



Enhancing End-User Involvement in the Facilities Design Process using Mobile Augmented Reality

By

Bassam Ashraf Mahmoud Shouman

A Thesis Submitted to the
Faculty of Engineering at Cairo University
In Partial Fulfilment of the
Requirements for the Degree of
MASTER OF SCIENCE
In
Integrated Engineering Design in Construction Projects

FACULTY OF ENGINEERING, CAIRO UNIVERSITY
GIZA, EGYPT
2019

Enhancing End-User Involvement in the Facilities Design Process using Mobile Augmented Reality

By

Bassam Ashraf Mahmoud Shouman

A Thesis Submitted to the
Faculty of Engineering at Cairo University
In Partial Fulfilment of the
Requirements for the Degree of
MASTER OF SCIENCE
In
Integrated Engineering Design in Construction Projects

Under supervision of

Prof. Mohamed Mahdy Marzouk

Prof. Ayman Ahmed Ezzat Othman

Professor of Construction Engineering
and Management
Structural Engineering Department
Faculty of Engineering, Cairo University

Professor of Construction and Project
Management
Architectural Engineering Department.
Faculty of Engineering, British University
in Egypt

FACULTY OF ENGINEERING, CAIRO UNIVERSITY
GIZA, EGYPT
2019

Enhancing End-User Involvement in the Facilities Design Process using Mobile Augmented Reality

By

Bassam Ashraf Mahmoud Shouman

A Thesis Submitted to the
Faculty of Engineering at Cairo University
In Partial Fulfilment of the
Requirements for the Degree of
MASTER OF SCIENCE
In
Integrated Engineering Design in Construction Projects

Approved by the Examining Committee:

Prof. Mohamed Mahdy Marzouk Thesis Main Advisor
Professor of Construction Engineering and Management – Structural Engineering Department – Cairo University.

Prof. Ayman Ahmed Ezzat Othman Thesis Advisor
Professor of Construction and Project Management – Architectural Engineering Department – British University in Egypt.

Prof. Ayman Hassan Ahmed Mahmoud Internal Examiner
Professor of Architecture – Architectural Engineering Department – Cairo University.

Prof. Mostafa Refat Ahmed Ismail External Examiner
Professor of Architecture – Architectural Engineering Department – Ain Shams University.

FACULTY OF ENGINEERING, CAIRO UNIVERSITY
GIZA, EGYPT
2019

Engineer's Name: Bassam Ashraf Mahmoud Shouman
Date of Birth: 23/12/1992
Nationality: Egyptian
E-mail: shoumanbassam@gmail.com
Phone: 002-01120646664
Address: Nasr City, Cairo.
Registration Date: 01/10/2016
Awarding Date: / /2019
Degree: Master of Science
Department: Integrated Engineering Design in Construction Projects



Supervisors:

Prof. Mohamed Mahdy Marzouk (Thesis Main Advisor)
Prof. Ayman Ahmed Ezzat Othman – British University in Egypt

Examiners:

Prof. Mohamed Mahdy Marzouk – Cairo University (Thesis Main Advisor)
Prof. Ayman Ahmed Ezzat Othman – British University in Egypt (Thesis Advisor)
Prof. Ayman Hassan Ahmed Mahmoud – Cairo University (Internal Examiner)
Prof. Mostafa Refat Ahmed Ismail – Ain Shams University (External Examiner)

Title of Thesis:

Enhancing End-User Involvement in the Facilities Design Process using Mobile Augmented Reality

Keywords:

End-user involvement; Mobile Augmented Reality; interactivity; interactive design projects; facilities design.

Summary:

Mobile augmented reality is one of the advanced 3D representation tools that has been utilized in several industries and specifically in the field of Construction. This research is built up upon exploring the immersive experiences MAR create for end-users which allows them to be part of the design process. In addition, the motives of developing a MAR application is based upon identifying the downsides of end-user involvement approaches that has been classified as co-design and user-centered design. Moreover, through reviewing literature practices in MAR field, an android compatible application is developed which is able to represent design alternatives through dynamic markers where end-users can change wall locations, interior and exterior wall materials thus, creating an immersive end-user experience. In-order to evaluate the impact of MAR, the application is experimented with 33 participants on an actual case study which is British University in Egypt's Library that is modelled using 3Ds Max, followed by survey questionnaires to gather the required data. Then, the acquired data has been analyzed using SPSS where results indicated that MAR showed a positive impact on enhancing end-user involvement and design understanding of the project. It also allowed them to produce different design alternatives in comparison to the traditional approach where end-users were constrained by the available tools thus, showing low design interaction and understanding. Finally, end-users suggested that for future work, more interactive features will make the application easier to deal with and that professionals should adopt and standardize such ideas in future design projects.

Acknowledgments

First, I would like to thank God for giving me the opportunity, strength and knowledge to make this Master`s thesis possible and I hope it will be a stepping stone towards a great contribution and benefit to professionals and the Construction Industry. Also, I am beholden to my great supervisor Prof. Dr. Mohamed Mahdy Marzouk for his time, continuous guidance at very critical aspects of the research, connections to people who gave me guidance at points that was critical to my research and the endless efforts that was invested in completing this Master`s Thesis. I would also like to thank my mentor, Professor and Head of Department at the British University in Egypt, Prof. Dr. Ayman Ahmed Ezzat Othman for his guidance to make such success possible. Also, it is worth to mention that Eng. Aliaa Zaher offered a helping hand in the chosen case study which had a great impact on my study. I would also like to thank the external examiners for their time and valuable comments that helped me to improve this work and getting this research done.

Furthermore, I am sure that words will not fulfil what I have towards my Family that stood with me in every aspect whether its closely related to the master`s or not. The support I had for completing this master thesis was tremendous. I would also like to express my gratitude for my work colleagues at The British University in Egypt who gave me a helping hand and guidance towards completing my master thesis. Special mentions for this thesis would go for my Parents, my brothers Mohamed Shouman and Mustafa Shouman and those who contributed to the research by participating in the experiment from students to academic staff members.

Bassam Ashraf Mahmoud Shouman
May 29th, 2019

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....	I
TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	II
LIST OF TABLES.....	IV
LIST OF FIGURES.....	V
NOMENCLATURE.....	VIII
ABSTRACT.....	IX
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION.....	1
1.1 General.....	1
1.2 Problem Statement.....	1
1.3 Research Objectives.....	2
1.4 Research Questions.....	2
1.5 Research Scope and Limitations.....	2
1.6 Research methodology.....	3
1.7 Research hypothesis.....	4
1.8 Thesis organization.....	4
CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW.....	5
2.1 General.....	5
2.2 End-user involvement in the design process.....	5
2.3 End-user Involvement Approaches.....	6
2.4 Co-design tools and techniques.....	8
2.5 Augmented Reality: An Overview.....	10
2.6 Mobile Augmented Reality architecture.....	12
2.6.1 Software platforms.....	12
2.6.2 Authoring tools.....	13
2.6.3 Display devices.....	13
2.6.4 Registration and tracking.....	17
2.7 Mobile Augmented Reality in Architecture and Construction.....	22
2.8 Summary and Research gap.....	26
CHAPTER 3: PROPOSED FRAMEWORK.....	27
3.1 General.....	27
3.2 Mobile Augmented Reality Framework.....	27
3.2.1 Case study modelling.....	28
3.2.2 Defining an image target.....	30
3.2.3 Data linkage to Unity.....	31
3.2.4 User-interface development.....	33
3.2.5 Data linkage to mobile device.....	36
3.2.6 Application main interface.....	36
3.3 Summary.....	40
CHAPTER 4: DATA COLLECTION AND ANALYSIS DESIGN.....	41

4.1	General.....	41
4.2	Data collection strategy.....	41
4.2.1	Experiment design.....	41
4.2.2	Questionnaire design.....	42
4.3	Sampling Strategy.....	44
4.3.1	Sample size calculation.....	44
4.3.2	Response rates.....	45
4.4	Data analysis strategy.....	46
4.4.1	Statistical analysis test.....	46
4.4.2	SPSS software analysis.....	48
4.5	Summary.....	52
CHAPTER 5: FRAMEWORK IMPLEMENTATION.....		53
5.1	General.....	53
5.2	Case study description and goals.....	53
5.3	Experiment inputs.....	54
5.4	Experiment outputs.....	56
5.4.1	Pre-test scenario.....	56
5.4.2	Post-test scenario.....	59
5.5	Experiment results.....	63
5.6	Summary.....	63
CHAPTER 6: RESULTS AND FINDINGS.....		64
6.1	General.....	64
6.2	Results validity approach.....	64
6.2.1	Fisher`s p-value testing.....	64
6.2.2	Effect size testing.....	65
6.3	Study results.....	65
6.3.1	Participants information.....	65
6.3.2	General knowledge.....	67
6.3.3	Approach complexity.....	68
6.3.4	Design interpretation.....	70
6.3.5	Interaction based Analysis.....	74
6.3.6	Tools and application assessment.....	77
6.4	Study findings.....	80
6.5	Summary.....	81
CHAPTER 7: CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....		82
7.1	Research conclusion.....	82
7.2	Research contributions.....	82
7.3	Research limitations.....	82
7.4	Recommendations for future research.....	83
REFERENCES.....		84
APPENDIX A: EXPERIMENT AND SURVEY GUIDANCE.....		93
APPENDIX B: PRE-TEST SURVEY QUESTIONNAIRE.....		95
APPENDIX C: POST-TEST SURVEY QUESTIONNAIRE.....		98
APPENDIX D: TABLE FOR STANDARD NORMAL DISTRIBUTION..		102

List of Tables

Chapter 2

Table 2.1: Comparison between AR authoring tools [30].....	13
Table 2.2: Comparison between different AR display devices [33].....	17
Table 2.3: Sensor components in Augmented Reality [47].....	19
Table 2.4: Comparison between tracking systems in Augmented Reality [45].....	21

Chapter 4

Table 4.1: Experimental study design procedures [63].....	42
Table 4.2: Pre-test survey questionnaire design.....	43
Table 4.3: Post-test survey questionnaire design.....	43
Table 4.4: Population sampling categories framework [69].....	44
Table 4.5: Illustration of parametric and non-parametric analysis decision tree [88].....	47
Table 4.6: Example of Ranks generated by Wilcoxon signed rank test.....	52
Table 4.7: Example of Test statistics generated by Wilcoxon signed rank test.....	53

Chapter 6

Table 6.1: Descriptive statistics results for approach complexity.....	68
Table 6.2: Wilcoxon signed-rank results for approach complexity.....	68
Table 6.3: Test statistics results for approach complexity.....	69
Table 6.4: Descriptive statistics results for design interpretation.....	71
Table 6.5: Wilcoxon signed-rank results for design interpretation.....	72
Table 6.6: Test statistics results for design interpretation.....	73
Table 6.7: Descriptive statistics results for interaction-based assessment.....	74
Table 6.8: Wilcoxon signed-rank results for interaction-based assessment.....	75
Table 6.9: Test statistics results for interaction-based assessment.....	75
Table 6.10: Descriptive statistics results for tool and application assessment.....	77
Table 6.11: Wilcoxon signed-rank results for tool and application assessment.....	78
Table 6.12: Test statistics results for tool and application assessment.....	78

List of Figures

Chapter 2

Figure 2.1: RIBA plan of work 2013 [10].....	5
Figure 2.2: Co-design as a subset of Co-creation [19].....	7
Figure 2.3: Co-design process and methods in a Design project [20].....	8
Figure 2.4: End-user's knowledge vs methods used [6].....	9
Figure 2.5: Co-designing patients' room through sketching and drawing [19].....	9
Figure 2.6: Co-designing patients' room using 3D physical models [19].....	10
Figure 2.7: Co-designing through collage and physical models [20].....	10
Figure 2.8: From reality to virtual environment [24].....	11
Figure 2.9: Augmented Reality historical timeline [26].....	11
Figure 2.10: AR architecture using mobile display device [28].....	12
Figure 2.11: Different Display devices from users' point of view [33].....	14
Figure 2.12: Video See through HMD [35].....	14
Figure 2.13: Optical See-through HMD [35].....	15
Figure 2.14: Hand-held display device [36].....	15
Figure 2.15: Spatial device setup for AR setup using Projectors [38].....	16
Figure 2.16: Different registration accuracies [45].....	18
Figure 2.17: Tracking types for a successful 3D Model registration [46].....	18
Figure 2.18: Marker-based tracking of a target image [50].....	20
Figure 2.19: Markerless-based tracking of natural features [51].....	21
Figure 2.20: Collaborative design platform table [54].....	22
Figure 2.21: Visualizing 3D models using AR systems [55].....	23
Figure 2.22: ARTS system used to train site workers [56].....	23
Figure 2.23: Use of Mobile AR systems and GPS to detect infrastructure works [57].....	24
Figure 2.24: Formwork QR code plan [58].....	25
Figure 2.25: Formwork assembly using marker-based targets [58].....	25

Chapter 3

Figure 3.1: Walls modifications on 3Ds Max.....	28
Figure 3.2: Floor plan modifications on 3Ds Max.....	29
Figure 3.3: Example of UVW mapping to a wall element.....	29

Figure 3.4: 3D interior floor plan.....	30
Figure 3.5: Marker image used.....	30
Figure 3.6: Uploading the image to Vuforia's target manager.....	31
Figure 3.7: Re-allocating 3D model and target database to Unity project folder.....	31
Figure 3.8: Importing 3D asset and Image target package.....	32
Figure 3.9: Generating a license key for the application.....	32
Figure 3.10: Linking 3D Model to a 2D AR Marker.....	33
Figure 3.11: Material change scripts added to walls in MAR Application.....	34
Figure 3.12: Movement scripts added to 3D model units in MAR Application.....	35
Figure 3.13: Android Package that allows for .apk extension exporting.....	36
Figure 3.14: Final MAR application Interface.....	37
Figure 3.15: Dynamic material changes using MAR application.....	38
Figure 3.16: Interior walls material change using MAR application.....	38
Figure 3.17: Exterior wall material assignment using MAR application.....	39
Figure 3.18: Interior wall movement using MAR application.....	39

Chapter 4

Figure 4.1: Inserting pre and post data into separate SPSS files.....	49
Figure 4.2: Combining the necessary pre and post data required for comparison.....	49
Figure 4.3: Steps required for choosing Wilcoxon signed rank test.....	50
Figure 4.4: Steps required to insert data for comparison.....	50
Figure 4.5: Probability distribution model of a standard normal curve [100].....	51

Chapter 5

Figure 5.1: The British University in Egypt's Library.....	53
Figure 5.2: BUE Library Ground floor plan.....	54
Figure 5.3: BUE Library group study area space.....	55
Figure 5.4: BUE Library location of reception desk.....	55
Figure 5.5: Experiment task one using co-design tools.....	56
Figure 5.6: Experiment task two using co-design tools.....	57
Figure 5.7: Experiment task three using co-design tools.....	58
Figure 5.8: Experiment task four using co-design tools.....	58
Figure 5.9: Experiment task five using co-design tools.....	59

Figure 5.10: Experiment task one using MAR application.....	60
Figure 5.11: Experiment task two using MAR application.....	60
Figure 5.12: Experiment task three using MAR application.....	61
Figure 5.13: Experiment task four using MAR application.....	62
Figure 5.14: Experiment task five using MAR application.....	62

Chapter 6

Figure 6.1: Participants academic rank.....	66
Figure 6.2: Participants gender.....	66
Figure 6.3: Participants age range.....	67
Figure 6.4: End-users knowledge of co-design tools and MAR approach.....	67
Figure 6.5: Improving end-user`s interactivity through enhanced MAR User interface.....	77
Figure 6.6: Functionality test results of MAR application.....	80
Figure 6.7: Recommendations of MAR implementation in Construction industry.....	80

Nomenclature

2D	2-Dimensional
3D	3-Dimensional
AECO	Architecture, Engineering, Construction, and facility Operations
ANOVA	Analysis of variance
ANCOVA	Analysis of covariance
APK	Android Package
AR	Augmented Reality
AV	Augmented Virtuality
BUE	British University in Egypt
CAD	Computer Aided Design
HMD	Head-Mounted Display
HHD	Hand-held Display
IMU	Inertial Measurement Unit
MAR	Mobile Augmented Reality
MR	Mixed Reality
PD	Participatory Design
QR	Quick Response
RIBA	Royal Institute of British Architects
SAS	Statistical Analysis System
SD	Spatial Display
SDK	Software Development Kit
SPSS	Statistical Package for the Social Sciences
STATA	Statistics and Data
UCD	User-Centered Design
USB	Universal Serial Bus
UI	User Interface
VR	Virtual Reality

Abstract

Mobile Augmented Reality (MAR) is one of the advanced 3D representation tools that is used on a broad scale across many industries such as construction, historical sites and other engineering disciplines. This research is built up upon exploring the capabilities of MAR and the immersive experience it creates for end-users which allows them to interact with any model and be part of the design process. In addition, developing a mobile augmented reality application to engage end-users is based upon identifying common end-user involvement approaches adopted in the design process which is classified as co-design and user-centered design. Moreover, through reviewing literature best practices in mobile augmented reality field, an android compatible application is developed through *Unity*, a game development platform and *Vuforia*, an application development platform. The developed application is capable of representing different design alternatives through dynamic markers where end-users can change wall locations and interior and exterior wall materials as desired. Thus, the application creates an immersive end-user experience that is experimented on an actual case study which is The British University in Egypt's library that is 3D modelled using 3Ds Max.

In-order to evaluate the impact of mobile augmented reality in relation to the existing co-design tools, the application is experimented with 33 participants in a drawing room where they have the chance to experience the existing co-design tools and the MAR application, followed by survey questionnaires to gather the required quantitative data. In addition, the data acquired is analyzed, evaluated and compared to the current practices that are identified from the Literature. The results acquired indicated that mobile augmented reality shows a positive review towards enhancing end-user Involvement, interaction and better design understanding of project. It also allows end-users to produce different design alternatives in comparison to the traditional approach where end-users are constrained by the tools therefore, showing low design interaction and lack of 3D model understanding. Finally, end-users suggested that for future work, more interactive features would make the application interesting and easier to deal with and for professionals to adopt and standardize the process in design projects.

Chapter 1 : Introduction

1.1. General

Successful construction projects are designed and built to meet end-user needs. Those needs are fulfilled in either the design of form and function of a single space or an entire project. Also, end-user needs are believed to be unique for each project and thus, should be incorporated in the design process to ensure a successful project delivery. In order to capture those needs and convert it into a consistent design, a precise yet systematic approach to end-user involvement is required. Moreover, it is necessary to interpret end-users background, environment and the expected future use of the facility in order to design an approach where end-user needs are included at the right times throughout the design and construction process [1]. In this highlight, Augmented Reality has been proven as a strong platform in the Architecture, Engineering and Construction sector for its ability to superimpose 3D models and information using computer-generated graphics in the physical world [2]. Having the ability to represent Design alternatives in reality, could open up possibilities to enhance the current end-user involvement practices which is the focus of this study. Thus, the research is focused onto the study of the utilizing Augmented Reality technology using mobile devices into enhancing end-user's involvement in the Architectural design process.

1.2. Problem Statement

In construction industry, it is important for the designers to understand client needs and expectations to produce a well-designed building that matches the required level of performance and have a positive impact on end-users. Participatory approaches, especially at early stages of the design process, help designers understand and enforce end-users decisions to avoid disagreements with the design outcomes and reduce changes in the design [3]. In addition, throughout the facility design process, end-users are traditionally involved through two main approaches that include: User-centered design and Co-design. Those two approaches have always been used in early design stages where end-users have the chance to design along with the architect to shape the final building output [3]. However, one of the difficulties of adopting participatory approaches in general is that end-users are not either used to the communication language or the design representations used by architects, which hinders the involvement process as found in [4].

In a research conducted by Norouzi et al. [5], stating that the design process stands as one of the most challenging stages that affects the final building output, where inefficient design communication language to involve end-users is still common. Moreover, the usage of the current Co-design tools and techniques are faced with drawbacks as for initiating a design dialogue with non-expert clients because they are neither able to understand drawings and 3D digital models which the words of this language are, nor familiar with its structure. In another research developed by Visser et al. [6], reporting that the most common end-users involvement strategy in a building design process is approached through co-design which depends on several tools and techniques such as brainstorming sessions, sketching design ideas, developing 2D CAD drawings and 3D digital models, where the need for an innovative tools and solutions to help end-users say, do and make what they dream of is still crucial.

Moreover, Kassem et al. [7] reported that the traditional methods used by architects to communicate design information to end-users and other professionals in the same industry is through computer programs such AutoCAD 2D or paper drawings, while such approach is able to deliver good amount of information, yet it does require a prior level of experience and technical knowledge to understand such information. In addition, the representation of a three-dimensional (3D) project on a paper-based manner is inefficient in terms of time required to collect and represent acquired information, errors occurring between drawings and possible misunderstandings between what is actually conveyed in the 3D model and the technical drawings. Based upon this, it has been argued that non-professionals may have difficulty in understanding technical drawings and could turn out to be impossible without professional support [7]. Therefore, in order to overcome the current end-users involvement obstacles, it could be clearly stated that the need for an enhanced strategy for communicating the design process to involve end-users should be studied.

1.3. Research Objectives

The main objective of this research is to identify the impact of Mobile Augmented Reality on end-user involvement in the design process of an architectural project in-comparison to the existing co-design tools. In order to achieve the main research objective, the following sub-objectives are carried out:

1. Identify current end-user involvement strategies, Augmented Reality potentials and benefits to the Architectural design process.
2. Develop a framework for creating a Mobile Augmented Reality application to enhance end-user involvement in the Architectural design process.
3. Experiment Mobile Augmented Reality application and co-design tools on a case study to evaluate end-user's involvement experiences using both approaches.
4. Analyze the results acquired from Mobile Augmented Reality experimental study and survey questionnaires to conclude the patterns of enhancements towards end-user involvement experiences.

1.4. Research Questions

The research questions are aimed towards examining the following points:

1. What are the latest end-user involvement approaches adopted in the construction industry?
2. What are the limitations of the current participatory approaches?
3. What are the benefits and potentials of MAR in the construction industry?
4. How to develop an interactive MAR application that serves the design process?
5. What is the impact of MAR on end-user's involvement in comparison to participatory approaches?

1.5. Research Scope and Limitations

The research scope embraces the utilization of Augmented Reality technology in the Architectural profession using mobile devices to enhance the current practices of end-user involvement in the design process. The developed application can be used to simulate a pre-made interior 3D models along with scripts that allow movement of walls, re-allocation of furniture and changing materials of floors, interior and exterior walls to open up possibilities for end-user interaction. However, the research scope is limited to the design process of the architectural profession and does not guarantee that the proposed application could be