AIN SHAMS UNIVERSITY

FACULTY OF ENGINEERING

Urban Planning

Bridging the Gap between Urban Planning and Urban Design Processes: Developing a Framework for the Egyptian Context

A Thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements of the degree of

Master of Science in Architectural Engineering

(Urban Planning)

by

Moureen Nazir Shawky Asaad

Bachelor of Science in Architectural Engineering

(Urban Planning)

Faculty of Engineering, Ain Shams University, 2013

Supervised By

Professor Dr. Marwa Abou Elfotouh Khalifa

Associate Professor Dr. Ahmed Sami Abd Elrahman

Associate Professor Dr. Mohamed Abdoh Elfayoumi

Cairo - (2018)

AIN SHAMS UNIVERSITY

FACULTY OF ENGINEERING

Urban Planning

Bridging the Gap between Urban Planning and Urban Design Processes: Developing a Framework for the Egyptian Context

A Thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements of the degree of

Master of Science in Architectural Engineering

(Urban Planning)

by

Moureen Nazir Shawky Asaad

Bachelor of Science in Architectural Engineering

(Urban Planning)

Faculty of Engineering, Ain Shams University, 2013

Examiners' Committee

Name and Affiliation	**Signature**
Prof. Sahar Abdel-Moneim Attia Architecture , Cairo University	…….
Prof. Ghada Farouk Hasan Urban Planning, Ain Shams University	…….
Prof. Marwa Abou Elfetouh Khalifa Urban Planning, Ain Shams University	…….
Ass. Prof. Ahmed Sami Abd ElRahman Urban Planning, University	…….
Ass. Prof. Mohamed Abdoh Elfayoumi Urban Planning, Ain Shams University	…….

Date: 17 July 2018

Statement

This thesis is submitted as a partial fulfilment of Master of Science in Architectural Engineering, Faculty of Engineering, Ain shams University.

The author carried out the work included in this thesis, and no part of it has been submitted for a degree or a qualification at any other scientific entity.

Moureen Nazir Shawky Asaad

Signature

……..…….

Date: / /2018

Researcher Data

Name	: Moureen Nazir Shawky Asaad
Date of Birth	: 15-06-1991
Place of Birth	: Cairo
Last Academic Degree	: 2013
Field of Specialization	: Urban planning and Design
University issued the degree	: Ain Shams University
Date of issued degree	: 2013
Current Job	: Teaching Assistant, Faculty of Engineering, Urban Planning and Design Department, Ain Shams University

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

An acknowledgement of appreciation to all those who have made the greatest impact on my life, academic career, and specifically this research, to all those whom without them my life wouldn't have made sense, my success would have never been celebrated, and all my downfalls would have never been recovered. First of all, and for most I thank God for His gracious gifts towards me, for giving me the opportunity and blessing to carry on this research, and direct me in this career, and for giving me exceedingly abundantly above all that I may ask or think. I thank God that He provides support through those around us, who believe in us and give us guidance in every step we take.

I would like to thank my Dear doctors and mentors who believed in my abilities and always challenged me to reach the best version of what I can do; professor Marwa for her endless patience, Dr. Ahmed Sami for always believing in me and pushing me forward, and Dr. Mohamed Elfayoumi for his constant care and support.

I would like to dedicate this work to my beloved father, may his soul rest in peace, for he has always been my role model, and he has given me the brilliance of speech, and taught me persistence in life. I thank my dearest mother who has always been my hero, my rock, my biggest fan, for she has always given me strength to carry on, and who taught me that anything can be achieved perfectly by prayer, patience and hard work, mum, you are the strongest woman I have even met in my life, thank you for being who you are. I thank my brother who has always provided help and resources in every way possible, and I always felt his presence despite his travel. I thank my beloved fiancé Amir, who have always given me hope, support, and cheered me up and was there every step of my way, through all the ups and downs, I couldn't have completed this without you. I would love to thank my very supportive family, especially my dearest cousins.

I would love to thank my amazing friends who have always been there for me, provided support in every way possible and got my back every single day, Haidy, Nada, Reem, Aya, Marina, Demyana, David, you're not just my friends, you're my second family.

I would love to thank all my supportive friends and colleagues, especially Merham Keleg for all the knowledge she always shared, and Dr. Ayat Ismail for giving me some guidance along the thesis path. I thank all those who helped in the interviews and survey, may God fill your lives with blessings and success.

PREFACE:

As an urban design and urban planning student , seeking to understand what urban design is, was one of the main reasons I joined the urban planning and design department, and throughout my years of study which have been directed by some of the greatest Egyptian professors and doctors, I kept on wondering why do I not understand clearly the relationship between all 3 disciplines architecture, urban design and urban planning, and more specifically urban design and planning. I understood how urban design works in terms of academic projects and in terms of practices and how to provide a thorough data collection and analysis, develop objectives and reach a good urban design concept all the way to developing options, evaluation and implementation, yet I always wondered how this can be linked to urban planning. And then I graduated with a weak understanding to how the process from an operational perspective works yet knowing what to do when it comes to practice. As I proceeded in my post graduate studies I was seeking such knowledge, and in my search journey for a motive for my research it all started with an observation. It seems that we do have professionals and practitioners in Egypt who taught us the know-how of the practice and who actually work on various urban design projects; however, observing the urban design product within the city especially Cairo, made me wonder; How come that the city generally lacks the basic urban design principles of livability, legibility, walkability, and other urban design principles? And this question has lead me, along with my previous question concerning urban design relationship with planning to search within the process itself. If something is wrong with the urban design product, then we need to check the process. If a factory is to produce cars, and the product is found to be a 4-wheeled bicycle instead, we should not blame it on the bicycle, we should examine the entire process that lead to such product, to identify what went wrong? Similarly, if a city seeks to produce an urban design product and it turned out to be something different, and noticeably inefficient, then something should be wrong with the process taken to create such a product.

The conducted research has been a result of a 2-year research which witnessed many turns of events and multiple changes to the expected research methodology, results, sequence or even research techniques. Discussing such a large topic such as the relationship between 2 huge disciplines urban design and planning, cannot be covered from all aspects in such a limited research. However, the research aims to shed a light on a topic that could be of interest to multiple disciplines, and it is going to mainly be discussed in breadth to cover several aspects and relationships of both disciplines, and what is discussed in breath cannot possibly be studied simultaneously in depth within a time and data bounded research.

The thesis aims to answer several questions mainly around the urban design process and how it relates to the urban planning process all the way to ensuring the implementation of a good urban design process within the city.

ABSTRACT:

Urban Design in the Egyptian context is facing major challenges, not only in terms of principles application or a certain problem with the urban product in specific areas, but also in the core of its understanding, values and process. The Major defining element of urban design is by the Unified Egyptian law 119/2008 which defines urban design as a group of individual or connected buildings with public or private use on a single land parcel. The offered definition contradicts the meaning of urban design in any international understanding. Incorporating such understanding to urban design as a part of the detailed plans on local level creates a gap between planning and the urban design product in the city.

The urban product in Egypt lacks the basic considerations or principles which urban design aims to achieve in any city. The current status of urban design requires a thorough study to what it should be like, not in terms of the product, but starting the beginning of the process; how it connects with the planning process, and how to create a successful urban design process, leading to a good urban design product within the Egyptian context.

Urban Design discipline is facing similar challenges from a theoretical perspective; where urban design process is not properly defined in theory, and the gap between urban design and planning is considered a well-known problem in the literature of urban design. Consequently, developing an understanding to urban design process, what it should be like, and how it connects to planning process requires a dual investigation on both theoretical and practical levels to reach a proper framework for the Egyptian context.

KEY WORDS

Urban Design process, Urban planning process, Multi-disciplinary, Gap, success considerations, framework

ACRONYMS:

Chapter 2:

CABE	Commission for Architecture and the Built Environment (UK)
DETR	The Department of the Environment, Transport and the Regions (UK)
RIBA	Royal Institute of British Architects

Chapter 3:

CIAM	Congrès Internationaux d'Architecture Moderne
NUP	National Urban Policy

Chapter 5

NPPF	National planning policy framework (UK)
UDG	Urban Design Group
SPG	Supplementary planning guidance (UK)
PPS	planning policy statement (UK)
COAG	council of Australian governments
PIA	The Planning institute of Australia
SVIR	The National Policy strategy for infrastructure and Spatial planning (Netherlands)
FSC	Federal Supreme Council of UAE
UPC	Urban planning council of UAE
SNDU	National Secretariat for Urban Development in Brazil
SNPS	the national system of social participation in Brazil
PNPS	the national social participation policy in Brazil

Chapter 6

CAPMAS	Central Agency for Public Mobilization and Statistics
CBD	Central Business District
GOPP	General organization of physical planning
LPC	Local Popular Council
MALR	Ministry of Agriculture & Land Reclamation
MHUUD	Ministry of Housing, Utilities, Urban development
MWRI	Ministry of Water resource and Irrigation
NOUH	National Organization of Urban Harmony
NUCA	New urban Communities Authority
SCPUD	The Supreme Council of Planning and Urban Development

Gemeente Amsterdam: Municipality of Amsterdam

Existing Urban Mass: the existing districts and urban areas within the city that have appeared and were completed before the new cities establishment (Nasr city, Heliopolis, Maadi, etc..)

APPENDICES

Appendix A ……..……..199
Appendix B……....212

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgement i
Preface: ii
Abstract: iii
Key Words iii
Acronyms: iv
Appendices v
Table of Contents v
List of Figures: xi
List of Tables: xii
1. Chapter 1: Introduction 1
1.1 Introduction to Research Topic: The research importance within global and Egyptian concerns 1
1.2 Research Problem 2
1.3 Research Aim and Objectives 3
1.3.1 Objectives 3
1.4 Main Research Questions 3
1.5 Methodology 4
1.6 Thesis Structure: 6
2. Chapter 2: Defining the Urban Design Process: A theoretical perspective 10
2.1 Introduction: 10
2.2 Introduction to urban design emergence 10
2.3 The urban design process defining elements: 10
2.3.1 Defining urban design term: 12
2.3.2 Objectives: 21
2.3.3 Stakeholders: 25
2.3.4 Process flow: 29
2.3.5 The Multi- Disciplinary Nature (other relations): 38

2.3.6 Relationship with urban planning: 40
2.4 How to work from here (conclusion) 40
3. Chapter 3: The Urban Design Process reality, and the Multi-disciplinary Gap 43
3.1 Introduction 43
3.2 A critical analysis to urban design theoretical dreams 43
3.2.1 Urban design definition 43
3.2.2 Urban Design Objectives: 44
3.2.3 Urban Design Stakeholders: 45
3.2.4 Urban Design Process flow: 45
3.2.5 Relationship between urban design and other disciplines: 46
3.2.6 Relationship between urban design and Urban planning: 48
3.2.7 Concluding criticism: 48
3.3 The truth about urban design; the unbridged Gap 50
3.3.1 A Historical background: 51
3.3.2 How was urban Design practiced? 54
3.3.3 Urban design and architecture relationship: 55
3.3.4 Urban Design and Planning relationship: 55
3.3.5 The Gap: 57
3.4 Current situation. Where does urban design stand? (conclusion) 58
4. Chapter 4: Urban design process success criteria despite all failures 61
4.1 Introduction 61
4.2 What makes good urban design? 61
4.3 The Lack of success criteria for urban design process: 62
4.4 The need for criteria for a successful Urban Design Process 62
4.5 Considerations for successful urban design process: 64
4.5.1 Theoretical considerations: 64
4.5.2 Considerations drawn from criticism: 67
4.5.3 Considerations from international organizations and agencies 70
4.5.4 All Considerations: 72
4.6 Conclusions: 78
5. Chapter 5: Case Studies: verifying the success considerations for the urban design process 82
5.1 Introduction: 82
5.2 Case Study Selection 82

5.3 Introduction to Case studies 84
5.4 Case study 1: United Kingdom 86
5.4.1 Definition in context 90
5.4.2 Objectives 90
5.4.3 Evaluation Tool 91
5.4.4 Context awareness 91
5.4.5 Stakeholders identification & participation 91
5.4.6 Iterative process 91
5.4.7 Institutional levels incorporation and synergy 92
5.4.8 National Urban policy 92
5.4.9 Guiding documents and regulations 92
5.4.10 Legislations 92
5.4.11 Economic value 93
5.4.12 Urban Design leading development 93
5.4.13 Slum upgrading approach 93
5.5 Case Study 2: Australia 94
5.5.1 Definition in context 96
5.5.2 Objectives 97
5.5.3 Evaluation tool 97
5.5.4 Context awareness 97
5.5.5 Stakeholders identification & participation 97
5.5.6 Iterative process 98
5.5.7 Institutional levels incorporation and synergy 98
5.5.8 National Urban policy 98
5.5.9 Guiding documents and regulations 98
5.5.10 Legislations 99
5.5.11 Economic value 99
5.5.12 Urban Design leading development 99
5.5.13 Slum upgrading approach 99
5.6 Case Study 3: Netherlands 100
5.6.1 Definition in context 104
5.6.2 Objectives 104
5.6.3 Evaluation tool 104