

Ain Shams University Faculty of Engineering

THE INTEGRATION BETWEEN EARNED VALUE MANAGEMENT AND RISK MANAGEMENT IN CONSTRUCTION PROJECTS

A thesis submitted for partial fulfilment of the requirements for award of Master of Science In Civil Engineering "Structural Engineering"

> Submitted By Mohamed Kamal Asaad Ibrahim

> > **Supervised By**

Prof. Dr. Ayman Hussein Hosni Khalil Professor of Structural Engineering Faculty of Engineering, Ain Shams University

Dr. Mohamed El-Mikawi Associate Professor of Structural Engineering Faculty of Engineering, Ain Shams University

Declaration

I certify that all the material in this thesis that is not my own work has been identified and that no material is included for which a degree has previously been conferred on me.

The contents of this thesis reflect my own personal views and are not necessarily endorsed by the University.

(Signature)

(Date)

Abstract

The success criterion of a project is to achieve the project objectives and scope of work within the

dedicated budget, targeted time and quality requirements. Various techniques have been developed

to monitor, control and evaluates the project cost and time performance. One of these widespread

techniques is the Earned Value Management technique which effectively measures the project

performance to date in the terms of cost and time. On the other hand, the Risk Management

technique is dedicated to address any future threats or opportunities.

Using each of the EVM and RM techniques without a systematic integration and synchonosization

of the data extracted from both techniques may mislead the project parties in the terms of

establishing the project measurement baseline, change management and the forecasting and

decision making processes. Hence, the need for a systematic integration between EVM and RM was

developed especially in the current crucial world wide economical circumstances.

The literature review was divided into Earned Value Management, Risk Management and the

integration process between both techniques, the methodology proposed a systematic steps for the

integration technique starting by establishing the project total budget, integrated baseline change

management, forecasting and decision making.

A case study for an existing project which used only Earned Value Management technique as

monitoring and control tool demonstrates the limitation of the Earned Value Management tool,

subsequently the systematic integration between Earned Value Management and Risk Management

was conducted resulting in improving the project performance.

A questionnaire was developed to understand the worldwide status of the application of the

integration between the Earned Value Management and the Risk Management and also addressed

the various benefits from the integration technique. The results of the questionnaire confirmed that

there are many added values gained from the integration technique in terms of cost and time

aspects.

In summary, the result of this research demonstrate that the integration between EVM and RM

generally improves the project management throughout the project life cycle.

Keywords: Earned Value Management, Risk Management, Integration

Ш

Dedication

I dedicate this thesis to my family. A special feeling of gratitude to my lovely and kind parents whose affection, love, encouragement and prays of day and night made me able to get such success and honour in addition to their moral support, their words of encouragement and push for tenacity were always ringing in my ears.

This thesis is also dedicated to friends and coworkers who have supported me throughout the process. I will always appreciate all they have done through advices and sharing of experiences.

I would like to sieze this opportunity to transmit warm thanks and gratitude to everyone who have been so supportive along the way of doing my thesis.

Acknowledgement

I would like to express my sincere gratitude to the head of the thesis committee Prof. Dr. Ayman Hussein Hosni Khalil - Professor of Structural Engineering - Ain Shams University for the continuous support of my M.sc study and related research, for his patience and immense knowledge. His guidance helped me in all the time of research and writing of this thesis.

My sincere gratitude goes to Dr. Mohamed El-Mikawi - Associate Professor of Structural Engineering - Ain Shams University, the thesis main advisor who expertly guided me throughout this research and have given me a deep appreciation and support. I am deeply grateful to his very valuable comments and guidance on this thesis.

Table of Contents

Chapter 1. Introduction	01
1.1 Background	01
1.2 Objective	03
1.3 Organization and Scope	03
Chapter 2. Literature Review	04
2.1 Earned Value Management	04
2.1.1 Earned Value Management Definition	06
2.1.2 Earned Value Management Concept	07
2.1.3 Earned Value Management Role	07
2.1.4 Earned Value Management Benefits	08
2.1.5 Earned Value Management Contribution to this Research	09
2.2 Risk Management	10
2.2.1 Risk Definition	11
2.2.2 Risk Management Definition	11
2.2.3 Risk Management Process	11
2.2.4 Risk Management Contribution to this Research	17
2.3 The Integration between Earned Value Management and Risk Management	17
2.4 Summary and Research Gap	26
Chapter Three: Methodology	27
3.1 Establish the Project Measurement Baseline	27
3.2 Develop an Integrated Baseline Change Management	30
3.3 Perform Analysis and Decision Making	32
3.4 The Practical Implementation of the EVM and RM	35
Chapter Four: Research Questionnaire and Hypothesis	40
5.1 Sample	40

5.2 Data Collection	40
5.3 Data Analysis	40
5.4 Validity and Reliability	40
5.5 Ethical Considerations	41
5.6 Results	41
5.7 Hypothesis Testing	62
5.9 Conclusion	66
Chapter Five: Case Study	69
4.1 Project Nature and Overview	69
4.2 Project Objectives and Success Criteria	69
4.3 Project Start and End Dates	69
4.4 Project Performance Measurement Baseline and Total Budget	69
4.5 Project Narrative and Issues	71
4.6 Project Cost Estimate at Completion	72
4.6.1 Overrun Quantities	74
4.6.2 Materials Prices Fluctuation	75
4.6.3 Currency Devaluation	75
4.6.4 Contract Prices Escalation	75
4.6.5 Additional Indirect Cost due to Project Schedule Prolongation	76
4.6.6 Summary of Cost Impacts	76
4.7 Project Monitoring and Controlling	77
4.8 Conclusion of the Project Cost Performance	79
4.9 Applying the Integration between EVM and RM to the Project	80
4.9.1 Establish the Project Measurement Baseline	80
4.9.2 Develop an Integrated Baseline Change Management	88
4.9.3 Perform Analysis and Decision Making	91
4.10 Summary and Conclusion	91

Chapter Six: Summary, Conclusion and Recommendations	94
6.1 Summary	94
6.2 Conclusion	94
6.3 Research Contribution	96
6.4 Recommendations for future research	96
References	98
APPENDIX A. SURVEY QUESTIONNAIRE	102

List of Figures

- Fig 2.1 Project performance control linkage by Earned Value.
- Fig 2.2 Benefits of Earned Value Management method as seen in a British survey.
- Fig 2.3 Risk Management and Earned Value Management the Synergy.
- Fig 2.4 Establishing of the PMB process using the integration between Earned Value Management and Risk Management.
- Fig 2.5 Establishing of the Project Baseline Spend Plan in Full Consideration of Defined Risks with the Ellipse Showing all Possible Outcomes.
- Fig 2.6 Output of Establishing the PMB Considering a Systematic Integration between Earned Value Management and Risk Management.
- Fig 2.7 Integrated Baseline Change Management Process.
- Fig 2.8 Transfer of work and associated budget between SRP and the PMB resulting from actions being transferred to and from the PMB.
- Fig 2.9 Risk Management action types indicated by Earned Value Management indices.
- Fig 3.1 Possible flow of budget between NSRP and SRP
- Fig 3.2 Transfer of work and associated budget between SRP and the PMB resulting from actions being transferred to and from the baseline
- Fig 3.3 Project estimate at completion elements
- Fig 3.4 Integrated work breakdown structure and organization breakdown structure and responsibility assignment.
- Fig 3.5 Cost and time performance measurement parameters such as; planned value, actual cost, earned value, estimate to complete, estimate at completion, budget at completion and variance at completion.
- Fig 3.6 Cost variance, schedule variance, cost performance index, schedule performance index and to complete performance index.
- Fig 3.7 Monitoring and controlling of changes to the Management Reserve and Performance Measurement Baseline at the integrated baseline change management.
- Fig 5.1: Organization breakdown Structure
- Fig 5.2: PMB, SRP and NSRP.

List of Tables

- Table 4.1 Respondents Locations
- Table 4.2 Respondents Years of Experience in EVM
- Table 4.3 Respondents Years of Experience in RM
- Table 4.4 Respondents Years of Experience in the Integration between EVM and RM
- Table 4.5 Respondents Rate of Using EVM
- Table 4.6 Respondents Rate of Using RM
- Table 4.7 Respondents Rate of Using the Integration between EVM and RM
- Table 4.8 Respondents opinion in the importance of Earned Value Management in evaluating past project performance
- Table 4.9 Respondents opinion in the importance of Earned Value Management in future project performance.
- Table 4.10 Respondents opinion in the importance of Earned Value Management in estimating the total project cost at completion
- Table 4.11 Respondents opinion in the importance of Earned Value Management in estimating the project end date
- Table 4.12 Respondents opinion in the importance of Earned Value Management in generally enhancing the project management, monitoring and control
- Table 4.13 Respondents opinion in the importance of the integration between EVM and RM in taking early corrective actions
- Table 4.14 Respondents opinion in the importance of the integration between EVM and RM in improving project cost control
- Table 4.15 Respondents opinion in the importance of the integration between EVM and RM in improving project schedule control
- Table 4.16 Respondents opinion in the importance of the integration between EVM and RM in improving the coordination and communication between project stakeholders
- Table 4.17 Respondents opinion in the importance of the integration between EVM and RM in reducing the project actual cost
- Table 4.18 Respondents opinion in the importance of the integration between EVM and RM in completing the project within the allocated budget

- Table 4.19 Respondents opinion in the importance of the integration between EVM and RM in increasing the dependability and accuracy of the project cost and schedule performance reports
- Table 4.20 Respondents opinion in the importance of the integration between EVM and RM in controlling the project management reserve
- Table 4.21 Mean, Standard Deviation, Degree of Freedom, t Value and p Value for the RQs
- Table 5.1: Total project built up areas for different building types.
- Table 5.2: Project measurement baseline and management reserve project data.
- Table 5.3: Project cost estimate at completion and variance at completion for different work packages, buildings and disciplines.
- Table 5.4: The cost impact of the additional quantities those were not allocated in the original project measurement baseline.
- Table 5.5: Cost impact due to prices escalation of different construction materials.
- Table 5.6: Summary of cost impacts.
- Table 5.7: Project cost performance and status till December, 2014.
- Table 5.8: Project work breakdown structure.
- Table 5.9: Top down budget using three points estimate.
- Table 5.10 Established project risk register.
- Table 5.11 Qualitative risk analysis applied to the identified risks.
- Table 5.12 Revise the Top-down budget using three-point estimates.
- Table 5.13 Integrate the WBS/OBS Responsibility assignment matrix form.
- Table 5.14 Allocation of the initial project measurement baseline.
- Table 5.15 Updated project risk register and the qualitative risk analysis.
- Table 5.16 Quantitative Risk Analysis According to the Latest Update of the Risk Register.
- Table 5.17 Estimated Non Specific Risk Provision.
- Table 5.18 Allocated Project measurement baseline, Specific Risk Provision and Non Specific Risk Provision.
- Table 5.19 Project Cost Monitoring and Control, transfer between PMB, SRP and NSRP.

List of Charts

- Chart 4.1 Locations distribution of the respondents per continent
- Chart 4.2 Respondents Years of Experience in EVM
- Chart 4.3 Respondents Years of Experience in RM
- Chart 4.4 Respondents Years of Experience in the Integration between EVM and RM
- Chart 4.5 Respondents Rate of Using EVM
- Chart 4.6 Respondents Rate of Using RM
- Chart 4.7 Respondents Rate of Using the Integration between EVM and RM
- Chart 4.8 Respondents opinion in the importance of Earned Value Management in evaluating past project performance
- Chart 4.9 Respondents opinion in the importance of Earned Value Management in future project performance.
- Chart 4.10 Respondents opinion in the importance of Earned Value Management in estimating the total project cost at completion
- Chart 4.11 Respondents opinion in the importance of Earned Value Management in estimating the project end date
- Chart 4.12 Respondents opinion in the importance of Earned Value Management in generally enhancing the project management, monitoring and control
- Chart 4.13 Respondents opinion in the importance of the integration between EVM and RM in taking early corrective actions
- Chart 4.14 Respondents opinion in the importance of the integration between EVM and RM in improving project cost control
- Chart 4.15 Respondents opinion in the importance of the integration between EVM and RM in improving project schedule control
- Chart 4.16 Respondents opinion in the importance of the integration between EVM and RM in improving the coordination and communication between project stakeholders
- Chart 4.17 Respondents opinion in the importance of the integration between EVM and RM in reducing the project actual cost

- Chart 4.18 Respondents opinion in the importance of the integration between EVM and RM in completing the project within the allocated budget
- Chart 4.19 Respondents opinion in the importance of the integration between EVM and RM in increasing the dependability and accuracy of the project cost and schedule performance reports
- Chart 4.20 Respondents opinion in the importance of the integration between EVM and RM in controlling the project management reserve
- Chart 4.21 Mean, Standard Deviation and t Value for the RQs
- Chart 5.1: Summary of additional quantities cost impact.
- Chart 5.2: Values summary of cost impacts.
- Chart 5.3: Weights summary of cost impacts.
- Chart 5.4: Project cost performance and trends till December, 2014.

Chapter One: Introduction

1.1 Background

Cost monitoring and controlling of a project is very important and crucial factor for project success, as one of the main objectives of project management is to finish the project at a point that is not far away from the allocated budget, after establishing the project budget and the commencement date of the project starts, normally deviations start to appear between the allocated budget and the actual incurred costs, these deviations may be above the allocated budget (overrun), and may be under the allocated budget (under-run), the probability of the overrun is usually higher than the probability of the under-run, prices of the construction materials raise due to economical inflation and many other risks occur that affect the project cost performance, project stakeholders start to investigate the reasons of the cost overrun, highlight and monitor those reasons, to figure out whether these new impacts will continue affecting the cost performance till end of the project or not.

Forecasting of the project cost at completion is a challenging issue, as the project may go into overrun, under-run and according to the allocated budget, but the issue is whether the current cost performance trend will remain the same, enhanced or worsen for the remaining life cycle of the project. There are two major parts at any time of the project progress, the first is the works executed to date (work done), and the future remaining works which will be carried on to achieve the project, the cost performance till a certain time of a project life cycle can be easily determined and monitored because it is a fact, the challenging part is to know what is coming on - the uncertainty.

Various techniques are used to figure out the cost performance to date, one of these techniques is the Earned Value Management that can be effectively used to monitor and control the project actual costs to date by simply comparing the budgeted cost of work performed against the actual cost of work performed, reasons of the cost performance can be then figured out. On the other hand there is nothing else but the Risk Management can be used to predict the future issues whether threats or opportunities, Earned Value Management system is only fed by the data extrapolated from the past performance and hardly any way to use the Earned Value Management to predict the future, the Risk Management on the other hand is the specialized tool in this regard.

Many organisations use both techniques actually, but the issue is that The Earned Value Management and Risk Management can and should be implemented in an integrated way, not only during the project execution phase, but also from the project initiation phase till project completion.

The integration will be started by establishing the project budget (measurement baseline) which shall be monitored and controlled by the Earned Value Management and establishing the project management reserve which shall be monitored and controlled by the Risk Management.

The integration process will be then pass by the project execution phase, which is the major part of the integration technique, at this stage the project will encounter changes in the cost performance trends, deviation will start to appear, and the management reserve can be used to recover these deviations when materialised. The management reserve will cover the cost deviation which has happened due to risk factors (whether threats and opportunities), and shall not be used to cover for any scope changes or any other related cost impacts.

A synchronisation system will to be conducted between the project measurement baseline and the management reserve, management reserve estimated could be then measured and evaluated when embedded in the project measurement baseline using the Earned Value Management tool.

The Earned Value Management and Risk Management approaches share a mutual interest of providing the project stakeholders with the adequate available information while setting targets and considering management strategies. However, they take differing approaches, Earned Value Management measures the project performance to date and uses these information to gain an understanding of future performance and the required resources to effectively reach these objectives. Risk Management looks forward to the obscure future to recognize and analyze risks and suggest actions to be applied to minimize or avoid the influence and the likelihood of a threat incidence or increase the utilization of the opportunities (APM, 2008).

The Earned Value Management concept has been deeply studied by (Besner and Hobbs, 2006; Bower and Finnegan, 2009; Butler and Richardson, 2011; Fleming and Koppelmann, 2008; Garrett and Roberts, 2008; Hillson, 2004 and 2011; Leu and Lin, 2008; Liu and Tu, 2010; Shepherd, 2010; Song, 2010). they highlighted the benefits of the Earned Value Management in forecasting the project cost and time at completion based on a variety of measurable and estimable costs and time of a project based on past performance. In spite of their extensive studies, project management practitioners faced several problems and challenges related to the Earned Value Management technique, for example, Earned Value Management uses the past performance of current projects to expect future trends and performance, that can usually limit its dependability because Earned Value Management solely cannot forecast strategies to foresee future events that are not dependent on past performance (PMI, 2011a).