



Cairo University

PROGRESSIVE COLLAPSE ASSESSMENT FOR MULTI-STORY STEEL STRUCTURES UNDER SEISMIC LOADING

By

Yara Maged Mahmoud Soliman

A Thesis Submitted to the
Faculty of Engineering at Cairo University
in Partial Fulfillment of the
Requirements for the Degree of

**MASTER OF SCIENCE
in
Structural Engineering**

**FACULTY OF ENGINEERING, CAIRO
UNIVERSITY
GIZA, EGYPT
2017**

PROGRESSIVE COLLAPSE ASSESSMENT FOR MULTI-STORY STEEL STRUCTURES UNDER SEISMIC LOADING

By

Yara Maged Mahmoud Soliman

A Thesis Submitted to the
Faculty of Engineering at Cairo University
in Partial Fulfillment of the
Requirements for the Degree of

**MASTER OF SCIENCE
in
Structural Engineering**

Under the Supervision of

Prof. Dr. Sherif Ahmed Mourad

.....

Professor of Steel Structures

Structural Engineering Department

Faculty of Engineering, Cairo University

Prof. Dr. Hesham Sobhy Sayed

.....

Professor of Steel Structures

Structural Engineering Department

Faculty of Engineering, Cairo University

Dr. Maha Moddather

.....

Assistant Professor

Structural Engineering Department

Faculty of Engineering, Cairo University

**FACULTY OF ENGINEERING, CAIRO UNIVERSITY
GIZA, EGYPT
2017**

PROGRESSIVE COLLAPSE ASSESSMENT FOR MULTI-STORY STEEL STRUCTURES UNDER SEISMIC LOADING

**By
Yara Maged Mahmoud Soliman**

A Thesis Submitted to the
Faculty of Engineering at Cairo University
in Partial Fulfillment of the
Requirements for the Degree of

**MASTER OF SCIENCE
in
Structural Engineering**

Approved by the examining committee:

Prof. Dr. Sherif Ahmed Mourad

Professor, Structural Engineering Department
Faculty of Engineering, Cairo University

.....

Prof. Dr. Hesham Sobhy Sayed

Professor, Structural Engineering Department
Faculty of Engineering, Cairo University

.....

Prof. Dr. Ahmed Farouk Hassan

Professor, Structural Engineering Department
Faculty of Engineering, Cairo University

.....

Prof. Dr. Mohamed Abdel Kader Elaghoury

Professor, Structural Engineering Department
Faculty of Engineering, Ain Shams University

.....

**FACULTY OF ENGINEERING, CAIRO UNIVERSITY
GIZA, EGYPT
2017**

Engineer's Name: Yara Maged Mahmoud Soliman
Date of Birth: 1/10/1990
Nationality: Egyptian
E-mail: yara_maged@hotmail.com
Phone: 01150113302
Address: El-Sheikh Zayed, Giza, Egypt
Registration Date: 1/10/2012
Awarding Date:/....../ 2017.
Degree: Master of Science
Department: Structural Engineering



Supervisors:
Prof. Sherif Ahmed Mourad
Prof. Hesham Sobhy Sayed
Assist. Prof. Maha Moddather

Examiners:
Prof. Sherif Ahmed Mourad
Prof. Hesham Sobhy Sayed
Prof. Ahmed Farouk Hassan
Prof. Mohamed Abdel Kader Elaghoury (Professor-
Structural Engineering- Ain Shams University)

Title of Thesis:

PROGRESSIVE COLLAPSE ASSESSMENT FOR MULTI-STORY STEEL
STRUCTURES UNDER SEISMIC LOADING

Key Words:

Progressive collapse; Moment Resisting Frames; Braced Frames; Column Removal;
Seismic Loads.

Summary:

The progressive collapse of steel structures is initiated when one or more vertical load carrying members are removed. The building's applied loads transfer to neighboring columns in the structure, leads to the failure of partial or whole structural system. In this study, two types of steel structures are evaluated as per Unified Facilities Criteria (UFC) guidelines. Non-linear dynamic analysis is carried out using software SAP2000. Gravity Loads and Seismic Loads combinations were applied to the structures to study the progressive collapse resistance of each structure.

Acknowledgments

First and above of all, I have to thank Allah providing me with the opportunity to meet such helpful and wonderful people those who helped me from the start of this thesis. All praises to Allah for giving me knowledge, strength, support and patience to present this work.

I would like to express my deepest sense of gratitude to my respectable supervisors; **Prof. Dr. Sherif Ahmed Mourad, Prof. Dr. Hesham Sobhy Sayed** and **Dr. Maha Moddather**; who offered me the honor to be one of their students. I thank them for their continuous advice and encouragement, guidance, extreme caring, and great effort to provide me with an excellent atmosphere for doing this research.

It gives me pleasure to thank my dear husband. He is always my source of strength, and without his support, this thesis would never have started much less finished.

Of course, I can't forget all my sisters and my brother. They were so patient throughout the thesis journey and they were my backbone in all times.

Finally; I would like to thank all my friends and colleagues for supporting me and being by my side in all times.

Hoping this thesis would be a step towards a better understanding of our current needs and a better development of our country.

Yara M.M.

Dedication

I lovingly dedicate this work to *my father* and *my mother*, for their care, guidance, help and patience. I do believe that, I could not success in all my life steps without their continuous support and prayers. May Allah bless them

Table of Contents

Acknowledgments.....	i
Dedication	ii
Table of Contents	iii
List of Tables	vii
List of Figures	viii
List of Abbreviations and Symbols.....	xvi
Abstract	xvii
Chapter 1 : Introduction	1
1.1. General	1
1.2. Objective	3
1.3. Outline of the thesis.....	3
Chapter 2 : Literature Review	4
2.1. Introduction	4
2.2. Progressive Collapse Definition.....	4
2.3. Causes of Progressive Collapse.....	4
2.4. Previous Research on Progressive Collapse.....	5
2.4.1. Previous Research on Progressive Collapse for Gravity-Loaded Structures	6
2.4.2. Previous Research on Progressive Collapse due to Seismic Loads	8
2.5. Codes and Standards	9
2.5.1. New York City Building Code.....	9
2.5.2. National Building Code of Canada (NBC)	9
2.5.3. American Society of Civil Engineers (ASCE 7).....	10
2.5.4. American Concrete Institute (ACI 318).....	10
2.5.5. General Service Administration Progressive Collapse Guidelines 2003	10
2.5.6. Department of Defense (DoD), Unified Facilities Criteria (UFC).....	11
2.6. Progressive Collapse Design Methods.....	14
2.6.1. Direct Design Approach.....	14
2.6.1.1. Alternate Load Path Method.....	15
2.6.1.2. Specific Local Resistance Method	15
2.6.2. Indirect Design Approach	15

2.6.2.1.	Tie Force Approach	15
2.7.	Methods of Analysis for Progressive Collapse	15
2.7.1.	Linear Static Method.....	16
2.7.2.	Nonlinear Static Method	16
2.7.3.	Linear Dynamic Method	16
2.7.4.	Non-linear Dynamic Method	17
2.8.	Progressive Collapse Analysis Programs.....	17
2.8.1.	Extreme Loading for Structures	17
2.8.2.	FLEX.....	17
2.8.3.	LS-DYNA	18
2.8.4.	SAP2000, ETABS and PERFORM 3D.....	18
Chapter 3 :	Methodology	19
3.1.	Introduction	19
3.2.	Case Study.....	19
3.2.1.	Details of the studied structures	19
3.2.2.	Material Properties	23
3.2.3.	Loads	25
3.2.4.	Earthquake Loading Assumptions	26
3.2.5.	Earthquake Simulation	26
3.2.6.	Parametric Study Variables.....	29
3.3.	Verification Example	29
3.3.1.	Structural Steel Frame Example.....	29
3.3.2.	Modeling assumptions.....	30
3.3.3.	Loading assumptions.....	30
3.3.4.	Method of Analysis	30
3.3.5.	Results	31
Chapter 4 :	Analysis Results	33
4.1.	Introduction	33
4.2.	Moment Resisting Frames.....	33
4.2.1.	Corner Column Removal	33
4.2.1.1.	Column Removal under gravity load combination for the 5-stories building.....	33
4.2.1.2.	Column Removal under seismic load combination for the 5-stories building.	35
4.2.1.3.	Column Removal under gravity load combination for the 7-stories building.....	37
4.2.1.4.	Column Removal under seismic load combination for the 7-stories building.	39

4.2.1.5.	Column Removal under gravity load combination for the 10-stories building.	41
4.2.1.6.	Column Removal under seismic load combination for the 10-stories building.	43
4.2.2.	Edge Column Removal	46
4.2.2.1.	Column Removal under gravity load combination for the 5-stories building.	46
4.2.2.2.	Column Removal under seismic load combination for the 5-stories building.	48
4.2.2.3.	Column Removal under gravity load combination for the 7-stories building.	50
4.2.2.4.	Column Removal under seismic load combination for the 7-stories building.	52
4.2.2.5.	Column Removal under gravity load combination for the 10-stories building.	54
4.2.2.6.	Column Removal under seismic load combination for the 10-stories building.	56
4.2.3.	Interior Column Removal.....	58
4.2.3.1.	Column Removal under gravity load combination for the 5-stories building.	58
4.2.3.2.	Column Removal under seismic load combination for the 5-stories building.	60
4.2.3.3.	Column Removal from under gravity load combination for the 7-stories building. ..	62
4.2.3.4.	Column Removal under seismic load combination for the 7-stories building.	64
4.2.3.5.	Column Removal under gravity load combination for the 10-stories building.	66
4.2.3.6.	Column Removal under seismic load combination for the 10-stories building.	68
4.3.	Braced Frames.....	70
4.3.1.	Corner Column Removal	70
4.3.1.1.	Column Removal under gravity load combination for the 5-stories building.	70
4.3.1.2.	Column Removal under seismic load combination for the 5-stories building.	72
4.3.1.3.	Column Removal under gravity load combination for the 7-stories building.	73
4.3.1.4.	Column Removal under seismic load combination for the 7-stories building.	76
4.3.1.5.	Column Removal under gravity load combination for the 10-stories building.	78
4.3.1.6.	Column Removal under seismic load combination for the 10-stories building.	80
4.3.2.	Edge Column Removal	82
4.3.2.1.	Column Removal under gravity load combination for the 5-stories building.	82
4.3.2.2.	Column Removal under seismic load combination for the 5-stories building.	84
4.3.2.3.	Column Removal under gravity load combination for the 7-stories building.	86
4.3.2.4.	Column Removal under seismic load combination for the 7-stories building.	88
4.3.2.5.	Column Removal under gravity load combination for the 10-stories building.	90
4.3.2.6.	Column Removal under seismic load combination for the 10-stories building.	92
4.3.3.	Interior Column Removal.....	94
4.3.3.1.	Column Removal under gravity load combination for the 5-stories building.	94
4.3.3.2.	Column Removal under seismic load combination for the 5-stories building.	96

4.3.3.3.	Column Removal under gravity load combination for the 7-stories building.	98
4.3.3.4.	Column Removal under seismic load combination for the 7-stories building.	101
4.3.3.5.	Column Removal under gravity load combination for the 10-stories building.	104
4.3.3.6.	Column Removal under seismic load combination for the 10-stories building.	106
4.3.4.	Edge Column with Adjacent Bracing Removal	109
4.3.4.1.	Column Removal under gravity load combination for the 5-stories building.	109
4.3.4.2.	Column Removal under seismic load combination for the 5-stories building.	111
4.3.4.3.	Column Removal under gravity load combination for the 7-stories building.	114
4.3.4.4.	Column Removal under seismic load combination for the 7-stories building.	116
4.3.4.5.	Column Removal under gravity load combination for the 10-stories building.	119
4.3.4.6.	Column Removal under seismic load combination for the 10-stories building.	121
4.4.	Discussion of analysis results.....	124
4.4.1.	Moment Resisting Frames:.....	124
4.4.1.1.	Satisfying the UFC guidelines requirements:.....	124
4.4.1.2.	Effect of the removed column location on the maximum displacement	124
4.4.1.3.	Effect of no. of stories on the maximum displacement	125
4.4.1.4.	Effect of load combination on the maximum displacement	125
4.4.2.	Braced Frames :.....	126
4.4.2.1.	Satisfying the UFC guidelines requirements :.....	126
4.4.2.2.	Effect of the location of the removed column on the maximum displacement.....	126
4.4.2.3.	Effect of no. of stories on the maximum displacement	126
4.4.2.4.	Effect of load combination on the maximum displacement:.....	127
Chapter 5 :	Summary, Conclusion and Recommendations	128
5.1.	Summary	128
5.2.	Conclusions	129
5.3.	Recommendations for future studies.....	130
References		131
Appendix A		134
	الفصل الأول : المقدمة.....	1
	الفصل الثاني :المراجع والدراسات السابقة.....	1
	الفصل الثالث : الخطة البحثية.....	1
	الفصل الرابع : النتائج.....	1

List of Tables

Table (2-1)	Occupancy Categories.....	12
Table (2-2)	Occupancy Categories and design requirements.....	12
Table (2-3)	Deformation limits for steel.....	13
Table (3-1)	Design Table for 5-stories of Moment Resisting Frames Structures.....	21
Table (3-2)	Design Table for 5-stories of Braced Frames Structures.....	23
Table (3-3)	Member size of modelled structure.....	30
Table (3-4)	Results of SAP2000 model vs OpenSees model.....	31
Table (5-1)	The analysis cases that have been studied.....	119
Table (A.1)	Design Table for 7-stories of Moment Resisting Frames Structures.....	133
Table (A.2)	Design Table for 7-stories of Braced Frames Structures.....	134
Table (A.3)	Design Table for 10-stories of Moment Resisting Frames Structures.....	135
Table (A.4)	Design Table for 10-stories of Braced Frames Structures.....	136

List of Figures

Figure (1-1)	Ronan Point Failure.....	1
Figure (1-2)	Murrah Federal Building Failure.....	1
Figure (1-3)	World Trade Center Collapse on 11 September 2011.....	2
Figure (1-4)	The Kaiser Permanente Building, the Northridge earthquake.....	2
Figure (1-5)	Beichuan branch of the ‘Agriculture Development Bank in China’ after Beichuan earthquake in 2008.....	2
Figure (2-1)	Causes of Progressive Collapse.....	5
Figure (2-2)	GSA (2003) Recommendations for column removal for buildings.....	11
Figure (2-3)	Tie Forces in a frame structure.....	13
Figure (2-4)	Progressive Collapse Design Approach Diagram.....	14
Figure (3-1)	3D view for the 5-stories of Moment Resisting Frames.....	20
Figure (3-2)	Elevation view for the 5-stories of Moment Resisting Frames.....	20
Figure (3-3)	Plan view for Moment Resisting Frames.....	21
Figure (3-4)	3D view for the 5-stories of Braced Frames.....	22
Figure (3-5)	Elevation view for the 5-stories of Braced Frames.....	22
Figure (3-6)	Plan view for Braced Frames.....	23
Figure (3-7)	Stress-Strain Curve for St-37 in SAP2000.....	24
Figure (3-8)	Plastic Hinge Definition for Beams in SAP2000.....	24
Figure (3-9)	Column Removal Procedure for Dynamic Analysis.....	25
Figure (3-10)	Time History Function used to model sudden column loss.....	25
Figure (3-11)	Time History Function Definition in SAP2000.....	26
Figure (3-12)	The response spectrum from the ECP.....	26
Figure (3-13)	Generated Earthquake from the Response Spectrum of the structure.....	27
Figure (3-14)	Intensity Function used to simulate transient character of real earthquakes.....	27
Figure (3-15)	Input data for the SeismoArtif software.....	28
Figure (3-16)	Output data for the SeismoArtif Software.....	28
Figure (3-17)	Steel Building Elevation.....	30
Figure (3-18)	Column Removal Location.....	31
Figure (3-19)	Deformation and Hinge Formation after column removal (Paper).....	32
Figure (3-20)	Deformation and Hinge Formation after column removal (SAP2000 model).....	32
Figure (4-1)	Displacement of joint above the removed column due to removal of corner column under gravity load.....	34

Figure (4-2)	Deformed shape along axis (1) due to removal of corner column under gravity load.....	34
Figure (4-3)	Maximum bending moments in beams along axis (1) after column removal due to removal of corner column under gravity load.....	35
Figure (4-4)	Displacement of joint above the removed column due to removal of corner column under seismic load.....	36
Figure (4-5)	Deformed shape along axis (1) due to removal of corner column under seismic load.....	36
Figure (4-6)	Maximum bending moments in beams along axis (1) after column removal due to removal of corner column under seismic load.....	37
Figure (4-7)	Displacement of joint above the removed column due to removal of corner column under gravity load.....	38
Figure (4-8)	Deformed shape along axis (1) due to removal of corner column under gravity load.....	38
Figure (4-9)	Maximum bending moments in beams along axis (1) after column removal due to removal of corner column under gravity load.....	39
Figure (4-10)	Displacement of joint above the removed column due to removal of corner column under seismic load.....	40
Figure (4-11)	Deformed shape along axis (1) due to removal of corner column under seismic load.....	40
Figure (4-12)	Maximum bending moments in beams along axis (1) after column removal due to removal of corner column under seismic load.....	41
Figure (4-13)	Displacement of joint above the removed column due to removal of corner column under gravity load.....	42
Figure (4-14)	Deformed shape along axis (1) due to removal of corner column under gravity load.....	42
Figure (4-15)	Maximum bending moments in beams along axis (1) after column removal due to removal of corner column under gravity load.....	43
Figure (4-16)	Displacement of joint above the removed column due to removal of corner column under seismic load.....	44
Figure (4-17)	Deformed shape along axis (1) due to removal of corner column under seismic load.....	44
Figure (4-18)	Maximum bending moments in beams along axis (1) after column removal due to removal of corner column under seismic load.....	45
Figure (4-19)	Displacement of joint above the removed column due to removal of edge column under gravity load.....	46
Figure (4-20)	Deformed shape along axis (1) due to removal of edge column under gravity load.....	46
Figure (4-21)	Maximum bending moments in beams along axis (1) after column removal due to removal of edge column under gravity load.....	47
Figure (4-22)	Displacement of joint above the removed column due to removal of edge column under seismic load.....	48
Figure (4-23)	Deformed shape along axis (1) due to removal of edge column under seismic load.....	48
Figure (4-24)	Maximum bending moments in beams along axis (1) after column removal due to removal of edge column under seismic load.....	49

Figure (4-25)	Displacement of joint above the removed column due to removal of edge column under gravity load.....	50
Figure (4-26)	Deformed shape along axis (1) due to removal of edge column under gravity load.....	50
Figure (4-27)	Maximum bending moments in beams along axis (1) after column removal due to removal of edge column under gravity load.....	51
Figure (4-28)	Displacement of joint above the removed column due to removal of edge column under seismic load.....	52
Figure (4-29)	Deformed shape along axis (1) due to removal of edge column under seismic load.....	52
Figure (4-30)	Maximum bending moments in beams along axis (1) after column removal due to removal of edge column under seismic load.....	53
Figure (4-31)	Displacement of joint above the removed column due to removal of edge column under gravity load.....	54
Figure (4-32)	Deformed shape along axis (1) due to removal of edge column under gravity load.....	54
Figure (4-33)	Maximum bending moments in beams along axis (1) after column removal due to removal of edge column under gravity load.....	55
Figure (4-34)	Displacement of joint above the removed column due to removal of edge column under seismic load.....	56
Figure (4-35)	Deformed shape along axis (1) due to removal of edge column under seismic load.....	56
Figure (4-36)	Maximum bending moments in beams along axis (1) after column removal due to removal of edge column under seismic load.....	57
Figure (4-37)	Displacement of joint above the removed column due to removal of interior column under gravity load.....	58
Figure (4-38)	Deformed shape along axis (2) due to removal of interior column under gravity load.....	58
Figure (4-39)	Maximum bending moments in beams along axis (2) after column removal due to removal of interior column under gravity load.....	59
Figure (4-40)	Displacement of joint above the removed column due to removal of interior column under seismic load.....	60
Figure (4-41)	Deformed shape along axis (2) due to removal of interior column under seismic load.....	60
Figure (4-42)	Maximum bending moments in beams along axis (2) after column removal due to removal of interior column under seismic load.....	61
Figure (4-43)	Displacement of joint above the removed column due to removal of interior column under gravity load.....	62
Figure (4-44)	Deformed shape along axis (2) due to removal of interior column under gravity load.....	62
Figure (4-45)	Maximum bending moments in beams along axis (2) after column removal due to removal of interior column under gravity load.....	63
Figure (4-46)	Displacement of joint above the removed column due to removal of interior column under seismic load.....	64
Figure (4-47)	Deformed shape along axis (2) due to removal of interior column under seismic load.....	64

Figure (4-48)	Maximum bending moments in beams along axis (2) after column removal due to removal of interior column under seismic load.....	65
Figure (4-49)	Displacement of joint above the removed column due to removal of interior column under gravity load.....	66
Figure (4-50)	Deformed shape along axis (2) due to removal of interior column under gravity load.....	66
Figure (4-51)	Maximum bending moments in beams along axis (2) after column removal due to removal of interior column under gravity load.....	67
Figure (4-52)	Displacement of joint above the removed column due to removal of interior column under seismic load.....	68
Figure (4-53)	Deformed shape along axis (2) due to removal of interior column under seismic load.....	68
Figure (4-54)	Maximum bending moments in beams along axis (2) after column removal due to removal of interior column under seismic load.....	69
Figure (4-55)	Displacement of joint above the removed column due to removal of corner column under gravity load.....	70
Figure (4-56)	Deformed shape along axis (1) due to removal of corner column under gravity load.....	70
Figure (4-57)	Maximum bending moments in beams along axis (1) after column removal due to removal of corner column under gravity load.....	71
Figure (4-58)	Displacement of joint above the removed column due to removal of corner column under seismic load.....	72
Figure (4-59)	Deformed shape along axis (1) due to removal of corner column under seismic load.....	72
Figure (4-60)	Maximum bending moments in beams along axis (1) after column removal due to removal of corner column under seismic load.....	73
Figure (4-61)	Displacement of joint above the removed column due to removal of corner column under gravity load.....	73
Figure (4-62)	Deformed shape along axis (1) due to removal of corner column under gravity load.....	74
Figure (4-63)	Maximum bending moments in beams along axis (1) after column removal due to removal of corner column under gravity load.....	75
Figure (4-64)	Displacement of joint above the removed column due to removal of corner column under seismic load.....	76
Figure (4-65)	Deformed shape along axis (1) due to removal of corner column under seismic load.....	76
Figure (4-66)	Maximum bending moments in beams along axis (1) after column removal due to removal of corner column under seismic load.....	77
Figure (4-67)	Displacement of joint above the removed column due to removal of corner column under gravity load.....	78
Figure (4-68)	Deformed shape along axis (1) due to removal of corner column under gravity load.....	78
Figure (4-69)	Maximum bending moments in beams along axis (1) after column removal due to removal of corner column under gravity load.....	79
Figure (4-70)	Displacement of joint above the removed column due to removal of corner column under seismic load.....	80