



Cairo University

**AN EVALUATION MODEL FOR GREEN WALL DESIGN
ALTERNATIVES IN OUTDOOR PUBLIC SPACES**

By

Abdallah Ahmed ElHady Saad ElNaggar

A Thesis Submitted to the
Faculty of Engineering at Cairo University
In Partial Fulfilment of the
Requirements for the Degree of
DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY
In
Architectural Engineering

FACULTY OF ENGINEERING, CAIRO UNIVERSITY
GIZA, EGYPT

2020

**AN EVALUATION MODEL FOR GREEN WALL DESIGN
ALTERNATIVES IN OUTDOOR PUBLIC SPACES**

By

Abdallah Ahmed ElHady Saad ElNaggar

A Thesis Submitted to the
Faculty of Engineering at Cairo University
In Partial Fulfilment of the
Requirements for the Degree of
DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY
In
Architectural Engineering

Under the Supervision of

Prof. Dr. Amr Mostafa El-Halafawy

**Professor of
Architecture & Urban Design
Architecture Department
Faculty of Engineering,
Cairo University**

Dr. Rasha Abd El-Rahman Moussa

**Assistant Professor of
Architecture and Urban Design
& Head of Architecture Department
College of Architecture and Design
Alasala Colleges**

FACULTY OF ENGINEERING, CAIRO UNIVERSITY
GIZA, EGYPT

2020

AN EVALUATION MODEL FOR GREEN WALL DESIGN ALTERNATIVES IN OUTDOOR PUBLIC SPACES

By

Abdallah Ahmed ElHady Saad ElNaggar

A Thesis Submitted to the
Faculty of Engineering at Cairo University
In Partial Fulfilment of the
Requirements for the Degree of
DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY
In
Architectural Engineering

Approved by the Examining Committee:

Prof. Dr Amr Mostafa El-Halafawy, Thesis Main Advisor
Professor of Architecture &Urban Design, Faculty of Engineering, Cairo University

Prof. Dr. Ahmed Mohamed Amin Mohamed, Internal Examiner
Professor of Architecture &Landscape Design, Faculty of Engineering, Cairo University

Prof. Dr. Reham Ibrahim Momtaz, External Examiner
Professor of Architecture &Urban Design, Faculty of Engineering,
Dean, Faculty of Engineering,MTI University

FACULTY OF ENGINEERING, CAIRO UNIVERSITY
GIZA, EGYPT

2020

Engineer's Name: Abdallah Ahmed ElHady Saad Ahmed ElNaggar
Date of Birth: 03/09/1989
Nationality: Egyptian
E-mail: Abdallah-el-hady@hotmail.com
Phone: 0233041220
Address: 10St.Abdalziz Gawish -ElAgouza
Registration Date: 01/03/2015
Awarding Date: / /2020
Degree: Doctor of Philosophy
Department: Architecture Engineering



Supervisors:

Prof. Dr. /Amr Mostafa El-Halafawy
Dr./ Rasha Abd El-Rahman Moussa
Assistant Professor of Architecture and Urban Design
& Head of Architecture Department, College of Architecture and
Design, Alasala Colleges

Examiners:

Prof. Dr./ Amr Mostafa ElHalafawy (Main Advisor)
Prof. Dr./Ahmed Mohamed Amin Mohamed (Internal examiner)
Prof. Dr./ Reham Ibrahim Momtaz (External examiner)
Professor of Architecture & Urban Design, Faculty of Engineering,
Dean, Faculty of Engineering, MTI University

Title of Thesis:

**AN EVALUATION MODEL FOR GREEN WALL DESIGN
ALTERNATIVES IN OUTDOOR PUBLIC SPACES**

Key Words:

Vertical green walls; Aesthetics; Enclosure space; Life Cycle; Scheme Design

Summary:

This Research is hosting the argument of green wall design efficiency and cost efficiency to be introduced in the space shaping process, creating an outdoor space that facilitates human needs. Through addressing variables that may help to contribute elevating green wall design quality inside the outdoor public spaces by discussing the green wall benefits inside outdoors areas and each benefit importance precedence along with design alternative according to the perception of experts. The thesis proposed an evaluating model for green wall design alternative. That will help to figure out the best design alternative to be applied in the construction phase and help the designer purpose the best design alternative with high efficiency and minimal cost.

Disclaimer

I hereby declare that this thesis is my own original work and that no part of it has been submitted for a degree qualification at any other university or institute.

I further declare that I have appropriately acknowledged all sources used and have cited them in the references section.

Name: Abdallah Ahmed ElHady Saad ElNaggar

Date: 2020

Signature:

Acknowledgements

Foremost, I would like to express sincere gratitude to Prof. Dr Amr Mostafa El-Halafawy, for the continuous support of my PhD thesis, for his patience, motivation, enthusiasm, and immense knowledge. His guidance helped me in all the time of research and writing of this thesis. Also; I would like to thank Dr Rasha Abd El-Rahman Moussa, for her support and knowledge throughout my thesis, her guidance added more value to the whole research outline.

I want to thank my committee members, Prof. Dr Ahmed Mohamed Amin, Internal Examiner Professor of Architecture &Urban Design, Faculty of Engineering, Cairo University and Prof. Dr Reham Ibrahim Momtaz, External Examiner Professor of Architecture &Urban Design, Faculty of Engineering, Dean, Faculty of Engineering, MTI University. My sincere thanks also go to Prof. Dr Walaa Ahmed Nour, Professor of Architecture &Urban Design, Faculty of Engineering, Tanta University and Assoc. Prof Tamer Abdelaziz Associated Professor of Architecture &Urban Planning, Faculty of Engineering, Cairo University who has supported me throughout my thesis for their motivation to finish my thesis successfully.

My sincere thanks to my teacher, Prof. Dr Hany Louis Attalah Professor of Architecture &Urban Design, Faculty of Fine Arts, Helwan University, for his moral support and care throughout the postgraduate years.

My sincere appreciation of my family, especially my parents, for supporting me spiritually throughout my life. As they have been a constant source of support, emotional, moral during my postgraduate years, and this thesis would indeed not have existed without them. Last but not least; I want to thank my teachers Dr Ghada Abdallah, Dr Nehal Mohamed and my friends Mohamed Maher, Rami Ahmed, Serag-Eldin Omar, Samar Adam, Amr Rabie, Alia Emam, Ghada Ghazala, Dalia Bassiouny, Mohamed Maysara, Aliaa Shokry, Alaa Gamal, Ahmed Samir, Ehab Magdy. For their moral support and care as they helped me overcome setbacks and stay focused on my graduate study. I greatly value their friendship, and I sincerely appreciate their belief in me

Table of Contents

Disclaimer	I
Acknowledgements.....	II
Table of Contents.....	III
List of Tables	VII
List of Figures	IX
Abstract.....	XII
Introduction.....	XIII
Research Problem & Questions	XIV
Research Objective	XIV
Research Hypothesis.....	XV
Research Structure	XV
Chapter One:	XV
Chapter Two:	XV
Chapter Three:	XVI
Chapter Four:	XVI
Chapter Five:.....	XVI
Chapter Six:	XVI
Research Methodology	XVI
<u>CHAPTER 1</u>	
<u>Landscape architecture's as green infrastructure perspective</u>	
1.1.Introduction.....	1
1.2.Definition of Green Infrastructure	1
1.3.Green Infrastructure and Landscape Design, Planning	2
1.3.1.Definition of the green infrastructure landscape approach	3

1.3.2.Green infrastructure historical review	3
1.3.3.Green infrastructure benefits.....	4
1.3.4.Green Infrastructure in the Design Process.....	6
1.4.Brief on Building Envelope	6
1.5.Understanding the Green Wall Meaning and Classification	8
1.5.1.Historical background on Green Walls	9
1.5.2.Green Facades	10
1.5.3.Living walls.....	14
1.6.Benefits of vertical green walls review	16
1.7.Conclusion	19
 <u>CHAPTER 2</u>	
<u>Green walls benefits and factors</u>	
2.1.Introduction.....	21
2.2.Environmental Ethics.....	21
2.2.1.Urban Heat Island Phenomenon Problem	21
2.2.2.Thermal impact of green walls Solutions.....	24
2.2.3.Reduce Carbon Footprint and Improve Air Quality	26
2.2.4.Acoustic absorption characteristics of greenery (Noise control)	27
2.3.Social, Ecological Impacts of Green walls	29
2.3.1.Psychological Aspects.....	29
2.3.2.Aesthetic Aspects	31
2.4.Green Walls Flexibility.....	40
2.4.1.Types of Dynamic Facades	41
2.4.2.Flexibility Through Motion.....	41
2.4.3.Movement Analysis.....	45
2.5.Plant Adaption Inside The Green Wall System.....	46

2.6.Green Walls Installation & Maintenance Costs.....	47
2.7.Conclusion	47

CHAPTER 3

Green walls perspective in outdoor public spaces reviews

3.1.Introduction.....	49
3.2.Green Walls & Building Envelope Adapting	49
3.2.1.Example 1: Consorcio – Chile Office Building	50
3.2.2.Example 2: Edith Green-Wendell Wyatt Federal	51
3.3Green Walls Assembly Evaluation Models Reviews	52
3.3.1.Proposed Models For Green Walls With Respect To Construction Types & Benefits Review.....	52
3.3.2.Proposed Models For Green Walls With Respect To Design Considerations Review	56
3.3.3.Green Walls With Respect To Life Cycle Analysis.....	57
3.3.4.Total Life Cycle Analysis Results Outcomes	70
3.4.Conclusion	71

CHAPTER 4

Green walls Alternatives Evaluation Model Structure

4.1.Research Contribution	72
4.2.Performance Aspects Relative weights	76
4.3.Deduction Of Relative Weights.....	80
4.4.Questionnaire Design.....	80
4.5.Samplig Design.....	81
4.6.Data Collection Methods and Techniques.....	81
4.7.Quantitative Analysis of Outcomes	82
4.8.Experts Perception	83
4.9.Social ‘Aesthetics’ Benefits relative weights	83
4.10.Environmental Benefits relative weights.....	85
4.11.Flexibility relative weights	88

4.12.Social physiological benefits relative weight	89
4.13. “Life cycle” relative weights	90
4.14.Evaluation Model.....	92
4.15.Cost Evaluation.....	95

CHAPTER 5

Applying the Evaluation Model on Locale Case Study

5.1.Case Study of City Center-Almaza.....	97
5.2.Case Study (Model validation) steps review	98
5.3.Social (Aesthetics’) visual quality Evaluation.....	105
5.4.Social ‘physiological’ Evaluation Data	107
5.5.Flexibility (Construction details) Evaluation Data	108
5.6.Environmental Ethics Evaluation Data.....	109
5.7.Green Living Wall Running Cost Data	111
5.8.Conclusion	113

CHAPTER 6

Conclusion and Recommendations

6.1.Conclusion Of The Theoretical & Analytical Study	114
6.1.1Direct Green Climbers Green Facades.....	114
6.1.2.Indirect Green Climbers Green Facades	114
6.1.3.Living Walls	115
6.2.Conclusion Of The Applied Study	115
6.2.1.Living Wall Applications In Public Urban Spaces	115
6.2.2.Benefits Of Green Facades & Living Walls	116
6.3.Recommendations For Design and Landscape Architecture Organizations	118
6.4.Future Studies recommended.....	119
Reference	120
Appendix A: Questionnaire Structure	126

List of Tables

Table_1. 1 Public Benefits of Green Walls	17
Table_1. 2 Private Benefits of Green Walls	18
Table_2. 1 summary of techniques for visual quality design and assessment. ...	32
Table_3. 1 Aspects and parameters improved via green wall. 49	
Table_3. 2 Types of Green walls constructions.....	54
Table_3. 3 Green walls benefits outcome according to case studies.....	55
Table_3. 4 Green walls Installation costs comparison according to case studies worldwide.	55
Table_3. 5 Relative weights' checklist of design considerations for vertical garden.....	57
Table_3. 6 Materials weight (kg) and service life (years) of Geogreen components.	61
Table_3. 7 Life cycle of green wall system flow chart.....	62
Table_3. 8 Direct Green wall LCA data sheet.....	64
Table_3. 9 In-Direct Green wall LCA data sheet.	65
Table_3. 10 Green Wall (Felt System): Embodied energy and Carbon data per m2.	66
Table_3. 11 Green Wall (In-Direct System): Embodied energy and Carbon data per m2.	66
Table_3. 12 Life cycle analysis for both direct and indirect green wall systems.	67
Table_3. 13 Life cycle analysis maintained phase.	68
Table_3. 14 Green wall uses & energy savings provided in three case-studies..	69
Table_3. 15 Green wall systems total life cycle analysis phase's outcome.	70
Table_3. 16 Evaluation Aspects consideration summary.....	71
Table_4. 1 The Evaluation Model Structure outline.....	73
Table_4. 2 Green walls Design Efficiency Evaluation Model Structure.	74
Table_4. 3 Empirical research methodology.	75
Table_4. 4 Performance Aspects Relative weights.	76
Table_4. 5 Green walls Design Efficiency Evaluation Model Structure.	77
Table_4. 6 Social Aspect (Aesthetics appeal) evaluation of relative weight.	78
Table_4. 7 The Evaluation model structure.....	79
Table_4. 8 Perception of experts and users towards green walls benefits model.	80
Table_4. 9 Applied Study Framework.....	81
Table_4. 10 Model Evaluation Steps.....	92
Table_4. 11 Alternative Design and cost efficiency evaluation.	92
Table_4. 12 Green walls Design Efficiency Evaluation Model.	93
Table_4. 13 Experts Visual Quality Evaluation Variation Comparison Matrix..	94
Table_4. 14 Green walls Economic Efficiency Structure Input.	95
Table_4. 15 Green walls Economic Efficiency Evaluation Model.	96

Table_5. 1 Green walls Visual Quality Evaluation Model for expert number one.	102
Table_5. 2 Green walls Visual Quality Evaluation Model for expert number two.	103
Table_5. 3 Green walls Visual Quality Evaluation Model for expert number three.....	104
Table_5. 4 Experts Visual quality evaluation.....	106
Table_5. 5 Croton Plant Classification (Case Study).....	107
Table_5. 6 Sound Absorption Coefficient.....	110
Table_5. 7 Life Cycle Cost Analysis Methodology Outcomes.....	111
Table_5. 8 Total life cost (Case study).....	112

List of Figures

Figure_1. 1 Urban Green Infrastructure types as a sustainable approach within the city platform.....	1
Figure_1. 2 Potential components of a Green Infrastructure.....	2
Figure_1. 3 pre-Columbian Machu Picchu.....	4
Figure_1. 4 The three main aspects of sustainability.	4
Figure_1. 5 Realizing the Multiple Benefits of Green Infrastructure.....	5
Figure_1. 6 Landscape green infrastructure design scales.	6
Figure_1. 7 Building Envelope typologies and design determinants	7
Figure_1. 8 Building envelope green infrastructure solutions.	7
Figure_1. 9 Types of green walls.....	8
Figure_1. 10 Hanging Gardens of Babylon.....	9
Figure_1. 11 A group of highlights of the green walls time-line.	10
Figure_1. 12 Direct green facade in Amsterdam.....	11
Figure_1. 13 Indirect green facade in Amsterdam	11
Figure_1. 14 Indirect systems of green facades.....	11
Figure_1. 15 Freestanding trellis fence (left), column trellis (bottom), custom trellis shapes (right).	12
Figure_1. 16 Modular walls hung trellis (left), curved trellis (right).	13
Figure_1. 17 Grid System, Ex Ducati Office Italy.	13
Figure_1. 18 Wire-Rope Net Systems, MFO Park Switzerland.....	13
Figure_1. 19 Living wall system detail	15
Figure_1. 20 Vegetated Mat Walls, Madrid Spain	15
Figure_1. 21 Newcastle's Marks & Spencer store unveils a modular living green wall.....	16
Figure_1. 22 A living wall created to provide a variety of visual textures	19
Figure_1. 23 Flowering green wall elements celebrate a pedestrian entryway...	19
Figure_2. 1 Green wall thermal impact on UHI problem.....	21
Figure_2. 2 Urban heat island dealings.	22
Figure_2. 3 Urban Heat Island reasons and its impact.	23
Figure_2. 4 Solar Radiation Transmission of Green Facade.....	23
Figure_2. 5 Experiment of Bioshader.....	24
Figure_2. 6 Energy balance of a leaf.	25
Figure_2. 7 Published percentage reduction in pollutant concentration with (a) green walls to green wall free case and (b) green roof to green roof free case. Bars show the reported range of reduction by respective studies.....	26
Figure_2. 8 In-canyon concentration reduction and vegetation cover.	27
Figure_2. 9 Average sound absorption coefficient for various greenery coverage.	28
Figure_2. 10 Green walls social impacts 3 main aspects.	29
Figure_2. 11 Building Biomembranes regulate building ecology and create vertical landscapes.	30
Figure_2. 12 Visual Quality Approach.....	31
Figure_2. 13 Typical illustrative site plan.	33
Figure_2. 14 Typical illustrative Section.....	33

Figure_2. 15 Typical illustrative Perspective.	33
Figure_2. 16 Seven elements of design.	34
Figure_2. 17 Define of design elements.	34
Figure_2. 18 Art Principles.....	35
Figure_2. 19 On the left show façade openings balanced at the centerline; note offset entry. On the Right show, multiple symmetrical segments defined by roof heights.	35
Figure_2. 20 Observing the size of a building element comparative to other forms.	36
Figure_2. 21 Observing the proportion Two ratios relationship, height to width as an example.	36
Figure_2. 22 Rhythm regular or harmonious recurrence of lines, shapes, forms, and details.	37
Figure_2. 23 A correlation between the (perhaps unjust or at least overly-abundant) critiques of ‘architecture and a sense of exhaustion regarding this era of "individual expression" in architecture.	37
Figure_2. 24 Articulation, in art and architecture, is a method of styling the joints in the formal elements of architectural design.	38
Figure_2. 25 It is, in essence, a defining feature of modern architecture. Transparency is a medium to open up closed spaces to Light and air.....	38
Figure_2. 26 Example of Visual elements and principles applied in living walls design	39
Figure_2. 27 Flexibility chart.	40
Figure_2. 28 Kiefer Technic Showroom dynamic facade model.....	41
Figure_2. 29 Dynamic patterns in the Henning Larsen’s University Building facade	41
Figure_2. 30 US pavilion at expo 2015 in Milan dynamic living walls.....	42
Figure_2. 31 Moveable-green walls	43
Figure_2. 32 Assembly detail allowing green wall move-ability.....	43
Figure_2. 33 living walls panels positioned in a multitude of patterns offering visual variety with adding night lighting increasing the visual value	44
Figure_2. 34 The Types of movement.....	45
Figure_2. 35 Green living wall Winter on the left and Spring on the right views installation benefits from a careful selection of plant varieties.	46
Figure_3. 1 Green facade at summer (Right), Colorful facade at autumn (Left).	50
Figure_3. 2 Before and After adding the double-skin green facade.....	51
Figure_3. 3 west facade aluminum “reeds” attached to a steel structure that shades the curtainwall to mitigate heat gain. Vegetation is being trained to grow around the frame to the height of the 3rd floor.....	51
Figure_3. 4 Life cycle assessment metrics.	58
Figure_3. 5 Geogreen modular system design with plants and substarte.....	59
Figure_3. 6 Geo green modules in a vertical position with the interlocking system.	59
Figure_3. 7 Geo green module materials weight percentage.	60
Figure_3. 8 Environmental Impact by sector.	62