

Ain Shams University
Faculty of Al-Asun
Department of English



**Representing Palestinian and Israeli Identities in the CNN, *New York Times*, *Al-Ahram Weekly*, and Al Jazeera Websites:
A Critical Discourse Approach**

A Thesis

Submitted to the Department of English in fulfillment
of the requirements for the degree

of

Doctor of Philosophy

by

Hanan Sharaf el Dine M. Ahmed

Supervised by

Dr. Ahmed Seddik Al-Wahy

Associate Professor of Linguistics

Department of English

Faculty of Al-Asun

Ain Shams University

&

Dr. Abeer Ali El Attar

Lecturer in Linguistics

Department of English

Faculty of Al-Asun

Ain Shams University

2019

Acknowledgments

I would like to express my sincere gratitude to my advisor Associate Professor Ahmed Seddik Al-Wahy for his patience, motivation, and immense knowledge. His guidance helped me all through the writing of this thesis. I would also like to thank Dr. Abeer Ali El Attar for her continuous support and guidance, insightful comments, and encouragement. Dr. El Attar's meticulous review of my thesis and hard questions urged me to widen my research from various perspectives.

I would also like to thank Professor Laila Galal, Associate Professor Maha Fathi and Assistant Professor Mona Helmy, for their endless support and academic guidance. My sincere thanks also go to my colleagues at Misr International University, your zealous passion for knowledge and learning as well as your heartfelt prayers kept me going even on the darkest days.

Last but not least, I would like to thank my dear parents for believing in me, and my family for being there for me whenever I needed. Finally, I would like to express my deepest appreciation for my sons Mazen and Hady for understanding, at such a young age, the significance of my research endeavours, enduring my tantrums, running errands, and being the distinguished young men, they are.

Abstract

This study aims to compare the linguistic representation of Israelis and Palestinians in online articles of two Arab websites, *Al-Ahram Weekly* and Al Jazeera English, and two western websites, Cable News Network and *New York Times*, covering Israeli attacks against Gaza during Operation Cast Lead, which Israel launched against Gaza, on the last week of December 2008. This study relies on Fairclough's (2003) conception of critical discourse analysis (CDA), while utilizing Halliday's (2014) systemic functional grammar (SFG), van Leeuwen's (2008) soico-semantic inventory and Caldas-Coulthard's (2002) categorization of speech acts as tools of analysis. This theoretical and analytical framework is employed to investigate the way the four websites under study use representational and discursive strategies to represent Israeli and Palestinian actors. Findings suggest that the representation of Israeli and Palestinian actors is affected by the ideological stances of the reporting websites and the power relations between the groups involved in the conflict.

Key words: Critical discourse analysis, media discourse, representation of social actors, systemic functional grammar, ideology

Table of Contents

Acknowledgments.....	i
Abstract.....	ii
Table of Contents.....	iii
List of Abbreviations.....	xi
List of Figures.....	xii
List of Tables.....	xiii
Introduction.....	1
0.1 Context of the Study.....	1
0.2 Aim of the Study.....	3
0.3 Research Questions.....	4
0.4 Significance of the Study.....	5
0.5 Limitations of the Study.....	8
0.6 Methodology.....	8
0.6.1 Data selection.....	9
0.6.2 Procedures.....	9
0.6.3 Background of the event.....	11
0.7 Operational Definitions.....	13
0.7.1 Identity.....	13
0.7.2 Representation.....	14
0.7.3 Ideology.....	16
0.8 Thesis Outline.....	17

Chapter One: Theoretical Preliminaries.....	19
1.1 Introduction.....	19
1.2 Media Studies Development.....	20
1.2.1 Scope of media studies.....	21
1.2.2 Historical background.....	21
1.3 Approaches to Media Studies.....	22
1.3.1 The cognitive-empirical approach.....	23
1.3.2 The critical-speculative approach – The Frankfurt School.....	23
1.3.3 The cultural approach – The Birmingham School.....	25
1.3.4 The communication- technology approach.....	26
1.4 Electronic Media and Globalization.....	27
1.5 Linguistic Approaches to Media Studies.....	29
1.6 CDA and Media Studies.....	30
1.6.1 Approaches to CDA.....	31
<i>1.6.1.1 The socio-cognitive approach.....</i>	<i>32</i>
<i>1.6.1.2 The discourse historical approach.....</i>	<i>35</i>
<i>1.6.1.3 Fairclough’s socio-cultural approach.....</i>	<i>37</i>
<i>1.6.1.3.1 Three-dimensional framework.....</i>	<i>38</i>
<i>1.6.1.3.2 Fairclough’s influence on media studies.....</i>	<i>40</i>
<i>1.6.1.3.3 Fairclough speculations on media power and globalization....</i>	<i>42</i>
1.6.2 Avoiding criticism.....	43

1.7 Review of Literature.....	46
Chapter Two: Methodology.....	59
2.1 Introduction.....	59
2.2 Selected Data.....	59
2.2.1 Description of corpus and method of data selection.....	59
2.2.2 Background to the selected website.....	62
2.2.3 Online news reports.....	66
2.2.4 The role and importance of headlines in news reporting.....	67
2.2.4.1 <i>First element to attract reader's attention</i>	67
2.2.4.2 <i>Cognitive and ideological function of headlines</i>	68
2.3 Methodology.....	69
2.3.1 Quantitative analysis.....	70
2.3.2 Qualitative analysis.....	71
2.3.3 Text analysis.....	72
2.3.3.1 <i>Lexicalization</i>	73
2.3.3.2 <i>Transitivity</i>	75
2.3.3.3 <i>Agency</i>	75
2.3.4 Discursive practices.....	77

2.3.4.1 <i>Intertextuality</i>	77
2.3.4.1.1 <i>Types of quotation patterns</i>	78
2.3.4.1.2 <i>Speech acts and framing of social actors</i>	79
2.3.4.2 <i>Assumptions</i>	82
2.3.4.3 <i>Representation of Social Actors</i>	82
Chapter Three: Lexical Choices and Reference to Israeli and Palestinian Actors.....	91
3.1 Introduction.....	91
3.2 Labelling of Israeli and Palestinian Actors.....	92
3.2.1 Representing power relations through frequency distribution of actors.....	94
3.2.2 Reference to Israeli military actors and Palestinian resistance actors.....	96
3.2.2.1 <i>Israeli military actors</i>	97
3.2.2.2 <i>Palestinian resistance actors</i>	98
3.2.3 Reference to Israeli political actors and Palestinian political actors.....	101
3.2.3.1 <i>Israeli political actors</i>	102
3.2.3.2 <i>Palestinian political actors</i>	103
3.2.4 Reference to Israeli civilian actors and Palestinian civilian actors.....	104
3.2.4.1 <i>Israeli civilian actors</i>	104
3.2.4.2 <i>Palestinian civilian actors</i>	105
3.3 Expressive Value of Lexical Items in Headlines.....	106
3.3.1 Emotive language in headlines- visualizing the imbalance of power.....	109
3.3.2 Emotive language in headlines- victimizing Palestinians/Israelis.....	110
3.3.3 Emotive language in headlines- denouncing Hamas.....	112

3.4 Cognitive Function of Metaphors in headlines.....	114
3.4.1 Using metaphors to emphasize the universality of the conflict.....	116
3.4.2 Using metaphors to lay the blame somewhere else.....	117
3.5 Concluding Note.....	119

Chapter Four: Representation of Palestinian and Israeli Participants:

Actions and Roles.....	122
4.1 Introduction.....	122
4.2 Transitivity as a Strategy for Ideologically Representing Social Actors.....	122
4.3 Transitivity Selections and Representation of Israeli Participants in Arab Websites.....	126
4.3.1 Process types and roles of Israeli participants in <i>AAW</i>	126
4.3.1.1 <i>Israelis as active agents in AAW</i>	126
4.3.1.2 <i>Israelis as affected participants in AAW</i>	128
4.3.2 Process types and roles of Israeli participants in <i>AJE</i>	128
4.3.2.1 <i>Israelis as active agents in AJE</i>	129
4.3.2.2 <i>Israelis as affected participants in AJE</i>	131
4.4 Transitivity Selections and Representation of Israeli Participants in Western Websites.....	132
4.4.1 Process types and roles of Israeli participants in <i>CNN</i>	132
4.4.1.1 <i>Israelis as active agents in CNN</i>	133
4.4.1.2 <i>Israelis as affected participants in CNN</i>	136
4.4.2 Process types and roles of Israeli participants in <i>NYT</i>	137
4.4.2.1 <i>Israelis as active agents in NYT</i>	137
4.4.2.2 <i>Israelis as affected participants NYT</i>	139

4.5 Transitivity Selections and Representation of Palestinian Participants in Arab	
Websites.....	139
4.5.1. Process types and roles of Palestinian participants in <i>AAW</i>	139
4.5.1.1 <i>Palestinians as active agents in AWW</i>	140
4.5.1.2 <i>Palestinians as affected participants in AAW</i>	141
4.5.2. Process types and roles of Palestinian participants in <i>AJE</i>	142
4.5.2.1 <i>Palestinians as active agents in AJE</i>	142
4.5.2.2 <i>Palestinians as affected participants in AJE</i>	145
4.6 Transitivity Selection and Representation of Palestinian Participants in Western	
Websites.....	146
4.6.1 Process types and roles of Palestinian participants in <i>CNN</i>	146
4.6.1.1 <i>Palestinians as active agents in CNN</i>	146
4.6.1.2 <i>Palestinians as affected participants in CNN</i>	148
4.6.2 Process types and roles of Palestinian participants in <i>NYT</i>	150
4.6.2.1 <i>Palestinians as active agents in NYT</i>	150
4.6.2.2 <i>Palestinians as affected participants in NYT</i>	153
4.7 Concluding Note.....	154
Chapter Five: Socio-Semantic Representation of Social Actors.....	158
5.1 Introduction.....	158
5.2 Representational Categories.....	158
5.3 Inclusion and Exclusion of Social Actors.....	159
5.4 Inclusion and Exclusion of Social Actors Based on Themes....,	159
5.4.1 Military operations and representation of Israeli military actors.....	163

5.4.1.1 <i>Foregrounding and activation of military actors</i>	163
5.4.1.2 <i>Backgrounding of military actors</i>	164
5.4.1.3 <i>Passivation of military actors</i>	165
5.4.1.4 <i>Victimizing Israeli military actors</i>	166
5.4.1.5 <i>Justifying Israeli military actions</i>	167
5.4.1.6 <i>Accusing Israeli actors of war crimes</i>	168
5.4.2 Palestinian civilians and representation of victims.....	169
5.4.2.1 <i>Foregrounding of Palestinian civilians as victims</i>	170
5.4.2.2 <i>Contextual representation of victims in space and time</i>	174
5.4.2.3 <i>Targeting civilians at UN facilities</i>	175
5.4.3 Palestinian resistance.....	177
5.4.3.1 <i>Hamas role in Palestinian resistance</i>	177
5.4.4 Ceasefire and the representation of Hamas and Israeli Negotiators.....	179
5.5 Concluding Note.....	180
 Chapter Six: Intertextuality: Palestinian and Israeli Voices in Headlines	
6.1 Introduction.....	181
6.2 Access to the Media and Sources of the News.....	182
6.2.1 Frequency of Israeli and Palestinian sources in headlines.....	183
6.2.2 Frequency of External Sources in Headlines.....	186
6.3 Modes of Representing Voices in Headlines.....	188

6.4 Quoting Israeli Military and Political Sources.....	190
6.5 Quoting Hamas Sources.....	195
6.6 Quoting Palestinian Political Sources.....	198
6.7 Quoting Palestinian Civilian Sources.....	199
6.8 Quoting External Sources.....	202
6.9 Concluding Note.....	207
Conclusion.....	208
References.....	221
Appendices	238

List of Abbreviations

AAW.....	<i>Al-Ahram Weekly</i>
AJE	Al Jazeera English
CDA	Critical Discourse Analysis
CL.....	Critical Linguistics
CNN.....	Cable News Network
DHA.....	Discourse Historical Approach
DQ.....	Direct Quotation
IQ.....	Indirect Quotation
KWIC.....	Key Word in Context
NYT.....	<i>New York Times</i>
PNA.....	Palestinian National Authority
PSF.....	Preventive Security Forces
SFL.....	Systemic Functional Grammar
SQ.....	Strategic Quotation
TIQ.....	Transformed Indirect Quotation