent change in the laws regulating spatial plan-making activity and places this change within the wider legal framework of the spatial planning system of Egypt. The analysis showed that the partial change was inconsistent with the wider framework. This inconsistency could be attributed to the variation in the conceptual foundations among the laws which support the spatial planning system of Egypt.

The study concluded that the adoption of the government of Egypt for strategic spatial planning could be considered a paradigm shift in the planning system. However, the current spatial planning framework cannot fully support this shift.

Keywords: Spatial planning; Planning systems; Comprehensive rational planning; Urban governance; Conception of space; Strategic urban planning; Planning legislations.

PARADIGMS FOR SPATIAL PLANNING

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements	i
Abstract	iii
Table of contents.....	v
List of figures	xi
List of tables	xiii
List of boxes.....	xiii
Preface.....	xvii

1 A CASE OF INQUIRY INTO SPATIAL PLANNING IN EGYPT

1.1 Context and Aims	1
1.2 The Theoretical Background.....	1
1.3 The Research Settings	2
1.4 Problem identification.....	5
1.5 The Research Hypothesis	6
1.6 The Research Questions	6
1.7 The Research Methodology	7
1.7.1 Theoretical-related Questions.....	7
1.7.2 International Experience-related Questions	9
1.7.3 Contextual-related Questions	10
1.8 Scope of Study and Limitations	11
1.9 Significance of the Research.....	12
1.10 Thesis Organisation	13

PART I: THEORETICAL FOUNDATION

2	CHANGE IN CONTEMPORARY SPATIAL PLANNING	21
2.1	Introduction	23
2.2	A historical backdrop	24
2.3	Perspectives on Spatial Planning	28
2.4	The Traditional Perspective of Spatial Planning	30
2.4.1	The Classical Strands of Planning	31
2.4.2	Traditional Spatial Planning Systems	34
2.5	The New Perspective of Spatial Planning	36
2.5.1	New Spatial Planning Systems	38
2.6	Observing the Shift in Spatial Planning	39
2.7	Main Findings and Concluding Remarks	40
3	CONCEPTUALISING CHANGE IN PLANNING	43
3.1	Introduction	45
3.2	A Paradigmatic Perspective on Change	45
3.3	Precedent Contributions on Examining Change of Planning	49
3.3.1	Two Geographies in Planning	51
3.3.2	Three Intellectual Traditions in Planning	52
3.3.3	The Governance Triangle	54
3.3.4	The Governance Landscape	55
3.3.5	Driving Forces for Change	56
3.3.6	A Typology of Diffusion	58
3.3.7	Waves of Planning Systems	60
3.4	Mapping Change in Spatial Planning	62
3.5	Main Findings and Concluding Remarks	65

PART II: INTERNATIONAL EXPERIENCE

4	MAPPING CHANGES IN SPATIAL PLANNING	73
4.1	Introduction	75
4.2	The Neutral Container Paradigm	76
4.2.1	The Utopian Age of Planning	77

4.2.2	Spatial Planning as a Technical Activity	79
4.2.3	Modernisation and Planning Systems	79
4.2.4	The Spread of Physical Planning.....	81
4.3	The Social Construct Paradigm.....	83
4.3.1	The Rise of Social Theory in Planning	85
4.3.2	Spatial Planning in a Global Economy	87
4.3.3	The Spread of Political Economy Planning	88
4.4	The Relational Web Paradigm	89
4.4.1	The Communicative Turn in Planning	90
4.4.2	The Spread of Strategic Spatial Planning.....	93
4.5	A Cross-examination of the Planning Paradigms	97
4.6	Main Findings and Concluding Remarks	102
5	CHANGES IN THE LEGAL FRAMEWORKS FOR SPATIAL PLANNING	105
5.1	Introduction.....	107
5.2	The United Kingdom.....	107
5.2.1	Country Profile	108
5.2.2	The Golden Days of Physical Planning.....	108
5.2.3	The Rise of Entrepreneurial Planning.....	110
5.2.4	The Spatial Turn in the UK.....	112
5.3	The Republic of Poland.....	116
5.3.1	Country Profile	116
5.3.2	Political Transformations and Spatial Planning	116
5.3.3	The Polish Spatial Planning Framework	117
5.3.4	Development Strategies for Polish Cities	119
5.4	The People's Republic of China	121
5.4.1	Country Profile	121
5.4.2	Economic Reform and Spatial Planning.....	122
5.4.3	The Chinese Spatial Planning Framework	123
5.4.4	Strategic Development Plans at Local Level.....	123

5.5	A Comparative Analysis of International Case Studies.....	125
5.6	Main Findings and Concluding Remarks.....	130

PART III: CONTEXTUAL STUDY

6 CONTEMPORARY SPATIAL PLANNING IN EGYPT.....137

6.1	Introduction.....	139
6.2	The Pre-Modern Era (3000 BC – 1805 AD)	140
6.3	The Modern Era (1805-1952)	143
6.3.1	Muhammad 'Ali and his Successors (1805-1882).....	144
6.3.2	The British Occupation	149
6.3.3	The Liberal Era (1922-1952).....	151
6.4	Contemporary Planning System of Egypt.....	152
6.4.1	The Dream of Modernisation (1950s & 1960s)	153
6.4.2	A New Map for Egypt (1970s).....	155
6.4.3	A Plethora of Plans (1980s and 1990s)	159
6.4.4	The Dawn of Strategic Planning (2000s).....	161
6.5	Three Waves in Contemporary Planning of Egypt.....	164
6.6	Main Findings and Concluding Remarks.....	168

7 STRATEGIC URBAN PLANNING IN EGYPT.....171

7.1	Introduction.....	173
7.2	Laws regulating Spatial Plan-making Activity	173
7.2.1	Law no.3/1982 for Physical Planning.....	173
7.2.2	Law no.119/2008 for Promulgating the Building Law	177
7.2.3	The Nature of Change in Spatial Plan-making	182
7.3	Implications for Spatial Plan-making Activity	184
7.3.1	Guidelines for Strategic Urban Plans for Cities.....	184
7.3.2	Strategic Urban Plans for Cities in Action	189
7.4	Main Findings and Concluding Remarks.....	197

8 LOCAL STRATEGIC PLANNING WITHIN THE CURRENT PLANNING SYSTEM OF EGYPT	199
8.1 Introduction	201
8.2 The Wider Context of the Legal Framework for Planning	201
8.2.1 Law no. 43/1979 for Local Administration	202
8.2.2 Law no.70/1973 for Preparing the General Plan of the State	205
8.2.3 Law no. 53/1973 for the General Budget of the State	207
8.2.4 A Partial Change in the Legal Framework for Spatial Planning	209
8.3 Implications for Strategic Urban Planning	211
8.3.1 Preparing Strategic Urban Plan within the Legal Framework	212
8.3.2 Implementing Strategic Urban Plans within the Legal Framework	215
8.4 Main Finding and Concluding Remarks	217
9 A NEW SPATIAL PLANNING PARADIGM	221
9.1 Overview	224
9.2 Research Findings	230
9.2.1 Theoretical Findings	230
9.2.2 Empirical Findings	231
9.2.3 Contextual Findings	233
9.3 Recommendations	234
9.4 Issues for Future Research	235
SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY	237
APPENDIX 1	249
Pre-modern state of Egypt	249
APPENDIX 2	cclix
List of Interviewees – Cairo 2008-2010	cclix

List of figures

FIGURE 1-1: MAP OF EGYPT	2
FIGURE 1-2: THE RESEARCH STRUCTURE	14
FIGURE 2-1: TIMELINE OF CONTEMPORARY SPATIAL PLANNING.....	25
FIGURE 2-2: THE ORIGIN OF 'NEW' PERSPECTIVE OF SPATIAL PLANNING	30
FIGURE 2-3: THE SIGNIFICANCE OF SPATIAL DIMENSIONS IN CLASSICAL PLANNING TRADITIONS..	34
FIGURE 2-4: THE SIGNIFICANCE OF SPATIAL DIMENSIONS OF NEW SPATIAL PLANNING.....	37
FIGURE 3-1: THE CYCLE OF PARADIGM SHIFTS	47
FIGURE 3-2: THREE CORE THEMES FOR CHANGE	50
FIGURE 3-3: THE GOVERNANCE TRIANGLE	54
FIGURE 3-4: DRIVING FORCES ON PLANNING SYSTEM	57
FIGURE 3-5: FRAMEWORK FOR STUDYING EVOLUTION OF PLANNING SYSTEMS	62
FIGURE 3-6: A CONCEPTUAL MODEL FOR MAPPING CHANGE IN SPATIAL PLANNING.....	64
FIGURE 4-1: THE GARDEN CITY	78
FIGURE 4-2: PLAN OF THE GARDEN CITY	78
FIGURE 4-3: MODE OF CITY GROWTH	78
FIGURE 4-4: THE PROCESS OF RATIONAL COMPREHENSIVE PLANNING	80
FIGURE 4-5: NEW DELHI AND OLD DELHI, INDIA	82
FIGURE 4-6: THE LUTYENS-BAKER PLAN OF NEW DELHI, INDIA.....	82
FIGURE 4-7: PLAN OF CHANDIGARH	83
FIGURE 4-8: SOCIAL STRUCTURE AND SPATIAL STRUCTURE.....	84
FIGURE 4-9: THE THEORETICAL POSITION IN PLANNING THEORY IN THE 1970S	87
FIGURE 4-10: THE MULTIPLEX CITY	92
FIGURE 5-1: MAP OF THE UNITED KINGDOM	108
FIGURE 5-2: THE ABERCROMBIE PLAN FOR GREATER LONDON IN 1944.....	110
FIGURE 5-3B: AERIAL VIEWS OF CANARY WHARF (1983-2011)	112
FIGURE 5-4: THE LONDON PLAN KEY DIAGRAM 2011	115
FIGURE 5-5: MAP OF POLAND SOURCE:.....	116
FIGURE 5-6: THE STRATEGIC HOUSE OF POZNAN CITY	120
FIGURE 5-7: MAP OF PEOPLE'S REPUBLIC OF CHINA	121
FIGURE 5-8: ADMINISTRATIVE SYSTEM OF CHINA.....	122
FIGURE 5-9: CONCEPT PLAN OF GUANGZHOU	125
FIGURE 5-10: A COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF CHANGE IN SPATIAL PLANNING IN THE UK, POLAND AND CHINA	127
FIGURE 6-1: FORMATION LAYERS OF CONTEMPORARY PLANNING SYSTEM OF EGYPT.....	139
FIGURE 6-2: THE CENTRAL SYSTEM OF THE EGYPTIAN GOVERNMENT OF THE ANCIENT EGYPTIAN CIVILISATION	141