



# **Cyclic Fatigue Resistance Of Three Root Canal Ni-Ti Systems**

Thesis

Submitted to the Faculty of Dentistry  
Ain Shams University  
For

Partial fulfillment of the requirements of the  
Master Degree in Endodontics

By

**Mohamed Abdalla Kamal**

BDS Ain Shams University-2007

**Supervisors**

**Dr. Kariem Mostafa El Batouty**

Associate Professor in Endodontics  
Department of Endodontics  
Faculty of Dentistry, Ain Shams University

**Dr. Mohamed Mokhtar Nagy**

Lecturer in Endodontics  
Department of Endodontics  
Faculty of Dentistry, Ain Shams University

**2015**

# List of Contents

---

List of Tables.....	ii
List of Figures.....	iii
List of Abbreviations.....	vii
Introduction.....	1
Review of Literature .....	4
Aim of the Study.....	38
Materials and Methods .....	39
Results .....	51
Discussion .....	86
Summary and Conclusion .....	99
References.....	101
Arabic Summary .....	

# List of Tables

Table No.		Page No.
1	List of materials used in the study.	<b>41</b>
2	Mean time to fracture for the 3 files in both rotation and reciprocation in radius of curvature 2 mm.	<b>54</b>
3	Mean time to fracture for the 3 files in both rotation and reciprocation in radius of curvature 5 mm.	<b>56</b>
4	Mean time of reciprocation and rotation For the ProTaper files in radius of curvature 2 mm and 5mm.	<b>58</b>
5	Mean time of reciprocation and rotation For the Twisted File in radius of curvature 2mm and 5mm .	<b>60</b>
6	Mean time of reciprocation and rotation For the WaveOne file in radius of curvature 2mm and 5mm .	<b>62</b>
7	Mean time to fracture of all files in Radius of curvature 2 mm and 5 mm in continuous rotation.	<b>64</b>
8	Mean time to fracture of all files in Radius of curvature 2 mm and 5 mm in continuous rotation.	<b>66</b>

# List of Figures

Figure No.		Page No.
1	Photograph of protaper F2 and Protaper with different sizes and tapers	39
2	Photograph of twisted files with different sizes	39
3	Photograph of WaveOne files with different sizes	40
4	Hierarchy showing the classification of samples	42
5	Schematic diagram showing the testing apparatus.	44
6	Photograph of the apparatus used in testing cyclic fatigue	44
7	Photograph showing the block used in the study	45
8	Schematic figure showing the angle of curvature and radius of curvature	46
9	Photograph of the Wave-one motor and 6:1 reducing handpiece	48
10	Photograph of the scanning electron microscope used in the study.	50

11	Bar chart showing mean values for comparison between file type and motion type in radius of curvature 2 mm.	<b>53</b>
12	Bar chart showing mean values for comparison between file type and motion type in radius of curvature 5 mm.	<b>55</b>
13	Bar chart showing the mean of elapsed time of the ProTaper files in reciprocation and rotation.	<b>57</b>
14	Bar chart showing the mean of elapsed time of the Twisted File in relation to rotation and reciprocation.	<b>59</b>
15	Bar chart showing the mean of elapsed time of the WaveOne in relation to rotation and reciprocation.	<b>61</b>
16	Bar chart showing mean time to fracture of all files in Radius of curvature 2 mm and 5 mm in reciprocating motion.	<b>63</b>
17	Bar chart showing mean time to fracture of all files in Radius of curvature 2 mm and 5 mm in continuous rotation.	<b>65</b>
18	Longitudinal electron SEM view of ProTaper F2 Showing machining grooves and disruption of cutting edges with no signs of plastic deformation.	<b>68</b>
19	Fractograph of PTU F2 showing multiple fracture levels, Peripheral areas of brittle fracture and wide area of dimpling.	<b>69</b>
20	Fractograph of ProTaper F2 showing , peripheral areas of brittle fracture and wide area of dimpling, white dotted scribble separating between slow overload zone and rapid overload zone.	<b>70</b>

21	Fractographs of ProTaper F2 showing extensive dimpling indicating Ductile fracture pattern.	<b>71</b>
22	fractograph of ProTaper showing slow overload zone and rapid overload zone at magnification 600x and 1500x.	<b>72</b>
23	Longitudinal view showing disruption of cutting edges and microcracks following manufacturing grooves.	<b>74</b>
24	Longitudinal SEM view (600x) of TF showing disruption of cutting edge and debris with no signs of machining grooves or plastic deformation.	<b>74</b>
25	Fractograph of TF (600x) showing rough dimpled surface, peripheral smooth area with metal roll over.	<b>75</b>
26	Fractograph of TF (600x) showing rough dimpled surface, with multiple smooth areas representing shear lip.	<b>76</b>
27	Fractograph of TF (600x,1500x) showing rough dimpled surface, metal roll over and pronounced cracks at the periphery acting as a nidus for crack propagation.	<b>77</b>
28	Fractograph of TF at magnifications 600x and 1500x showing; slow overload zone, rapid overload zone, micro-cracks and multiple voids and dimples	<b>78</b>
29	Longitudinal SEM of Wave One primary file (600x) showing disruption of cutting edges.	<b>80</b>
30	Longitudinal SEM of WaveOne primary file (600x) showing pronounced cracks following manufacturing grooves.	<b>81</b>

31	Longitudinal view of WaveOne Primary file at magnification 600x broken during rotation showing multiple cracks with disruption of the cutting edge.	<b>82</b>
32	Fractograph of WaveOne Primary file (600x) showing multiple level of fracture and wide rough dimpled surface.	<b>82</b>
33	Fractograph of WaveOne Primary file (600x) showing multiple level of fracture and metal rollover.	<b>83</b>
34	Fractograph of Wave One at magnifications 600x and 1000x showing; slow overload zone, rapid overload zone, micro-cracks and multiple voids and dimples.	<b>84</b>
35	Fractograph of WaveOne Primary file (600x,1500x) showing multiple level of fracture and pronounced voids and dimples.	<b>85</b>

# List of Abbreviations

Abbreviation	Meaning
Ni-Ti	Nickel Titanium
TF	Twisted File
WO	WaveOne
PTU	ProTaper Universal
PTX	ProTaper Next
CF	Cyclic Fatigue
ES	Endosequence
PF	ProFile
TtF	Time to fracture
CW	Clock wise
CCW	Counter clock wise
NCF	Number of cycles to fracture

Fractured rotary Ni-Ti instruments have been classified into those that fail as a result of cyclic flexural fatigue or torsional failure or a combination of both. Clinically, Ni-Ti rotary instruments are subjected to both torsional load and cyclic fatigue. The use of reciprocating movement was claimed to increase the resistance of Ni-Ti file to fatigue in comparison with continuous rotation. Recent improvements in alloys, kinematics, and concepts have been combined to increase the cyclic fatigue resistance of Ni-Ti instruments.

During instrumentation an instrument is inserted and withdrawn from diverse canal configurations, many of which are curved. As a Ni-Ti file bends, it is subjected to compressive stresses on the inside of the curvature. In addition, file motion in this curved posture subjects the file to hundreds of cycles of alternating compression and tension. Memory characteristics and phase transitions of Ni-Ti impart the ability to cycle through the bending demands of a curved canal without fracturing. However, inherent cyclic fatigue resistance is depleted with use, as the additive effects of fatigue stresses accumulate until they eventually exceed the elastic limit. Thus, without warning, file separation may occur as a consequence of cyclic fatigue, torsional fatigue or a combination of both.

Factors influencing cyclic fatigue are often described individually, yet they act collectively. As the radius of curvature decreases, number of cycles to failure also decreases. In addition, a more severe angle of curvature produces greater stress, especially if coincident with a small radius of curvature. File design features such as Ni-Ti

core diameter and flute depth may account for different fatigue properties seen among different file brands.

The ProTaper Ni-Ti rotary system was introduced to the dental market in 2001 and is considered one of the most popular rotary systems. It is made of conventional Ni-Ti alloy and had variable taper along its length.

The Twisted File is manufactured using the R-phase technology. The R-phase technology depends on grinding a superelastic wire to form a file blank. The file blank is maintained in the austenite phase of Ni-Ti until it is twisted, when the stress from the plastic deformation of twisting induces martensite formation. A heat treatment step may be performed prior to twisting, during twisting or after twisting of the blank, to further enhance superelastic file properties.

One of the commercially available Ni-Ti rotary systems using M-Wire Ni-Ti material is the WaveOne Systems. It was first introduced to the dental market in 2010. It is a prepackaged, pre-sterilised, single-use system. According to the manufacturer, the M-Wire technology allows the WaveOne instruments more flexibility and resistance to cyclic fatigue. Instead of a rotary motion, the files work in a reverse “balanced force” cutting motion and is driven by a pre-programmed motor that is capable of moving the files in a back and forth “reciprocating” motion.

Compared to reciprocation, continuous rotation utilizing well-designed active Ni-Ti files requires less inward pressure and improves hauling capacity augering debris out of a canal. A reciprocating instrument travels a shorter

angular distance than a rotary instrument, which subjects the instrument to lower stress values. Consequently, an instrument should have an extended fatigue life when used in reciprocation as opposed to rotary motion. The development of endodontic instruments used in a reciprocating manner aims to reduce the incidence of breakage .It mimics manual movement and reduces the various risks associated with continuously rotating a file through canal curvatures& decrease screw in the canal.

Based on the previous findings and theories it was thought to be of value to compare three different Ni-Ti systems available in the market concerning their cycling fatigue in two rotation modes and different radii.

Separation of rotary Ni-Ti instruments occurs due to torsional failure or flexural fatigue. Whether the fracture occurs due to the influence of one of them or due to combined effect, Yet cyclic fatigue is proved to be an important reason for instrument separation during clinical use . In this part of the study the history of files under investigation will be discussed, in addition to the effect of mode of motion, effect of methods of file fabrication, and effect of canal geometry and radius of curvature on cyclic fatigue.

## **I. History of files under investigation:**

### **1. ProTaper Universal:**

**Ullmann et al.**<sup>1</sup> evaluated static fracture loads of ProTaper Ni-Ti instruments that had been subjected to various degrees of cyclic fatigue. Torque and angle at failure of new instruments and instruments that had been stressed to 30, 60, or 90% of their cyclic fatigue rotations in a simulated canal (90° and 5 mm radius) were tested. With unused ProTaper instruments, resistance to cyclic fatigue decreased with diameter increase and ranged from 158 to 450 rotations. Cyclic prestressing significantly reduced torsional resistance in finishing files, while shaping files were largely unaffected. In conclusion, build-up of tension within Ni-Ti rotary instruments depends on instrument diameter. Clinically, larger instruments that have been subjected to some cyclic fatigue should be used with great care or discarded.

**Voreadi et al.**<sup>2</sup> evaluated the failure mechanism of ProTaper Ni-Ti rotary instruments fractured under clinical

conditions. A total of 46 ProTaper instruments that failed (fractured and/or plastically deformed) during the clinical use were collected from various dental clinics, whereas a new set of ProTaper instruments served as control. After inspection under stereomicroscopy the instruments were classified into three categories: (a) plastically deformed but not fractured, (b) fractured with plastic deformation and (c) fractured without plastic deformation. Three instruments from each group were analyzed with computerized X-ray microtomography (micro-XCT) to detect surface and internal defects, whilst all the fractured surfaces were investigated under SEM. Steriomicroscopic inspection showed that 17.4% of the discarded instruments were only plastically deformed, 8.7% were fractured with plastic deformation and 73.9% were fractured without plastic deformation. Micro-XCT revealed instruments without any surface or bulk defects along with a few files with crack development below the fractured surface. No defects were identified in the unused instruments. SEM examination of the fractured surfaces demonstrated the presence of dimples and cones, a typical pattern of dimple rupture developed because of ductile failure. The results suggest that a single overloading event causing ductile fracture of ProTaper instruments is the most common fracture mechanism encountered under the clinical conditions.

**Wei et al.**<sup>3</sup> investigated the mode of fracture of ProTaper rotary instruments after clinical use and compared stereomicroscopy with scanning electron microscope (SEM) to determine which is better for confirming the mode of material failure. In all, 100 fractured ProTaper instruments were examined under stereomicroscope for the

presence of plastic deformation along the cutting edge near the fracture site. Fractographic and longitudinal examinations were carried out at high power magnification with SEM. Stereomicroscopy revealed 88 flexural cases and 12 torsional cases. Fractomicrographs verified 91 flexural cases with fatigue striations and three torsional cases with circular abrasion marks. Six instruments showed characteristics of both flexural and torsional failure. Cracks, microcracks and pittings were common findings on longitudinal micrographs. This study demonstrated that inspecting the fractured surface at high magnification by SEM is a better method to reveal the mode of Ni-Ti rotary instrument separation.

**Ounsi et al.**<sup>4</sup> studied the effect of clinical use on the cyclic fatigue resistance of ProTaper nickel-titanium rotary instruments. The resistance of ProTaper nickel-titanium rotary instruments to cyclic fatigue was examined after their initial use in straight or curved canals in vivo. These instruments were rotated freely inside a steel phantom until separation. The number of rotations before failure and the lengths of the separated fragments were compared with data derived from new instruments under the same experimental setup. With the exception of F1 and F3, instruments previously used in curved canals were more susceptible to cyclic fatigue than those previously used in straight canals. Separation occurred predominantly at the D10 to D12 level. For the F series, a negative correlation was observed between the number of rotations before failure and the file diameters at their separation levels. ProTaper F3 instruments are highly susceptible to cyclic fatigue failure and should be reused with caution

irrespective of whether they are initially used for shaping straight or curved canals.

**Whipple et al.**<sup>5</sup> compared cyclic fatigue resistance of ProTaper Universal and V-Taper (Guidance Endo, Albuquerque, NM). Files were measured while rotating around a 5-mm radius curve with 90° of maximum flexure at 250 rpm with a continuous axial oscillation of 4 mm at 1 Hz. The number of cycles to failure was calculated and analyzed. For the instruments tested, the ProTaper files appeared to resist fracture better than the V-Taper files.

**Lopes et al.**<sup>6</sup> evaluated the effects of rotational speed on the number of cycles to fracture of ProTaper Universal instruments F3 and F4. They were used in an artificial curved canal under rotational speeds of 300 rpm or 600 rpm. The number of cycles required to fracture was recorded. Fractured surfaces and the helical shafts of the fractured instruments were analyzed by scanning electron microscopy. The results showed approximately a 30% reduction in the observed number of cycles to fracture as rotational speed was increased from 300 to 600 RPM. The morphology of the fractured surface was always of ductile type, and no plastic deformation was observed on the helical shaft of fractured instruments.

**Shen et al.**<sup>7</sup> investigated the mode of failure of ProTaper, ProTaper for Hand Use and K3 that separated during clinical use. A total of 79 fractured instruments were collected from three endodontic clinics over 16 months. The fracture surface of each fragment was examined by scanning electron microscope. Most of the rotary instruments (78% of K3 and 66% of ProTaper) failed