



AIN SHAMS UNIVERSITY
FACULTY OF ENGINEERING
Structural Engineering

Risk Assessment for Variation Orders for Residential Projects

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements of the
degree of
Master of Science in Civil Engineering
(Structural Engineering)
Submitted by

Eng. Abdallah Ali Kamal Balbaa
B.Sc. in Civil Engineering
Faculty of Engineering, Ain Shams University, 2012
(Structural Engineering)
Supervised by

Prof. Dr. Omar Aly Mousa El-Nawawy
Professor of R.C. Structures
Faculty of Engineering
Ain Shams University

Prof. Dr. Kareem Mohamed El-Dash
Professor of Construction Management
Faculty of Engineering
Banha University

Dr. Mohamed Badawy
Lecturer of Construction Management
Faculty of Engineering
Ain Shams University

Cairo – (2019)



AIN SHAMS UNIVERSITY
FACULTY OF ENGINEERING
Structural Engineering

Risk Assessment for Variation Orders for Residential Projects

By

Eng. Abdallah Ali Kamal Balbaa
B.Sc. in Civil Engineering
Faculty of Engineering, Ain Shams University, 2012
(Structural Engineering)

EXAMINERS' COMMITTEE

Signature

Prof. Dr. Ahmed Samer Ezz El Din
Professor of Construction Management
Faculty of Engineering - The American University in Cairo

Prof. Dr. Abdelrehim Khalil El Desoky
Professor of Structural Engineering
Faculty of Engineering - Ain Shams University

Prof. Dr. Omar Aly Mousa El-Nawawy
Professor of R.C. Structures
Faculty of Engineering - Ain Shams University

Prof. Dr. Kareem Mohamed El-Dash
Professor of Construction Management
Faculty of Engineering - Banha University

Date: 18/3/2019



AIN SHAMS UNIVERSITY
FACULTY OF ENGINEERING
Structural Engineering

Risk Assessment for Variation Orders for Residential Projects

By

Eng. Abdallah Ali Kamal Balbaa

B.Sc. in Civil Engineering

Faculty of Engineering, Ain Shams University, 2012

(Structural Engineering)

SUPERVISORS' COMMITTEE

Signature

Prof. Dr. Omar Aly Mousa El-Nawawy

Professor of R.C. Structures

Faculty of Engineering - Ain Shams University

.....

Prof. Dr. Kareem Mohamed El-Dash

Professor of Construction Management

Faculty of Engineering - Banha University

.....

Dr. Mohamed Badawy

Lecturer of Construction Management

Faculty of Engineering - Ain Shams University

.....

Date: 18/3/2019

Statement

This thesis is submitted in partial fulfillment of the degree of Master of Science in Civil Engineering (Structural), Faculty of Engineering Ain Shams University.

The author carried out the work included in this thesis, and no part of it has been submitted for a degree or qualification at any other scientific entity.

Student's Name

Abdallah Ali Kamal Balbaa

Signature

.....

Date:

Researcher Data

Name	: Abdallah Ali Kamal Balbaa
Date of birth	: 8 June 1989
Nationality	: Egyptian
Place of birth	: Dammam, KSA
Last academic degree	: B.Sc. in Civil Engineering
Field of specialization	: Structural Engineering
University issued degree	: Ain Shams University
Date of issued degree	: 2012
Current job	: Senior Technical Office Engineer at The Lake View Residence, New Cairo, Egypt.

Acknowledgment

I would like to express my deepest thanks and appreciation to my supervisors, **Prof. Dr. Omar El- Nawawy** and **Prof. Dr. Karim El Dash** for their guidance and advice throughout this work. I am grateful to them all for having the opportunity to work under their supervision.

Special thanks for my supervisor **Dr. Mohammed Badawy**, for his valuable assistance, guidance, patience and endless support throughout this research, and reviewing of the manuscript is greatly acknowledged. I appreciate the effort of consulting engineers, quantity surveyors, construction project managers, lead architects and contractors for their help in the study.

Finally, I would like to thank deeply my family, and my friends for their continuous encouragement, support, fruitful care, and patience, especially during hard times.

Abstract

This research aims to assess risks caused by variation orders in construction projects in Egypt, through studying the most important causes of the variation orders and their effects on construction projects. Two initial questionnaires were created using brainstorming technology to generate and collect multiple factors related to the causes and effects of variations. Using Delphi technique, a selected team of experts responded to the initial questionnaires and provided comments on the responses from each group of factors that had been gathered until an agreement had been reached and the final questionnaire had been established.

The two structured questionnaires were developed. The first one contained 39 collected causes of change and categorized depending on the origin of the variation; owner related, consultant related, contractor related, project management related or other related variations. The other one contained 12 collected effects of change categorized depending on the impact of each effect; cost related, time-related, productivity related or organization related effects.

The survey was carried out among client representatives, consultants, contractors and project managers involved in delivering projects. A total of 153 and 147 completed questionnaires received for the first and second questionnaires, respectively, out of 250 questionnaires distributed for each questionnaire. The collected

respondents were analyzed with the Statistical Package for the Social Science “SPSS”. In this study we use four different methods to identify the most risk causes of VOs and their effects. The results of the study showed that the most five risky causes of variation orders are “Change in economic conditions”, “Lack of coordination between the parties”, “Bad sub-contractor or supplier by the contractor”, “Impediment to prompt decision-making process by the owner of the project” and “Contractor’s financial difficulties”. Where the most five risky effects of variation orders are “Completion schedule delay”, “Logistic delay”, “Local Procurement delay”, “Delay in payment” and “Productivity degradation”.

A recently completed residential project is selected to be used as a case study to compare the causes and effects of variation orders resulted from this research and a recently completed project. The study showed that the causes of variation orders are “Change in economic conditions” (ranked as the top cause of variation orders in our study), “Change in design by the owner”, “Change in scope by the owner”, “Change in specifications by the consultant”, and “Material replacement by the owner”. Where, the effects of variation orders are “Owner's additional financial requirements”, “Delay in the completion date” and “Disputes & Poor professional relations between parties”

Keywords: Variation orders, Causes, Effects, Risk assessment, Construction projects.

Table of Content

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 BACKGROUND	1
1.2 PROBLEM STATEMENT.....	2
1.3 RESEARCH OBJECTIVE.....	3
1.4 THESIS LAYOUT	3
CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW	5
2.1 INTRODUCTION	5
2.2 DEFINITION	6
2.3 THE NATURE OF VARIATION ORDER	6
2.4 CAUSES OF VARIATION ORDERS	7
2.4.1 Owner Related Variations	8
2.4.2 Consultant Related Variations.....	10
2.4.3 Contractor Related Variations	13
2.4.4 Project Management Related Variations.....	15
2.4.5 Other Related Variations	16
2.5 EFFECTS OF VARIATION ORDERS:.....	17
2.5.1 Cost-Related Effects.....	19
2.5.2 Productivity Related Effects.....	20
2.5.3 Time-Related Effects	20
2.5.4 Organization Related Effects	21
CHAPTER THREE: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	22
3.1 INTRODUCTION	22
3.2 LITERATURE REVIEW	22
3.3 DATA COLLECTION	22
3.4 DEVELOP THE RESEARCH PLAN.....	23
3.5 CREATE QUESTIONNAIRE	26
3.6 QUESTIONNAIRE DESIGN.....	27
3.6.1 Questionnaire (1) causes of variation orders	27

3.6.1.1	The First Part: Respondents Background	27
3.6.1.2	The Second Part: Consists of Three Sections:.....	28
3.6.2	<i>Questionnaire (2): Effects of variation orders</i>	29
3.6.2.1	The First Part: Respondents Background	29
3.6.2.2	The Second Part: Consists of Three Sections:.....	30
CHAPTER FOUR: RESULTS AND DISCUSSION		32
4.1	INTRODUCTION	32
4.2	DATA COLLECTION	32
4.3	QUESTIONNAIRE (1): CAUSES OF VARIATION ORDERS	33
4.3.1	<i>Demographic Characteristics of Respondents</i>	33
4.3.2	<i>Data Validation</i>	37
4.3.3	<i>Analysis of Results</i>	39
4.3.4	<i>Factors and Groups That Causes Variations</i>	39
4.4	QUESTIONNAIRE (2): EFFECTS OF VARIATION ORDERS	76
4.4.1	<i>Demographic Characteristics of Respondents</i>	76
4.4.2	<i>Data Validation</i>	80
4.4.3	<i>Analysis of Results</i>	81
4.4.4	<i>Effects of Variation Orders Factors and Groups</i>	81
CHAPTER FIVE: CASE STUDY		108
5.1	INTRODUCTION:.....	108
5.2	PROJECT DESCRIPTION:	108
5.3	PROJECT STAKEHOLDERS:	109
5.4	STUDY FOR THE CAUSES OF VARIATION ORDERS OCCURRED IN THE PROJECT:	109
5.5	STUDY OF THE EFFECT OF VARIATION ORDERS ON THE PROJECT:	111
CHAPTER SIX: CONCLUSIONS & RECOMMENDATIONS.....		112
6.1	CONCLUSIONS	112
6.2	RECOMMENDATIONS	113
REFERENCES		115

List of Tables

List of Tables

Table 1: The Probability, severity, and experience scale.....	25
Table 2:Probability, severity according to PMBOK scale	25
Table 3: Demographic Characteristics of respondents.....	35
Table 4: Factors causing variation orders	40
Table 5: Probability & Severity weight scale	42
Table 6: Top Ten Most Frequent Factors Causing of Variation Orders .	42
Table 7: Top Ten Most Severe Factors Causing of Variation Orders.....	43
Table 8Table: Likert Scale for Method (1)	44
Table 9: Top Ten Most Risk Factors Causing of Variation Orders	44
Table 10: Top Five Least Risk Factors Causing of Variation Orders.....	45
Table 11: Group Causes of Variation Orders.....	45
Table 12: Ranking of Owner-Related Variations from Overall point of view	46
Table 13: Ranking of Consultant-Related Variations from Overall point of view.....	46
Table 14: Ranking of Contractor -Related Variations from Overall point of view.....	47

Table 15: Ranking of Project Management-Related Variations from Overall point of view	48
Table 16: Ranking of Others-Related Variations from Overall point of view	48
Table 17: Ranking of Causes of Variations in Descending Order According to Method (1).....	49
Table 18: Likert Scale - Method (2).....	51
Table 19: Top Ten Most Risk Factors Causing of Variation Orders	51
Table 20: Top Five Least Risk Factors Causing of Variation Orders.....	52
Table 21: Group Causes of Variation Orders.....	52
Table 22: Owner-Related Variations	52
Table 23: Consultant-Related Variation.....	53
Table 24: Contractor-Related Variations	53
Table 25: Project Management-Related Variations	54
Table 26: Others-Related Variations.....	55
Table 27: Factors Causing Variation Orders [Method (2)]	55
Table 28: Likert Scale - Method (3).....	57
Table 29: Top Ten Most Risk Factors Causing of Variation Orders	58
Table 30: Top Five Least Risk Factors Causing of Variation Orders.....	58
Table 31: Group Causes of Variation Orders.....	58
Table 32: Owner-Related Variations	59

Table 33: Consultant-Related Variations	59
Table 34: Contractor-Related Variations	60
Table 35: Project Management-Related Variations	61
Table 36: Others-Related Variations.....	61
Table 37: Ranking of Causes of Variations in Descending Order According to Method (3).....	62
Table 38: Likert Scale Method (4)	64
Table 39: Top Ten Most Risk Factors Causing of Variation Orders	64
Table 40: Top Five Least Risk Factors Causing of Variation Orders.....	64
Table 41: Group Causes of Variation Orders.....	65
Table 42: Owner-Related Variations	65
Table 43: Consultant-Related Variations	66
Table 44: Contractor-Related Variations	66
Table 45: Project Management-Related Variations	67
Table 46: Others-Related Variations.....	67
Table 47: Ranking of Causes of Variations in Descending Order According to Method (4).....	68
Table 48: Overall Ranking of Factors Causing Variation Orders	70
Table 49: Demographic Characteristics of respondents.....	77
Table 50: Factors Affected by Variation Orders.....	82

Table 51: Probability & Severity weight scale	83
Table 52: Top Five Most Frequent Factors Causing of Variation Orders	83
Table 53: Top Five Most Severe Factors Causing of Variation Orders..	84
Table 54: Likert Scale for Method (1)	85
Table 55: Top Five Risk Factors Affected by Variation Orders	86
Table 56: Top Five Least Risk Factors Affected by Variation Orders ...	86
Table 57: Group Causes of Variation Orders.....	86
Table 58: Ranking of Cost-Related Effects from Overall point of view	87
Table 59: Time-Related Effects from Overall point of view	87
Table 60: Organization-Related Effects from Overall point of view.....	87
Table 61: Ranking of Factors Affected by Variation Orders in Descending Order According to Method (1)	88
Table 62: Likert Scale - Method (2).....	89
Table 63: Top Five Risk Factors Affected by Variation Orders	89
Table 64: Top Five Least Risk Factors Affected by Variation Orders ...	90
Table 65: Group Causes of Variation Orders.....	90
Table 66: Cost-Related Effects from Overall point of view	91
Table 67: Cost-Related Effects from Overall point of view	91
Table 68: Organization-Related Effects from Overall point of view.....	91

Table 69: Ranking of Factors Affected by Variation Orders in Descending Order According to Method (2)	92
Table 70: Likert Scale - Method (3).....	93
Table 71: Top Five Risk Factors Affected by Variation Orders	93
Table 72: Top Five Least Risk Factors Causing of Variation Orders.....	94
Table 73: Group Causes of Variation Orders.....	94
Table 74: Cost-Related Effects from Overall point of view	95
Table 75: Time-Related Effects from Overall point of view	95
Table 76: Organization-Related Effects from Overall point of view.....	95
Table 77: Ranking of Factors Affected by Variation Orders in Descending Order According to Method (3)	96
Table 78: Likert Scale - Method (4).....	97
Table 79: Top Five Risk Factors Affected by Variation Orders	98
Table 80: Top Five Least Risk Factors Causing of Variation Orders.....	98
Table 81: Group Causes of Variation Orders.....	98
Table 82: Cost-Related Effects from Overall point of view	99
Table 83: Time-Related Effects from Overall point of view	99
Table 84: Organization-Related Effects from Overall point of view.....	99
Table 85: Ranking of Factors Affected by Variation Orders in Descending Order According to Method (4)	100