

# Measuring the Role of Satisfaction and Positive Word of Mouth as Mediator Variables on the Relationships between Empowerment and Sustainability

## An Empirical Study on Private Higher Institutes in Egypt

A Thesis Submitted in partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Doctor of philosophy Degree in Business Administration

Submitted by Lamia Mohamed Fathy

Supervised By

Prof. Dr. Aisha El Meniawy

> professor of Marketing Faculty of commerce Ain Shams University

Dr. Shawky Elghitany

Assistant professor of Business Faculty of commerce Ain Shams University

Faculty of commerce Ain Shams University



Name of Researcher: Lamia Mohamed Fathy Abdel Moniem

**Title of Thesis:** Measuring The Role of Satisfaction and Positive Word of Mouth as Mediator Variables on The Relationships between Empowerment and Sustainability.

Academic Degree: Doctor of philosophy (Business Administration)

## **Examining committee:**

#### Prof. Dr. Aisha Mustafa Elmeniawy "Chairman"

Professor of marketing Faculty of Commerce Ain shams University

#### Prof. Dr. Amr Hassan Kheir el Dean "Member"

Professor of Marketing and Head of Business Administration Department Faculty of Commerce Ain shams University

## Prof. Dr. Ahmad Samir Roushdy "Member"

Professor of Marketing El Sadat Academy

Date of Defense: / /۲۰۱۹



I dedicate my dissertation work to my Husband and my two sons Mostafa and Omar, my beloved mother, my sister, my brother, all my family, and to the memory of my father and prof. Dr. Thabet Edrees.

I dedicate this work and give special thanks for my colleagues the chairman of Private higher educational institutes (PHEIs) for Management information system (MIS) in Egypt for welcoming and willing to help me in providing feedback from students.

Their help made the completion of the research an enjoyable experience.



All thanks and praises for **Allah** for giving me strength and patience to complete my PHD and for my mother who always prayed for me.

I wish to thank **Professor Dr. Aisha Elmeniawy** my committee chair, for her supervision, guidance and timeless hours of reading throughout the entire process. She was always there with her sincere help and contribution.

My sincere thanks also extend to **Dr. Shawky elghitany** my second supervisor for his help and support. Many thanks for Prof. **Dr. Amr Hassan Kheir el Dean** and **Prof. Dr. Ahmad Samir Roushdy** for their acceptance to be members in my examining committee.

Finally, I would like to thank all who helped me **Prof Dr. Amani**Moussa, Dr. Mohamed abd Elnaby, Prof Dr. Hoda

Rashwan, Ehab Mohamed, Rashad Raaof, Sherin

Ebrahim for thier help and support during my PHD.

#### Abstract

This research aims to measure the relationship between empowerment of students and sustainability of Private higher educational institutes (PHEIs) for Management information system (MIS) in Egypt. A framework was developed to test the relationship through the satisfaction and positive word of mouth as mediating variables. A multi stage area sample of Yo', was selected randomly from institutes specialized in management information system in Egypt and was divided equally on the four academic years in each institute. The result showed that there is a significant direct strong impact of the variables students' empowerment, satisfaction, and positive word of mouth on the sustainability of PHEIs. The results also present some direct and indirect relationships between variables within the research framework that might serve PHEIS in to understanding the importance of applying the empowerment strategy for their sustainability. The research provided some the theoretical and managerial implications that might help PHEIS in discovering the factors important for their sustainability. This research was limited to PHEIS specialized in MIS in Egypt it could be directed to students in other majors, or different sectors or countries.

<u>Key Words:</u> Private Higher Educational Institutes (PHEIs), in Management Information System (MIS), Student Empowerment, Student Satisfaction, Student Loyalty, Student Word of mouth (WOM), Sustainability.

# **Table OF Contents**

List Of T	ables	viii
List Of Figures		хi
List Of A	List Of Abbreviations	
	Chapter \: Framework Of The Study	
1,1	Introduction	1
١,٢	Terminologies	٣
١,٣	Pilot Study	٤
١,٤	Research Problem	٧
١,٥	Research Questions	٨
١,٦	Research Objectives	٨
١,٧	Research Hypothesis	٩
١,٨	Conceptual Study Framework	١.
١,٩	Research Methodology	11
١,١٠	Research Importance	10
1,11	Structure Of The Thesis	١٦
1,17	Summary	١٧
	Chapter 7: Empowerment And Service Quality	
۲,۱	Introduction	١٨
۲,۲	Customer Empowerment	19
۲,۳	Customer Involvement	۲.
۲,٤	Customer Participation	71
۲,٥	Antecedents Of Customer Participation	75
۲,٦	Importance Of Participation	۲ خ
۲,٧	Advantages And Drawbacks Of Participations	70
۲,۸	Types Of Customer Participation	77
۲,۹	Levels Of Customer Participation	77
۲,۱۰	Dimensions Of Customer Participation	۲۸
۲,۱۱	The Relationship Between Participation And the Word-Of –	۲٩
	Mouth (WOM)	
7,17	Service Concept	٣.
۲,۱۳	Service Quality Concept	٣١
۲,۱٤	Customer In Higher Education	٣٢
۲,۱٥	Dimensions Of Service Quality	٣٤
۲,۱٦	Participation And Service Quality	٣٧
۲,۱۷	Explaining The Relationship Between Student's Empowerment And Student's Satisfaction	٣٧
۲,۱۸	Summary	٤٤

Chapter ": Satisfaction And Service Quality		
٣,١	Introduction	٤٧
٣,٢	Customer Perception	٤٨
٣,٣	Customer Satisfaction	٤٩
٣, ٤	Levels Of Customer Satisfaction	٥٢
٣,٥	Two Views Of Satisfaction	0 8
٣,٦	Customer Satisfaction Information	0 8
٣,٧	Students Satisfaction	00
٣,٨	Antecedents of Satisfaction in Higher Education	٥٧
٣,٩	Satisfaction Consequences	٦١
٣,١٠	The Relationship Between Satisfaction And Service Quality	٦٤
٣,١١	Customer Satisfaction's Measurement Approaches	٦٦
٣,١٢	Explaining The Relationship Between Student's Satisfaction And Their Positive Word of Mouth (WOM)	٧.
٣,١٣	Summary	٧٨
	Chapter 4: Word Of Mouth And Sustainability	
٤,١	Introduction	۸١
٤,٢	Word Of Mouth	٨٢
٤,٣	Sustainability	9 ٢
٤,٤	Competitive Advantage	90
٤,٥	Models of Measuring Retention	1.0
٤,٦	Explaining The Relationship Between Positive Word Of Mouth And Sustainability Concerning (Decision Student's To Stay & Competitive Advantage).	111
٤,٧	Summary	117
	Chapter •: Research Methodology	
٥,١	Introduction	119
٥,٢	Research Design	119
٥,٣	Data Collection Methods	171
٥,٤	Research Instruments	171
٥,٥	Sampling Design	١٢٣
٥,٦	Construct Measurement	١٢٦
٥,٧	Data Processing	150
٥,٨	Data Analysis Techniques	170
٥,٩	Summary	1 2 .

Chapter 7 : Data Analysis		
٦,١	Introduction	1 £ 1
٦,٢	Discriminant Validity Tests Through Exploratory Factor Analysis	1 £ 7
٦,٣	Reliability And Validity Tests	١٥٣
٦,٤	Descriptive Analysis	171
٦,٥	Inferential Analysis For Testing The Research Hypothesis	١٨٤
٦,٦	Confirmatory Factor Analysis (CFA)	197
٦,٧	Structure Equation Modelling (SEM)	۲٠١
٦,٨	Summary	۲ • ٤
	Chapter ': Discussion, Implications And	
	Recommendations	
٧,١	Introduction	۲.٥
٧,٢	Discussion And Interpretation Of Findings	۲.٥
٧,٣	The Link Between The Hypotheses, Questionnaire, Objectives And The Research Finding	710
٧,٤	Research Implications	717
٧,٥	Recommendation For Future Studies	777
٧,٦	Limitations And Directions For Future Research	777

Appendices	
English Summary	775
English Questionnaire	775
SPSS And AMOS Tables	771
Arabic Summary	١
Arabic Questionnaire	٤

775

References

# List of Tables

Table	Title	Page
Table (1-1)	Pilot Study Results Conducted By The Researcher.	٦
Table (1-1)	Relationships Between Variables Done By the Researcher.	١.
Table (1-7)	Geographic Areas Of The Research Sample.	17
Table( ", 1)	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
Table (٤,١)	Main Definitions Of Word-Of-Mouth.	۸۳
Table (٤,٢)	Definitions Of Word-Of-Mouth From A Marketing Perspective.	٨٥
Table (*, 1)	Institutes Sample In Different Geographic Areas.	۱۲٤
Table (o, Y)	Constructs, Dimensions, And Related Variables.	۱۳.
Table (°, ")	Statistical Techniques Used For Data Analysis.	189
Table (٦,١)	KMO Test And Bartlett's Test For The Variable Student's Empowerment Through Participation.	1 £ Y
Table (٦,٢)	Factor Analysis For The Variable Student's Empowerment Through Participation.	154
Table (٦,٣)	KMO Test And Bartlett's Test For The Variable Student's Satisfaction On Perceive Service Quality.	1 £ £
Table (٦,٤)	Factor Analysis For The Variable Student's Satisfaction In Terms of Perceive Service Quality.	150
Table (٦,٥)	KMO Test And Bartlett's Test For The Variable Positive Word Of Mouth.	1 £ 9
Table (٦,٦)	Factor Analysis For The Variable Student's Positive Word Of Mouth (Recommendation To Others).	10.
Table (₹,∀)	KMO Test And Bartlett's Test For The Variable Sustainability Of PHIEs.	101
Table (٦,٨)	Factor Analysis For The Variable Sustainability Of PHIEs In Terms Of Both (Student's Decision To Stay And Competitive Advantage).	107
Table (7,4)	Reliability And Validity For The Research Construct.	105
Table(1,11)	Internal Consistency Of Student's Empowerment Through Participation.	100
Table(1,11)	Internal Consistency Of Student's Satisfaction In Terms Of ( Perceived Service Quality).	107
Table (٦,١٢)	Internal Consistency Of Positive Word Of Mouth In Terms Of (Recommendation To Others).	١٥٨
Table (٦,١٣)	Internal Consistency Of Sustainability.	١٦.
Table (٦,١٤)	Data Frequency And Percentages Of The Sample	١٦٢
Table (٦,١٥)	Descriptive Statistics For Independent Variable Student's Empowerment Through Participation.	171
Table (٦,١٦)	Descriptive Statistics For The Dimension Tangibles.	١٦٧

Table	Title	Page
Table (٦,١٧)	Descriptive Statistics For The Dimension (Reliability).	179
Table (٦,١٨)	Descriptive Statistics For The Dimension Responsiveness To Student's	١٧١
Table (٦,١٩)	Descriptive Statistics For The Dimension (Assurance).	١٧٣
Table (٦,٢٠)	Descriptive Statistics For The Dimension (Empathy).	١٧٤
Table (٦,٢١)	Descriptive Statistics For The Dimension ( Dynamism Of Informational Technologies).	۱۷٦
Table (٦,٢٢)	Descriptive Statistics For The Dimension (Overall Satisfaction).	۱۷۸
Table (٦,٢٣)	Descriptive Statistics For The Mediator Variable Student's Positive Word Of Mouth In Terms Of (Recommendation To Others).	179
Table (٦,٧٤)	Descriptive Statistics For The Dependent Variable Sustainability Of PHEIs In Terms Of (Decision Of Student To Stay)	۱۸۱
Table (٦,٢٥)	Descriptive Statistics For The Dependent Variable Sustainability Of PHEIs In Terms Of (Competitive Advantage).	١٨٣
Table (٦,٢٦)	Correlation Between Student's Empowerment through (Participation) And Student's Satisfaction In Terms Of (Perceived Service Quality).	١٨٦
Table (٦,٢٧)	Regression Model Between Student's Empowerment Through Participation And Student's Satisfaction In Terms Of Perceived Service Quality.	١٨٧
Table (٦,٢٨)	Correlation Between Student's Satisfaction In Terms Of Perceived Service Quality And Student's Positive Word Of Mouth In Terms Of (Recommendation to Others).	١٨٨
Table(٦,٢٩)	Regression Model Between The Variables Student's Satisfaction In Terms Of (Perceived Service Quality) And Student's Positive Word Of Mouth In Terms Of (Recommendation To Others).	١٨٩
Table(1, r.)	Correlation Between Student's Positive Word Of Mouth In Terms Of (Recommendation To Others) And Sustainability Of PHEIs In Terms Of Both (Decision Of Student's To Stay And Competitive Advantage).	191
Table(٦,٣١)	Regression Model Between Student's Positive Word Of Mouth In Terms Of (Recommendation To Others) And Sustainability Of PHEIs In Terms Of Both (Decision Of Student's To Stay And Competitive Advantage).	197
Table(٦,٣٢)	The Relationship Between The Variables Student's Empowerment	198

Table	Title	Page
	Through (Participation)And Sustainability Of PHEIs In Terms Of Both (Decision Of Student's To Stay And Competitive Advantage ).	
Table(٦,٣٣)	Regression Model Between Student's Empowerment Through (participation) And Sustainability Of PHEIs In Terms Of Both (Decision Of Student's To Stay And Competitive Advantage).	190
Table(٦,٣٤)	Quality Assessment Criteria Of The Structural Model.	۱۹۸
Table(٦,٣٥)	Confirmatory Factor Analysis Estimates.	199
Table(٦,٣٦)	Quality Assessment Criteria Of The Structural Model.	7.7
Table(٦,٣٧)	Structure Equation Model Coefficients For Direct Relations.	7.7
Table(٦,٣٨)	Structure Equation Model Coefficients Of Indirect Relations.	۲.۳
Table (V. V)	The Link Between The Hypotheses , Questionnaire , Objective And The Finding Of The Research.	710
Table(V. Y)	Action Plan For Executing The Managerial Implications.	77.

# List of Figures

Fig	Title	Page
(1-1)	Figure that Emphasis The Research Hypothesis Done By The Researcher.	١.
(۲,1)	Empowerment And The Delivery Of Public Services Adapted From Manila (August <sup>r1</sup> , <sup>r.1</sup> r).	٣٨
(۲,۲)	The Impact Of Technology On The Thinking Process Of Students In The Y1st Century Adapted From De Abreu (Y11).	٣٩
(۲,۳)	Proposed Model Of Direct And Moderated Relationships Between The Research Variables Adapted From Yagil (۲۰۰٦).	٤٠
(٢,٤)	The Mediating And Moderating Role Of Contextual Factors On the Relationship Between Consumer Empowerment And Consumer Satisfaction Adapted From Hunter And Garnefeld (۲۰۰۸).	٤١
(۲,0)	Basic Pillars Of Employee Empowerment Adapted from Ongori & Shunda (۲۰۰۹).	٤٢
(۲,۲)	Employee Empowerment Process And Outcome Model Adapted From Ongori & Shunda (۲۰۰۹).	٤٣
(۲,۷)	The Impact Of Perceived Students' Satisfaction And Achievement & Absorption Capacity Conceptual Model Adapted From Athanassopoulos et al. (۲۰۰۱)	٤٤
(٣,١)	Internal Factors of Perceived Quality That Affect Students Satisfaction Adapted From Hadi Minavand(۲۰۱۳).	٧١
(٣,٢)	A Model Of Consumer Satisfaction And Perceived Service Quality Adapted From Athiyaman( 1997).	٧٢
(٣,٣)	Conceptual Model Of Student Satisfaction In Higher Education Adapted From Helena Alves ( ۲۰۰۲)	٧٣
(٣,٤)	The Proposed Mod Adapted From Shao-Chang Li(۲۰۱۲).	٧٥
(٣,٥)	The Relation Between Dimensions Of Educational Experience And Satisfaction Adapted From OWG (۲۰۰۳)	٧٦
(٣,٦)	The Conceptual Model Of The Study Adapted From Houshang Taghizadeh (۲۰۱۳.)	٧٧
( £,1)	Tinto's Student Integration Model From Allison K. Arnekrans(۲۰۱٤).	1.4
(£, Y)	A Model Of Sustainable Competitive Advantage For Education Service Enterprises In International Markets Adapted From Soutar(1999).	117
(٤,٣)	McCarthy's ¿P Approach Vs. Sustainability Marketing Mix Adapted From Kumar et al. (Y·)Y).	١١٣
(٤,٤)	The Framework Of The Study Adapted From Balas et al.(Y··^).	110
(٤,٥)	The Framework Of The Study Adapted From Balas et al (۲۰۰۹).	١١٦
(0,1)	Classification Of Research Designs .	17.
(۱,۱)	Figure Of Confirmatory Factor Analysis Of The Research Model.	197
(۲,۲)	Structure Equation Model Diagram.	۲٠١

# LIST OF Abbreviation

CFA	Confirmatory Factor Analysis
CFI	Comparative Fit Index
EFA	Exploratory Factor Analysis
GFI	Goodness Of Fit Index
IFI	Incremental Fit Index
KMO	Kaiser-Mayer Olkin's Measure of Sampling Adequacy Test
PCA	Principal Component Analysis
RFI	Relative Fit Index
RMSEA	Root Mean Square Error Of Approximation
SEM	Structural Equation Modeling
SERV-PERVEL	Perceived Value Of A Service Scale
SERVQUAL	Service Quality Scale
SRMR	Standardized Root Mean Square Residual
WOM	Word-Of-Mouth

# Framework of the study

#### I.I Introduction

The Importance of education is no longer a controversial issue around the world. Scholars proved that education is the true and solely beginning of the progress in the world. All countries which witnessed progress, including Asian countries, relied on education. Therefore, developed countries considered education as priority within their programs and policies.

Education is considered the only way that can be used to achieve comprehensive plan and face future requirements in the light of scientific development and variable technologies. With no doubt, schools, institutes and universities are the most important organizations in the industry of education worldwide in general and particularly in Egypt.

Egyptian education is a central system subjected under the control of central government in Egypt, this system suffered a long time ago from a lot of problems and challenges which in turn represents a real obstacle in the development of the educational process. That will need updating the process and developing comprehensive plan. Egyptian government succeeded on establishing private universities and higher institutes in major fields needed in job market.

Increasingly, private higher education institutions (PHEIs) are realizing that they could be regarded as a business-like service industry and recently they are beginning to focus more on meeting or even exceeding the needs of their students who are the outcome and the customers of the education system. They affect and are affected by process of education.

Today's students have more opportunities in selecting among appropriate universities / PHEIs for their academic and professional development and they have the tendency to search for universities that

١

provide a high quality of teaching, and best student services along with affordable costs. They want to be sure when making important investment on their life such as choosing the right university/institute.

With the onset of the newest technologies available to us through mobile applications and social networking sites, both of which have expanded and multiplied, for the need of empowering students through involving them in the services produced by PHEIs in Egypt.

Many business organizations, especially those who are in service sector such as higher educational institutions are trying to identify challenges within a competitive environment regardless of their size and their years of experience. They have to rethink about their organizational processes and strategies, to enhance their successful opportunities hopefully to become student oriented. Increasing student's satisfaction with services provided is important to affect students positive word of mouth. Also, to create value for institutes, service quality should be given a real interest. This value creation could be considered a competitive advantage for institutes and affects their sustainability.

This research aims to define most important problems which face private higher educational institutes in Egypt under the fierce competitions among those institutes, and provides recommendations which might help them to achieve sustainable business and to be able to continue their national mission.

That requires studying and understanding demands of students who join those institutes to gain their support through enabling them to participate with their opinions in order to improve the level of provided service.

In addition, Institutes must work hardly for developing their marketing strategies, providing better services and establishing long term relationship with their students even after their graduation.