



Ain Shams University
Faculty of Women for
Arts Science and Education
Department of English Language and Literature

Componential Analysis of Two English Translations of Surat Maryam: (A Contrastive Study)

**An M.A. Dissertation in Linguistics
Submitted to the Department of English Language
and Literature**

**Faculty of Women for Arts Science and Education
Ain Shams University**

**By
Esraa Aly Hasab El-Nabi**

Under the Supervision of

**Dr. Mona Anwar Ahmed Wahsh
Associate Professor of English Literature
Faculty of Women for Arts, Science and Education
Ain Shams University**

**And
Dr. Soheir Gamal Mahfouz
Associate Professor of Linguistics and Translation
Faculty of Al-Asun
Ain Shams University**

2014

Acknowledgments

It would not have been possible to write this M.A thesis without the help and support of the kind people around me, to only some of whom it is possible to give particular mention.

First of all, I would like to express my sincere gratitude to my supervisors, Dr. Soheir Mahfouz and Dr. Mona Wahsh, for their continuous support, patience, advice and encouragement throughout the course of the thesis.

Special thanks are due to my husband Dr. Mohammed Abd El-Ghaffar Helal for his kindness and support he has shown during the years it has taken to finalize this thesis. Above all, I would like to thank my parents for their endless love and support and encouragement throughout my life.

Finally, I want to dedicate my effort in this thesis to my lovely daughters Lina and Saja for being in my life.

List of symbols:

□	□
□	a
□	b
□	t
□	□
□	J
□	□
□	□
□	d
□	□
□	r
□	z
□	s
□	š
□	□
□	□
□	□
□	□
□	'
□	ġ
□	f
□	q
□	k
□	l
□	m
□	n
□	h
□	w - o
□	y - i

List of abbreviations:

CA: Componential Analysis

ST: Source Text

TT1: Target Text 1

TT2: Target Text 2

SL: Source Language

TL: Target Language

Sb: somebody

Sth: something

Table of Contents:

Introduction.....	1
Chapter One : Review of the Literature.....	9
Chapter Two: Componential Analysis Theory.....	40
Chapter Three : Application.....	71
Findings.....	172
Conclusion.....	179
Appendix 1.....	183
References.....	206

Abstract

This thesis examines the accuracy in the choice of diction in Yousuf Ali's and Al-Hilali-Khan's translation of Surat Maryam. Componential Analysis Theory is the framework within which this accuracy is examined. Throughout the analysis, special attention is given to the denotative and connotative meanings of the lexical items translated different. The study is organized as follows: Chapter one discusses the nature of Islamic studies, in addition to different kinds of meanings, especially denotative and connotative meanings. Chapter two gives an outline of the theory of Componential analysis. Chapter three is an application of the Componential Analysis Theory to both Yousuf Ali's and Al-Hilali-Khan's translations of Surat Maryam. Finally, the conclusion presents the findings of the study and shows which translation is more accurate on the word level.

Introduction

This thesis is a contrastive linguistic study of two different translations of Surat Maryam (Surah no.19 in the Glorious Qur'an). The applied part of the study is based on Componential Analysis Theory advocated by Katz and Fodor (1963)

Aim of the Study:

It aims at finding out whether the translators are accurate in their lexical choices or not, a fact that affects the understanding of the non-Arabic speaking readers of the Glorious Qur'an. This research studies two different translations of the Qur'an done by Abdullah Yousuf Ali and Al-Hilali-Khan (Muhammad Muhsin Khan, and Muhammad Taqi-ud-Din Al-Hilali). Those translators are chosen as they represent different nationalities.

The study begins by looking up the denotative and connotative meanings of the words that are translated differently. First, the study shows the denotative meaning of the word in the Arabic text, depending most probably on *Al-Waseet Dictionary*, and then shows its connotative meaning in the minds of the Arabic readers. Then, it decomposes it into its lexical features using the Componential Analysis Theory advocated by Katz and Fodor (1963). Second, it shows the denotative meanings of the translations of the same word in the two translations, in addition to their connotative meanings, and also decomposes each of them into its lexical features, depending on the same Theory used with the Arabic word. Finally, a contrast of the lexical features of every English word with that of the Arabic is done to show the most accurate choice.

It is worth mentioning, however, that verse translations will be examined separately, but the difference in lexical choice will be shown and the Componential Analysis of this difference will be applied to get the most accurate translation.

Significance of the Study:

Indeed, the field of Islamic studies is nowadays receiving great interest from researchers all over the world, whether Muslims or not. The Glorious Qur'an has different translations in many languages. Translation of the Glorious Qur'an is an interpretation of the meanings of the holy book of Islam into different languages other than Arabic. Actually, the Glorious Qur'an has been translated into most of the African, Asian and European languages. There are many translations into the same language.

Generally, the translation of the Glorious Qur'an has always been a problematic and difficult issue in Islamic theology. Indeed, the reason for this is the fact that Muslims consider the Glorious Qur'anic text a miracle that can hardly be reproduced in another language. However, making an accurate translation of this text is very difficult, due to the range of meanings of every word depending on the context.

According to Muslims, the Glorious Qur'an is revelation very specifically in Arabic and should only be recited in Arabic. They always think that translation is a kind of human work that can never possess the sacred character of the Arabic language. From their point of view, the translation into any language must change the meaning, That is why they called it either "interpretation of the Glorious Qur'an" or "translations of the meanings of the Glorious Qur'an".

That is why lexical analysis of the Glorious Qur'an requires a minute and careful analysis and deep investigation, into the general cultural situation into the age and people, in addition to a deep linguistic knowledge. Actually, the meaning of a word is nothing but a concrete manifestation or crystallization of the spirit of the culture and a reflection of the psychological state of the people who use the word as part of their vocabulary.

Indeed, the task of the translation itself is not an easy one, besides, the Glorious Qur'an, as an original text, is very difficult even for native speakers to understand it in Arabic. Consequently, this leads to the fact that a single word can have a variety of meanings, which leads to a certain element of human judgment involved in understanding and translating the text. That is why this thesis depends on analysis the "tafsir" (interpretation) of Arabic scholars, and then checking the denotative and connotative meanings of the Arabic word in the original text, and then those of the two English ones to reach the most accurate translation. Thus, at that point it is clear that in translating the Glorious Qur'an, the holy book addressed to all peoples in all times, the main aim is to convey both the connotative and denotative meanings, as much as the (TL) allows.

Actually, Surat Maryam is the 19th in the holy Qur'an in order. It was revealed in Mecca, Arabia to Prophet Muhammad (Peace Be upon Him). Indeed, this Surah takes its name from the verse 16. The total number of its verses is 98.

Surat Maryam begins by the story of the birth of Yahya the son of Zakareya. Indeed, Zakareya was very old and his wife was barren. Despite

that, he asked Allah to grant him a son. Then, the surah narrates the story of Maryam and the birth of Eissa. In the following verses, the surah relates the story of Ibrahim, his advice to his father to worship Allah and refrain from worshipping idols, then shows the discussion between him and his father about the dominance of Satan.

The surah then refers to the progeny of Ibrahim – namely prophets Ismail, Ishaq and their descendants, and then mentions Idris. The surah then talks about the successors who came after the prophets, both the righteous and the sinful. Then, the surah refers to the fact that Paradise is the reward for believers and Fire is the punishment for disbelievers. The Surah then shows the status of disbelievers in Hell.

Finally, the surah shows the status of the Glorious Qur'an, warns disbelievers, and gives parables of the destruction of the sinful who did not follow the prophets, pointing out that the disbelievers will be destroyed.

Denotative meaning of a word is its specific and basic meaning, it is the meaning in the dictionary. In contrast, connotative meaning of a word is an idea that is suggested by or associated with a word. In other words, denotation is the literal meaning of a word, while connotation is what is initially hidden. Indeed, as many linguists refer, connotative meanings change from age to age and from society to society.

The connotative meaning sometimes represents more difficulty to the translator than the denotative. This happens when some words in the SL may have no accurate connotations in the TL words. In other cases, a word may have positive connotations in one language and negative ones in another. Thus, observing the connotative meaning beside the denotative

helps the translator to choose the most accurate translation among a list of synonyms.

That is why the inaccuracy in checking the connotative meaning of a word leads to loss in the translation. Since translation is nothing but an imitation of or a recreation of the original, deciding the connotative meaning beside the denotative is very important.

Both denotative and connotative meanings are difficult to find. This is because every language has related pairs of words which are distinguished from each other by only one single component. This component, as Nida refers to it, and as will be shown later on, is termed as "semantic component". This semantic component is used to distinguish one word from another. Thus, if the translator has to translate accurately, he/she has to find first the semantic components of the words. This means that a translator's failure to convey any of the two meanings may affect the reader's comprehension, and consequently, his attitude towards Islam and Muslims.

After observing both the denotative and connotative meanings of both the ST and the TTs, the Componential Analysis will be applied. The componential Analysis is an approach advocated in the work of Katz and Fodor (1963) (as cited in Fodor 1977), as well as a number of recent approaches in lexical semantics.

Componential Analysis Theory is a method of analyzing the meanings of words used in the ST in order to make the choice of corresponding lexical items in the TT. Thus, it is a theory that attempts at breaking a word rather than decomposing a word into its components. Thus, to

represent a meaning of a word is to try to break it into different elements or components. However, this process is called "lexical decomposition". The core of this theory is that all items of meaning can be decomposed into a combination of semantic features which combine together to give this meaning.

Indeed, Componential Analysis in linguistics is not the same in translation. In translation, the translator has to analyze the word through the context according to its TL sense components. At this point, CAs are represented in the form of equations in the mind of the translator. Thus, using these kinds of equations gives the translator the ability to differentiate between synonyms especially when we are talking about a holy book in which there will be a higher accuracy in the usage of diction.

This research studies two different translations of the Glorious Qur'an done by Abdullah Yousuf Ali and Al-Hilali- Khan (Muhammad Muhsin Khan, and Muhammad Taqi-ud-Din Al-Hilali). Those translators are chosen as they represent different linguistic backgrounds.

Abdullah Yousuf Ali is an Indian Islamic scholar who translated the Qur'an into English. Among numerous translations, his translation of the Glorious Qur'an is one of the most widely known and used by the English-speaking readers. He received a religious education to the extent that he could recite the Glorious Qur'an by heart. Indeed, the reason for his brilliant translation is his fluent English and Arabic. Moreover, he concentrated his efforts on the Glorious Qur'an and including the Glorious Qur'anic commentaries beginning with those written in the early days of Islamic history. Yousuf Ali started his work on the translation in 1934

and completed it four years later. ("Searching for Solace", 1995). The second translation in this thesis is Al-Hilali-Khan's translation which is translated by with Dr Muhammad Muhsin Khan along with Dr Muhammad Taqi-ud-Din Al-Hilali.

Dr Muhammad Taqi-ud-Din bin Abdil-Qadir Al-Hilali was a 20th century Islamic scholar from Morocco. Al-Hilali studied Arabic grammar in addition to Tajweed and other Arabic knowledge of Hadeeth. Besides, he memorized the Glorious Qur'an by heart when he was twelve years old.. ("Biography of Dr Muhammad Taqi-Ud-Din Al-Hilali", n.d.)

Al-Hilali worked with Muhammad Muhsin Khan who is a contemporary Islamic scholar of Afghan origin, in the English translation of the meanings of the Qur'an and Sahih Al-Bukhari. Their translation of the Glorious Qur'an has been described as an ambitious, incorporating commentary from Tafsir al-Tabari, Tafsir ibn Kathir, Tafsir Al-Qurtubi and Sahih Al-Bukhari. Al-Hilali also translated the book Al-Lulu wa Al-Marjan into English during the period of his stay at the Islamic University of Madinah . ("Biography of Dr Muhammad Taqi-Ud-Din Al-Hilali", n.d.)

Chapterization:

Introduction

Chapter One- Review of Literature: Denotation and connotation

1.1 Denotative and Connotative meanings

1.2 Denotative , connotative , and translation

1.2.1 Difficulties of translating denotative and connotative meanings

Chapter Two-Methodology: Componential Analysis Theory

2.1 Application of Componential Analysis Theory

2.2 Componential Analysis Theory in Translation Studies

Chapter Three- Practical Analysis

3.1 Componential Analysis of two English translations of Surat Maryam verse by verse.

Chapter One

Review of the Literature

1.1-Introduction:

The main purpose of this chapter is to explain the translation theory and its application to Islamic studies especially verses of the Glorious Qur'an. To this end, first the field of Islamic studies is illustrated. Later, the core of translation theory and different types of translations are clarified, in addition to the problem of non-equivalence with different attempts for finding solutions. Then, different types of meanings are discussed with special reference to the denotative and connotative meanings and their importance in the process of translation.

1.2-Islamic Studies:

The field of Islamic studies is nowadays receiving great interest from scholars all over the world, whether Muslims or not. Islamic studies refer generally to the historical study of Islam, Muslim culture, and Islamic philosophy and focusing specifically on the study of Qur'an. The Glorious Qur'an may be considered as the most important literary document in the Arabic language. Moreover, its vocabulary and idioms occupy a unique position in the world of literature.

Through the words of Qur'an, Muslims have expressed their joys and sorrows, and their deepest emotions and thoughts. The literary importance of the Glorious Qur'an is not only limited to its Arabic literature, but it is a