

Prevalence and risk factors of work-related health problems among stone saw workers in West Bank- Palestine.

Thesis

Submitted for partial fulfillment of M.D. degree

In Public Health and Community Medicine

By

Hatim Mahmoud Jaber

M.B, B.Ch, Msc. Public Health,

Jordan and Palestine Board Community Medicine

Supervised By

Prof. Dr. Mona Soliman Mohamed

Professor of Public Health and Community Medicine

Faculty of Medicine

Cairo University

Prof. Dr. Omaina Kamel El-Salamoni

Professor of Public Health and Community Medicine

Faculty of Medicine

Cairo University

Prof. Dr. Amal Mohamed Kamal El Safty

Head and Professor of Occupational and Environmental Medicine

Faculty of Medicine

Cairo University

Faculty of Medicine,

Cairo University

2015

محضر
اجتماع لجنة الحكم علي الرسالة المقدمة من
الطبيب / حاتم محمود عبد الفتاح جابر
توطئة للحصول علي درجة الماجستير / الدكتوراة
في الصحة العامة

تحت عنوان : باللغة الانجليزية :

**"Prevalence and Risk Factors of work – Related
Health Problems among Stone Saw Workers in West
Bank- Palestine"**

باللغة العربية :

"عوامل الخطورة ومعدل إنتشار الأمراض المهنية عند عمال مناشير الحجر في
الضفة الغربية – فلسطين"

بناء علي موافقه الجامعة بتاريخ / / ٢٠٠ تم تشكيل لجنة الفحص والمناقشة للرسالة المذكور اعلاه علي

النحو التالي :

عن المشرفين	أستاذ بقسم الصحة العامة بالكلية	أ.د. مني سليمان محمد احمد
ممتحن داخلي	أستاذ قسم الصحة العامة بالكلية	أ.د. زينب امام عفيفي
ممتحن خارجي	أستاذ الصحة العامة بالمركز القومي للبحوث	أ.د. امل سعد الدين احمد حسين

بعد فحص الرسالة بواسطة كل عضو منفرداً وكتابة تقارير منفردة لكل منهم انعقدت اللجنة مجتمعة في يو
الاثنين الموافق ٢٠١٥/٥/٤ بقسم الصحة العامة بمدرج القسم بكلية الطب – جامعة القاهرة وذلك لمناقشة
الطالب في جلسة علنية في موضوع الرسالة والنتائج التي توصل اليها وكذلك الأسس العلمية التي قام عليها البحث.

قرار اللجنة :

قرار اللجنة

توقيعات اعضاء اللجنة :

الممتحن الخارجي

الممتحن الداخلي

المشرف الممتحن

ام

ش

م

بِسْمِ اللَّهِ الرَّحْمَنِ الرَّحِيمِ

اقْرَأْ بِاسْمِ رَبِّكَ الَّذِي خَلَقَ (﴿١﴾) خَلَقَ
الْإِنْسَانَ مِنْ عَلَقٍ (﴿٢﴾) اقْرَأْ وَرَبُّكَ
الْأَكْرَمُ (﴿٣﴾) الَّذِي عَلَّمَ بِالْقَلَمِ (﴿٤﴾) عَلَّمَ
الْإِنْسَانَ مَا لَمْ يَعْلَمْ (﴿٥﴾)

صدق الله العظيم

(سورة العلق: الآيات 1 - 5)

Dedication

This work is dedicated to my wife; **Dr. Aysha Abdel-Jaleel**, my daughters; **Dr. Haneen**, **Dr. Nour**, **Areej** and my son **Yazan**, who always encouraged me to attain my goals.

This work is also dedicated and to **all marginalized and forgotten stone saws workers in Palestine** who devoted their life to stone industry.

It is also dedicated to all **members of research team** for helping and supporting me throughout my studies.

Acknowledgment

**First and foremost, I feel always indebt to ALLAH the most gracious,
the most merciful.**

I would like to express my deepest thanks and gratitude to **Prof. Dr. Mona Soliman Mohmed**, Professor of Public Health, Faculty of Medicine, Cairo University, for her great help and valuable guidance.

Thanks and gratitude are due to **Prof. Dr. Omaina Kamel El-Salamoni**, Professor of Public Health, Faculty of Medicine, Cairo University, for her continuous help and supervision.

Many thanks and heartfelt appreciation to **Prof. Dr. Amal Mohamed Kamal El Safty**, Head and Professor of Occupational and Environmental Medicine, Faculty of Medicine, Cairo University, for her great help and valuable guidance.

Many special thanks and appreciation to **Dr. Hanan Mosleh Ibrahim**, lecturer of Public Health, Faculty of Medicine, Cairo University, for her continuous help and direct meticulous supervision.

Many thanks to **Dr. Asad Ramlawi**, Assistant professor of Tropical Medicine, Jerusalem University and Director General of Primary Health Care and Public Health Directorate, Ministry of Health-Palestine for his support and help with the study conduction.

All the greetings and appreciation to **stone saw workers in Palestine** who did not hesitate to participate in this research, in spite of all difficulties they face, which form a qualitative addition to this study.

My deep appreciation to the **whole field team**: from **Palestinian Ministries of Health and Labor, Palestine General Federation of Trade Unions and Al-Najah University** who were greatly enthusiastic and co-operative and who I consider all as research partners.

Special thanks to my **professors and colleagues** in Public Health department who supported and guided me all through my career.

It would not have been possible to complete this doctoral thesis without the help and support of the kind people around me, to only some of whom it is possible to give particular mention here. ***Above all, I would like to thank my family for their support and great patience at all times and my dear research team to whom I am forever grateful.***

Abstract

Introduction: For years stone quarrying especially stone saw workshops have been known as highly hazardous work, whereby workers are affected by many debilitating occupational health hazards and diseases.

Objectives: The purpose of this study is to determine the prevalence of work related health problems among Palestinian stone cutting workers, and to investigate the association of the work conditions and risk factors to specific outcomes, which are work-related diseases like noise induced hearing loss (NIHL), pulmonary function impairment (PFI), dermatoses and musculoskeletal disorders as well as injuries.

Method: During April-June 2012, analytical cross-sectional study of 259 male workers, who were available at all stone-saw workshops (n=42) located around the valley between Nablus and Tulkarm in the northern part of West Bank, Palestine, were evaluated through interviews structured questionnaire, detailed history and clinical examination: occupational audiometry, spirometry, skin inspection and musculoskeletal disorders were performed. Environmental measurements were performed in form of noise level meter and air sampling.

Results: The respondents were all male, mean age group was 36.85 years and mean duration of service is 13.36 years. The prevalence of NIHL was 45.2%, PFI 21.6%, work injuries 35.9%, musculoskeletal 26.6% and dermatosis 11.6%. A significant associations ($p < 0.05$) were identified from multivariate analysis between these health problems and the variables of work type, noise, dust, duration of work, educational level, periodic health appraisal, using personal protective equipment, smoking and residence.

Noise level was found to be between 93-123 dB. Air samples analysis showed that the average particulate matter (PM) PM 2.5 (mg/m^3) was 1.4 while for PM10 was 3.9. And heavy metal analysis by Atomic absorption showed that Lead and chromium were absent on filter paper, while iron showed the highest concentration (0.05) (mg/m^3), followed by copper (0.02), which was higher than recommended.

Conclusion: The findings of this study highlighted the high prevalence of health problems among these workers. Manual stone-saw workers are at constant risk of NIHL, LFI, dermatoses and musculoskeletal disorders as well as injuries. Certain factors like non usage of personal protective equipments increase the risk for developing these health effects.

Recommendations: Screening and follow up for hearing loss and lung function are recommended for people working in stone cutting workshops. Prevention programs and legislation which already exist should be implemented and enforced.

Keywords: Pulmonary function, hearing loss, stone-saw workers, Palestine

TABLE OF CONTENTS

<i>Content</i>		<i>Page</i>
List of Abbreviations		I
List of Tables		II
List of Figures		VI
List of Annexes		VIII
Introduction and Aim of the Work		1
Review of Literature:		
	Health, public and occupational	5
	Occupational Health in Palestine	14
	Quarrying and workers	27
	Hazards and Risk factors at workplace	30
	Principles of Occupational Hazards Prevention and Control	36
	Workplace Inspection and Monitoring	44
	Quarrying and stone-saw workers in Palestine	49
Subjects and Methods		52
Results		70
Discussion		115
Conclusion		135
Recommendations		137
Summary		139
References		142
Annexes		172
Arabic summery		180

List of Abbreviations

ALO	Arab Labor Organization
BOHS	Basic Occupational Health Services
FEV1	Forced Expiratory Volume first second
FVC	Forced Vital Capacity
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GNP	Gross National Product
HEPA	High-efficiency particulate arrestance
ILO	International Labor Organization
LFI	Lung Function Impairment
MoH	Ministry of Health
MoL	Ministry of Labor
MSK	Musculoskeletal
NIHL	Noise Induced Hearing Loss
NIOSH	National Institute of Occupational Safety and Health
OH	Occupational health
OHS	Occupational health services
OPT	Occupied Palestinian territories
OSHA	Occupational safety and Health Administration
PCBS	Palestinian Central Barea of statistics
PAPR	Powered Air Purifying Respirators
PFT	Pulmonary Function Test
PM	Particulate Matter
PPE	Personal Protective Equipment
SD	Slandered Deviation
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
USD	United State Dollar
USMP	Union of Stones and Marble in Palestine
WHA	Workers' Health: Global Plan of Action
WHO	World Health Organization

List of Tables

#	Table	Page
1	Reported occupational accidents in WB Palestine 2006- 2012	24
2	Acceptable control methods for cutting, grinding, and polishing stone	42
3	Distribution of Palestinian stone and marble factories, workshops and quarries.	50
4	Socio-demographic characteristics of the participants	71
5	Description of professional training and syndicate (trade union) membership of the workers	73
6	Description of the type of work and working conditions encountered by the participants	74
7	Distribution of workers' responses as regards regular inspection of the work site by authorized institutions	75
8	Description of availability of safety measures at the work site	76
9	Training on and use of personal protective equipment and reasons of non-use	77
10	Past history of occupational injuries and its outcome	79
11	Distribution of chronic illnesses as reported by the participants	81
12	Additional complaints mentioned by the studied participants	83
13	Frequency of Hearing loss, its types and classification of NIHL among examined participants	84
14	Results of lung function test (spirometry) and Chest X-ray of participants	86

15	Association of NIHL with the type of work of the participants	88
16	Association of NIHL with the age groups of the participants	89
17	Association of NIHL with the residence of the participants	89
18	Association of NIHL with the educational level of the participants	90
19	Association of abnormal NIHL with the educational level of the participants	91
20	Association of NIHL with received professional training of the participants	91
21	Association of NIHL with periodic health appraisal of the participants	92
22	Association of NIHL with ever exposure to occupational injuries among the participants	93
23	Association of NIHL with insurance against accidents of the participants	93
24	Association of NIHL with long work hours (more than 8 hours)	94
25	Association of NIHL with the training on, availability and the use of PPE by the participants	95
26	Association of NIHL with the smoking status of the participants	96
27	Association of abnormal NIHL with the increase of duration of exposure by the participants	96
28	Association of abnormal NIHL with reported chronic diseases by the participants	97
29	Association of NIHL with the mean age, duration of work, break time and monthly income of the participants	98

III

30	Independent factors associated with NIHL	99
31	Association of abnormal PFT with the type of work of the participants	100

32	Association of abnormal PFT with the age groups of the participants	100
33	Association of abnormal PFT with the residence of the participants	101
34	Association of abnormal PFT with the educational level of the participants	101
35	Association of abnormal PFT with the educational level (school and university) of the participants	102
36	Association of abnormal PFT with professional training of the participants	103
37	Association of abnormal PFT with periodic health appraisal of the participants	104
38	Association of abnormal PFT with ever exposure to occupational injuries among the participants	104
39	Association of abnormal PFT with insurance against accidents of the participants	105
40	Association of abnormal PFT with long work hours (more than 8 hours)	106
41	Association of abnormal PFT with the training on, availability and the use of PPE by the participants	107
42	Association of abnormal PFT with increase of work duration by the participants	108
43	Association of abnormal PFT with having chronic disease of the participants	108
44	Association of abnormal PFT with the smoking status of the participants	109

45	Association between exposed (inside) and less exposed workers with FVC	109
46	Association of FVC, FEV1/FVC with the smoking status of the participants	110
47	Correlation between duration of work and each of FVC, FEV1 and FEV1/FVC	110
48	Association of abnormal PFT with the mean age, duration of work, break time and monthly income of the participants	111
49	Multivariate logistic regression to study Independent factors associated with abnormal PFT	111
50	Result of 144 air samples analysis for airborne Particulate matter	113
51	Heavy metal analysis of air samples by Atomic absorption	113
52	Sound intensity measurement in five workshops	114

List of Figures

#	Figure	Page
1	Palestine Map	14
2	Labor Force Participation Rate in Palestine of Work and Gender during 1995-2013	17
3	Distribution of Establishments in Operation in the Private Sector, Non-Governmental Organization Sector and Government Companies in the Remaining West Bank and Gaza Strip by Main Economic Activity, 2012	18
4	Percentage Distribution of operating establishments in the private sector, nongovernmental organization sector and government companies in Palestine Employment size, 2012.	19
5	Quarrying Site	28
6	Lifecycle for stone and marble- Quarrying	29
7	Hierarchy of control	41
8	Stone cutting workshop – outside view	53
9	Doughnut model for cutting process.	54
10	Transporting and Unloading stones	55
11	Cutting stones	56
12	Shaping and finishing of stones	57
13	Location of workshops	58
14	Field work	60
15	Noise-induced hearing loss classification criteria suggested by Merluzzi	63
16	Spirovit SP-1 Spirometer	65
17	Audiometry	66
18	Air samples collection	66