



Cairo University

**THE INFLUENCE OF ARCHITECTURAL DESIGN OF
THE SURGICAL SUITE ON THE TRANSMISSION OF
INFECTION IN HOSPITALS
ANALYTICAL STUDY OF SPACES AND TRAFFIC FLOW
IN EGYPTIAN HEALTHCARE FACILITIES**

BY

Hoda Khaled Zakaria Alkashef

A Thesis Submitted to the
Faculty of Engineering at Cairo University
in Partial Fulfillment of the
Requirements for the Degree of
MASTER OF SCIENCE
in
Architectural Engineering

FACULTY OF ENGINEERING, CAIRO UNIVERSITY
GIZA, EGYPT
2018

**THE INFLUENCE OF ARCHITECTURAL DESIGN OF
THE SURGICAL SUITE ON THE TRANSMISSION OF
INFECTION IN HOSPITALS
ANALYTICAL STUDY OF SPACES AND TRAFFIC FLOW
IN EGYPTIAN HEALTHCARE FACILITIES**

By
Hoda Khaled Zakaria Alkashef

A Thesis Submitted to the
Faculty of Engineering at Cairo University
in Partial Fulfillment of the
Requirements for the Degree of
MASTER OF SCIENCE
in
Architectural Engineering

Under the Supervision of

Assoc. Prof. Dr. **Hammam
Serageldin**

Prof. Dr. **Mohamed Abdel-Kader**

.....
Professor of Architecture
Faculty of Engineering, Cairo University

.....
Professor of Architecture
Faculty of Engineering, Cairo University

FACULTY OF ENGINEERING, CAIRO UNIVERSITY
GIZA, EGYPT
2018

**THE INFLUENCE OF ARCHITECTURAL DESIGN OF
THE SURGICAL SUITE ON THE TRANSMISSION OF
INFECTION IN HOSPITALS
ANALYTICAL STUDY OF SPACES AND TRAFFIC FLOW
IN EGYPTIAN HEALTHCARE FACILITIES**

By
Hoda Khaled Zakaria Alkashef

A Thesis Submitted to the
Faculty of Engineering at Cairo University
in Partial Fulfillment of the
Requirements for the Degree of
MASTER OF SCIENCE
in
Architectural Engineering

Approved by the
Examining Committee

Assoc. Prof. Dr. **Hammam Serageldin**

Thesis Main Advisor

Prof. Dr. **Mohamed Abdel-Kader**

Advisor

Assoc. Prof. Dr. **Hisham Hussein Azmi**

Internal Examiner

Prof. Dr. **Sahar Soliman Abdallah**

External Examiner

- Professor of Housing & Urban Development, Housing & Building National
Research Center

FACULTY OF ENGINEERING, CAIRO UNIVERSITY
GIZA, EGYPT
2018

Engineer's Name: Hoda Khaled Zakaria Alkashef
Date of Birth: 25/05/1980
Nationality: Egyptian
E-mail: hodakhaled@gmail.com
Phone: +201006232719
Address: Elsherouk City, Cairo, Egypt
Registration Date: 1/10/2014
Awarding Date: 18 / 2 /2018
Degree: Master of Science
Department: Architectural Engineering



Supervisors:

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Hammam Serageldin
Prof. Dr. Mohamed Abdel-Kader

Examiners:

Prof. Sahar Soliman	(External examiner)
Assoc. Prof. Hisham Azmi	(Internal examiner)
Assoc. Prof. Hammam Serageldin	(Thesis main advisor)
Prof. Mohamed Abdel-Kader	(Advisor)

Title of Thesis:

The Influence of Architectural Design of the Surgical Suite on the Transmission of Infections in Hospitals, Analytical Study of Spaces and Traffic Flow in Egyptian Healthcare Facilities

Key Words:

Design of spaces; acquisition of infection; traffic flow; surgical suite; spread of infections

Summary:

Healthcare associated infections constitute a serious health risk worldwide. This emerged the need to study the diverse aspects that could limit the spread of these infections especially in the surgical suite. The architectural design of the surgical suite plays an important role in the acquisition of these infections. This study focuses on the design of spaces, zoning, and traffic flow for the surgical suite of general hospitals. The aim of this study is to investigate to which limit can the architectural design of the surgical suite affect the transmission of healthcare associated infections. And in order to reach this target, the study analyzed the effect of the design of spaces, zoning, and traffic flow on the spread of infections. Infection control regulations related to the design of spaces, zoning, and traffic flow were gathered from the diverse resources. A design assessment checklist was created based on previous literature. This checklist is to be used by architects during the design process to measure the degree of the architectural design compliance with infection control regulations. It is an easy to use template that highlights areas of deficiencies need improvement. This checklist was tested through its implementation in an Egyptian case study in a way that promotes the design's creativity and avoids directing architects to specific design alternative.

Acknowledgement

I would like to express my sincere gratitude for my advisors Professor Hammam and Professor Mohamed for their continuous support, patience, and motivation during my research work. Besides, I would like to thank my friends for their endless help and support. Last but not the least, I would to thank my parents, my brother, and my aunt for their everlasting motivation and support.

Table of Contents

Acknowledgement	i
Table of Contents	ii
List of Tables	v
List of Figures.....	vi
List of Abbreviations	viii
Abstract.....	xiv
Introduction	ix
Research Problem	ix
Research Objectives and Significance.....	x
Research Questions, Hypotheses, and Variables.....	x
Methodology.....	xi
Thesis Structure	xii
 Chapter-1: Theoretical Background of Infection	
1.1. Understanding Infection	1
1.2. Sources of Infection.....	1
1.3. The Chain of Transmission of Infections	2
1.4. Routes of Transmission of Infections.....	3
1.5. How Does Infection Occur	3
1.6. The Most Popular Hospital Infections.....	4
1.6.1. Healthcare-Associated Infections (HAIs).....	4
1.6.2. Surgical Site Infections (SSIs).....	5
 Chapter-2: Theoretical Background of the Architectural Design of the Surgical Suite	
2.1. Historical Development of Healthcare Facilities.....	8
2.2. Events and Trends Affecting the Design of the Surgical Suite in the 21 st Century.....	11
2.3. Types of Surgical Suites in the Healthcare Facility	12
2.4. Diverse Architectural Design Aspects to Mitigate Healthcare-Associated Infections.....	12
2.5. Architectural Focus Elements of this Study	12
2.6. Current Practices of the Architectural Design of the Surgical Suite.....	13
2.6.1. Current Practices of the Surgical Suite's Spaces.....	13
2.6.2. Current Practices of the Surgical Suite's Design Alternatives	13
2.6.2.1. Sterile Core System	14

2.6.2.2. Perimeter/Peripheral Corridor System	14
2.6.2.3. One-Way System	15
2.6.2.4. Two Separate Corridors	15
2.6.2.5. Single Corridor	16
2.6.2.6. Racetrack	17
2.6.2.7. Cluster/Pod	18
2.6.2.8. Barn Operating Theatre	18

Chapter-3: Theoretical Background of the Relationship between the Architectural Design and Infection Rate

3.1. Historical Background of the Relationship between the Built Environment and the Acquisition of Infection.....	21
3.2. Historical Background of Infection Control Practices in the Surgical Suite	21
3.3. Contradictory Viewpoints for the Relationship between the Architectural Design and Infection Rate	22
3.4. Statistics of Healthcare-Associated Infections	23
3.4.1. Healthcare-Associated Infections' Statistics in Developed Countries	23
3.4.2. Healthcare-Associated Infections' Statistics in Developing Countries	23
3.4.3. Healthcare-Associated Infections' Statistics in Egypt.....	24
3.5. Healthcare-Associated Infections' Empirical Studies in Egypt	25

Chapter-4: Spaces of the Surgical Suite and Infection Control

4.1. Major Spaces of the Surgical Suite and Infection Control	27
4.1.1. Operating Room	27
4.1.2. Anesthesia Room	33
4.1.3. Sterile Processing Room.....	34
4.1.4. Staff Changing Facilities	35
4.1.5. Pre- and Post- Operative Care Units	37
4.1.6. Hand Hygiene Facilities	38
4.2. Zoning of the Surgical Suite and Infection Control	40
4.2.1. Departmental Relationships between the Surgical Suite and Other Departments	40
4.2.2. Interrelationships of Spaces in the Surgical Suite	40
4.2.2.1. Number of Zones in the Surgical Suite	42
4.2.2.2. Spaces in Each Zone of the Surgical Suite	42
4.2.2.3. Adjacencies of Spaces in the Surgical Suite.....	42
4.2.2.4. Accessibility of Spaces in the Surgical Suite	42
4.2.2.5. Segregation between Cleanliness and Dirtiness in the Surgical Suite.....	42

Chapter-5: Traffic Flow in the Surgical Suite and Infection Control	
5.1. Inpatient Flow Patterns in the Surgical Suite	49
5.1.1. Inpatient Flow Cycles in the Surgical Suite	49
5.1.2. Notes on Inpatient Flow Cycles in the Surgical Suite	50
5.2. Personnel Flow Patterns in the Surgical Suite.....	51
5.2.1. Diverse Personnel in the Surgical Suite and their Roles	51
5.2.2. Diverse Personnel's Flow Cycles in the Surgical Suite	51
5.2.3. Notes on Personnel's Flow in the Surgical Suite	53
5.3. Flow of Supplies, Instruments, and Equipment in the Surgical Suite	55
5.3.1. Materials' Flow Patterns before Surgery.....	56
5.3.2. Materials' Flow Patterns during Surgery	56
5.3.3. Materials' Flow Patterns after Surgery.....	57
5.4. Flow of Waste in the Surgical Suite	59
5.4.1. Waste Generation, Segregation, Storing, and Handling in the Surgical Suite	59
Chapter-6: Design Alternatives of the Surgical Suite and Infection Control	
6.1. Evaluation of Current Design Alternatives from the Infection Control Point of View	63
6.2. Current Technologies Utilized in the Surgical Suite and their Impact on the Spread of Infections	65
6.3. New Design Trends of the Surgical Suite and their Impact on the Spread of Infections	67
6.4. Grounds for Creating the Design Assessment Checklist.....	70
6.5. Format of the Design Assessment Checklist	71
6.6. Utilization of the Design Assessment Checklist	71
6.7. Infection Control - Architectural Design Assessment Checklist.....	72
6.8. Case Study	79
Chapter-7: Conclusion	
7.1. Discussion.....	81
7.2. Conclusion	82
7.3. Recommendations	82
References.....	80

List of Tables

Table 1, Estimates of the Prevalence of Healthcare-Associated Infections in some of the Developed and Developing Countries, 1995-2008.....	24
Table 2, Summary of Healthcare-Associated Infections Studies sConducted in Egyptian Hospitals	25

List of Figures

Figure 1, Flow Diagram for the Logic of Research Methodology	xii
Figure 2, The chain of transmission of infections	2
Figure 3, Percentages of occurrence of each HAI type in Acute Care Hospitals in the United States, 2011	4
Figure 4 on left, Boston City Hospital Operating Theatre, Circa 1890, 1594.....	9
Figure 5 on right, MASH Operating Room, Korea, 1954	9
Figure 6, Summary Timeline of the Development of Healthcare Facilities.....	10
Figure 7, Sterile Core System Design	14
Figure 8, Perimeter/Peripheral Corridor System	15
Figure 9, One-Way System	15
Figure 10, Two-Separated Corridors System	16
Figure 11, Single Corridors Design	16
Figure 12, Race Track Design	17
Figure 13, Cluster/Pod Design	18
Figure 14 & Figure 15, Barn Operating Theatres.....	19
Figure 16, Barn and Conventional Operating Rooms within the Same Suite at Broadgreen Hospital in Liverpool UK	19
Figure 17, Cumulative Incidence of Surgical Site Infections in Developing Countries, 1995-2008.....	24
Figure 18, Hybrid Operating Room.....	27
Figure 19, Interventional MRI Unit at King College London with both C-arm and MRI installed inside the operating room.....	29
Figure 20, Plan of the Hybrid Intraoperative Operating Rooms at Dartmouth Hitchcock Medical Center, the United States showing the movement of imaging systems	29
Figure 21, Ceiling Mounted MRI integrated with the Operating Setting at Dartmouth Hitchcock Medical Center, United States.....	29
Figure 22, Functional Zones within a Typical Operating Room.....	30
Figure 23 on left, General OR size in the Egyptian guidelines	31
Figure 24 on right, General OR size in the 2014 FGI	31
Figure 25 on left, The classical OR layout	32
Figure 26 on right, The OR layout after simulation	32
Figure 27 on left, Mirrored Operating Rooms Design	32
Figure 28 on right, Same Handed Operating Rooms Design	32
Figure 29, Induction, Early Recovery, and Workspace Attached to Each Operating Room	33

Figure 30, Dual Induction Rooms for Each Operating Room at Seattle Children's Pediatric Center	34
Figure 31, The Sterile Processing Room Design.....	35
Figure 32 on left, A Regular Design of Staff Lockers' and on the Right.....	36
Figure 33 on right, A One-Way Traffic Design of Staff Changing Facilities	36
Figure 34, A Staff Lounge Is Attached to the Staff Changing Facilities Area.....	37
Figure 35, WHO Five Moments for Hand Hygienes	39
Figure 36, Large Scrub Station for multiple personnel	40
Figure 37, Departmental Relationships Between the Surgical Suite and Other Departments.....	41
Figure 38, The Three Zones Composing the Surgical Suite.....	43
Figure 39, Inpatient Traffic Flow in the Surgical Suite.....	49
Figure 40, Surgeons' Circulation Scenarios in the Surgical Suite	52
Figure 41, Anesthesiologists' Circulation Scenarios in the Surgical Suite	53
Figure 42, The One-Way Flow from Dirty to Clean Areas in the Staff Changing Facilities	54
Figure 43, Possible Flow Inside the Staff Changing Facilities Area.....	55
Figure 44, Cycles of Materials Entering and Exiting the Operating Room	58
Figure 45 on left, Automated Guided Vehicles, 2014.....	59
Figure 46 on right, Typical Automated Guided Vehicle with Supply Trolley.....	59
Figure 47, Three Designs of the Surgical Suite.....	64
Figure 48, Integrated Surgical and Interventional Suite at Palomar Pomerado Health, California.....	68
Figure 49, Lean Surgical Suite	69
Figure 50, Four Patient Clusters at Heart Hospital at Swedish American Health System in Rockford.....	70
Figure 51, Floor Plan of the Surgical Suite of New Wady El Nile Hospital.....	79

List of Abbreviations

WHO:	World Health Organization
CDC:	The Centers for Disease Control
IFIC:	International Federation of Infection Control
HAIs:	Healthcare Associated Infections
SSIs:	Surgical Site Infections
BSC:	Central Line Associated Bloodstream Infections
CA-UTI:	Catheter Associated Urinary Tract Infections
VAP:	Ventilator Associated Pneumonia
MRSA:	Methicillin Resistant Staphylococcus Aureus
MASH:	Mobile Army Surgery Hospital
PACS:	Picture Archive and Communication System
AIDS:	Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome
MRI:	Magnetic Resonance Imaging
CT:	Computed Tomography
FGI:	Facility Guidelines Institute
JCI:	Joint Commission Institute
CSSD:	Central Sterile and Supply Department
TSSU:	Theatre Sterile and Supply Unit
OR:	Operating Room
AORN:	American Organization of Perioperative Registered Nurses
AGV:	Automated Guided Vehicles
ICRA	Infection Control Risk Assessment
HVAC	Heating, Ventilation, and Air Conditioning

Introduction

Healthcare-associated infections constitute a public health threat worldwide that cause morbidity and mortality to patients in healthcare facilities [1]. Around “one in twenty-five hospital patients have at least one healthcare-associated infection” [2]. In Egypt, 15% of surgical and intensive care patients are in the risk of having hospital-acquired infections as estimated by the World Health Organization [3]. A serious problem that studies have addressed since the mid of the 20th century. These showed the role of the built environment on preventing these infections [4].

Healthcare-associated infections occur due to “the imbalance between the classical triad of epidemiology; agent, host, and environment” [5]. These three elements constitute the chain of transmission of infections that the breaking of this chain could avert infection from occurring. Contamination issues in healthcare facilities especially in the surgical suite should be carefully dealt with by all disciplines in order to control infection. The architectural design of the surgical suite constitutes an essential part of these contamination issues.

The design of spaces and their interrelationships and the design of traffic patterns within the surgical suite are the core of this research work. These design elements should comply with multiple standards that are based on surgical, disease prevention, and architectural practices. Such aspects and others will be deeply investigated to provide a thorough knowledge of the effect of the architectural design on the incidence of acquiring infection. So, design considerations affecting infection control measures are to be extracted while taking into account current and future advancements in surgical practices. Further, a design assessment checklist that evaluates the compliance of the architectural design with infection control regulations is to be created in a trial to reach an answer to the research problem.

Research Problem

Infection control is a vital aspect in healthcare facilities nowadays. Further, the design of hospitals is shifted toward meeting infection control regulations [6]. However; some hospitals in Egypt have major problems in prohibiting the transmission of infections. In some cases, these hospitals are the source of infection to healthy people. This might occur due to the cross intersection between clean and dirty flow, the improper separation between clean and soiled activities, the inadequate design of spaces, the inappropriate allocation of spaces, and other reasons that affect the spread of infections.

Controlling the occurrence of infection is highly required in the surgical suite, where invasive procedures are performed. So, the architectural design of the operating unit should carefully meet infection control regulations, where in fact it is sometime not met. For this reason, this study aims to fill in the gap in the knowledge of the design of the major spaces in the surgical suite, their interrelationships, and the traffic flow among the suite's spaces. This is to be studied in relation to the infection control aspect for the aim of alleviating the incidence of infection through the design. Such complicated issue cannot be solved by following a single intervention, it requires integrated solutions that the architectural design is one of these factors [7].

Research Objectives and Significance

Hygiene principals greatly affect the design of the surgical suite that should be the utmost clean zone at any healthcare facility. Designing spaces to sufficiently accommodate activities performed inside while maintaining cleanliness levels is one of the focus elements of this research. The other elements are the thorough study of spaces' adjacencies and traffic flow. These deep investigations aid to fill in the gaps in the knowledge in order to reach the research's objectives, which are as follows:

- Studying and analyzing the influence of the architectural design of spaces, their interrelationships, and the design of traffic flow on the spread of infections in the surgical suite.
- Gathering infection control regulations that are related to the architectural design of spaces and traffic flow in the surgical suite from the diverse guidelines, standards, codes, and published journal articles.
- Creating a design checklist for the surgical suite that could primarily assess the degree of the architectural design's compliance with infection control regulations.

Research Questions, Hypotheses, and Variables

Based on the research problem of having improperly designed surgical suites in some Egyptian hospitals, the main research question emerges. It is to which limit can the architectural design of the surgical suite affect the transmission of infections? From this main question, other secondary questions are initiated based on the study's focus design elements. These secondary questions are as follows:

- What are the zones of the surgical suite?
- What are the main zones that compose the operating room?
- How should the operating room's zones be arranged to facilitate activities performed without exposing patients and personnel to the risk of infection?
- How should the fixed imaging equipment be configured within the surgical setting inside the operating room?
- What are the infection control design pre-cautions that should be considered while designing operating rooms?
- Where should anesthesia be performed within the surgical suite and how this affects the incidence of infection?
- Where should the staff changing facilities be located within the suite?
- How should the staff changing facilities be designed to mitigate the spread of infections?
- Should the staff lounge be attached to the staff changing facilities and how this affects the acquisition of infection?
- Where should the scrub area be located in the suite?
- What are the design precautions to reduce the spread of infections from the scrub area?
- Where should pre-and post-operative care areas be located in the suite and how this affects acquiring infections?
- How designing hand hygiene facilities affects the prevalence of infection within the suite?
- What are design precautions for patients, personnel, and materials flow patterns to reduce the spread of infections?
- How should spaces of the surgical suite be arranged to mitigate the prevalence of infection?

These questions and others are to be investigated in relation to infection control aspects.

As mentioned above, solving infection control problems in healthcare facilities require a set of procedures and precautions that the architectural design is part of it. This study assumes that the architectural design of the surgical suite specifically; spaces, zoning, and traffic flow affect the acquisition of infection. And as design complies with standards including infection control regulations as the spread of infections are mitigated. This hypothesis is based on the fact that the physical environment plays a role in controlling the spread of hospital-acquired infections [8]. Where 30% to 70% of these infections can be avoided in case infection control regulations are achieved [9].

This research is to be conducted on general non-specialized hospitals with the assumption of some research variables. These are the location of the surgical suite within the facility, sizes of spaces contained in the surgical suite, the architectural design of these spaces, the interrelationship between these spaces, and circulation inside and in between these spaces. Each of these elements can individually affect the transmission of infections. For example, the improper positioning of the operating unit within the healthcare facility can increase the number of microorganisms causing infection inside the suite. Also, placing clean or dirty areas inside dirty or clean zones respectively can contaminate clean spaces or zones.

Methodology

Due to the interdisciplinary nature of this study, two main streams are to be basically studied and analyzed; epidemiology and architecture. First, the epidemiology stream focuses on understanding all scientific parameters of infection; its definition, sources, transmission, routes, occurrence, and the most popular hospital infections. Second, the architectural stream focuses on understanding the architectural design of the surgical suite; its development, events and trends affecting its design, and its current practices. Accordingly, the relationship between these two streams is to be studied and analyzed in depth to understand how far can the architectural design of spaces, zoning, and traffic flow affect the incidence rate of healthcare-associated infections in the surgical suite. Furthermore, infection control regulations related to the architectural focus elements of this research are to be extracted from the latest diverse standards, codes, guidelines, and published articles. From the above-collected and analyzed regulations, a design checklist is to be developed to assess the architectural design degree of compliance with infection control regulations. Then, a case study is to be implemented on the checklist to verify and test it. Finally, analyzes of major findings are to be done to identify the research's recommendations (Fig. 1).

Data to be utilized throughout this study is to be precisely selected to suit the research problem. Data is to be traced from its origin taking into consideration the latest technological, medical, and architectural trends related to the research's focus areas. For instance, statistics are to be mainly obtained from the WHO (World Health Organization) and CDC (Centers for Disease Control and Prevention) organizations; infection control regulations are to be mainly obtained from the IFIC (International Federation of Infection Control) organization and international infection control guidelines; and architectural design regulations are to be basically gathered from the most recent international guidelines for the design of healthcare facilities and the latest journal articles that directly or indirectly address the research's focus elements. These selected data types aim to cover both the theoretical and practical bases of surgical practices, infection control regulations, and architectural design practices that influence the incidence of infection.