



شبكة المعلومات الجامعية
التوثيق الإلكتروني والميكرو فيلم

بسم الله الرحمن الرحيم



MONA MAGHRABY



شبكة المعلومات الجامعية
التوثيق الإلكتروني والميكرو فيلم



شبكة المعلومات الجامعية التوثيق الإلكتروني والميكرو فيلم



MONA MAGHRABY



شبكة المعلومات الجامعية
التوثيق الإلكتروني والميكروفيلم

جامعة عين شمس

التوثيق الإلكتروني والميكروفيلم

قسم

نقسم بالله العظيم أن المادة التي تم توثيقها وتسجيلها
علي هذه الأقراص المدمجة قد أعدت دون أية تغييرات



يجب أن

تحفظ هذه الأقراص المدمجة بعيدا عن الغبار



MONA MAGHRABY



Cairo University

**INFLUENCE OF POST-RENAISSANCE IDEOLOGY ON
EGYPTIAN POST-TRADITIONAL ARCHITECTURE
A CASE STUDY OF CAIRENE ISLAMIC RELIGIOUS BUILDINGS**

By

Omar SeifAllah Mohamed Samy AbolNaga

A Thesis Submitted to the
Faculty of Engineering at Cairo University
in Partial Fulfillment of the
Requirements for the Degree of
MASTER OF SCIENCE
in
Architectural Engineering

FACULTY OF ENGINEERING, CAIRO UNIVERSITY
GIZA, EGYPT
2020

**INFLUENCE OF POST-RENAISSANCE IDEOLOGY ON
EGYPTIAN POST-TRADITIONAL ARCHITECTURE
A CASE STUDY OF CAIRENE ISLAMIC RELIGIOUS BUILDINGS**

By
Omar SeifAllah Mohamed Samy AbolNaga

A Thesis Submitted to the
Faculty of Engineering at Cairo University
in Partial Fulfillment of the
Requirements for the Degree of
MASTER OF SCIENCE
in
Architectural Engineering

Under the Supervision of

Prof. Dr. Aly H. Gabr

.....
Professor of Theories of Architecture
Department of Architecture
Faculty of Engineering, Cairo University

FACULTY OF ENGINEERING, CAIRO UNIVERSITY
GIZA, EGYPT
2020

**INFLUENCE OF POST-RENAISSANCE IDEOLOGY ON
EGYPTIAN POST-TRADITIONAL ARCHITECTURE
A CASE STUDY OF CAIRENE ISLAMIC RELIGIOUS BUILDINGS**

By
Omar SeifAllah Mohamed Samy AbolNaga

A Thesis Submitted to the
Faculty of Engineering at Cairo University
in Partial Fulfillment of the
Requirements for the Degree of
MASTER OF SCIENCE
in
Architectural Engineering

Approved by the
Examining Committee

Prof. Dr. Aly H. Gabr,

Thesis Main Advisor

Asst. Prof. Dr. Naila M. Farid Toulan,

Internal Examiner

Prof. Dr. Manal Ahmed Samir Abou El-Ela, External Examiner
Professor of Architecture in Faculty of Engineering in Shoubra, Benha University.

FACULTY OF ENGINEERING, CAIRO UNIVERSITY
GIZA, EGYPT
2020

Engineer's Name: Omar SeifAllah Mohamed Samy AbolNaga
Date of Birth: 1/3/1994
Nationality: Egyptian
E-mail: omaraboulnaga@gmail.com
Phone: 0020-1010045561
Address: 1, Dr. El Mahrouki St., Heliopolis
Registration Date: 01/03/2018
Awarding Date:/....../2020
Degree: Master of Science
Department: Architectural Engineering
Supervisors:



Prof. Dr. Aly H. Gabr

Examiners:

Prof. Dr. Aly H. Gabr (Thesis main advisor)
Asst. Prof. Naila M. Farid Toulani
(Internal examiner)
Prof. Dr. Manal Ahmed Samir Abou El-Ela
(External Examiner)
Department of Architecture, Faculty of
Engineering in Shoubra, Benha University.

Title of Thesis:

Influence of Post-Renaissance Ideology on Egyptian Post-Traditional Architecture: A Case Study of Cairene Islamic Religious Buildings

Key Words:

Post-Traditional; Post-Renaissance; Traditionalism; Egyptian Mosque Architecture; Symbolic Architecture

Summary:

Within the quest for understanding how Egypt's contemporary scene has drastically changed from the traditional one, the researcher studies the influence of Western post-Renaissance ideologies on the formation of a distorted architectural world view that created a void in architectural thought. This void creates a discourse that is full of direct borrowing and mimicking of other architectural styles. Through tackling various research objectives, the researcher attempts to prove the thesis hypothesis through illustrating a comparative analysis of case studies related to religious buildings built in different critical timings.

Disclaimer

I hereby declare that this thesis is my own original work and that no part of it has been submitted for a degree qualification at any other university or institute.

I further declare that I have appropriately acknowledged all sources used and have cited them in the references section.

Name: Omar SeifAllah Mohamed Samy AbolNaga

Date: .././2020

Signature:

Dedication

I would like to dedicate this thesis to my mother, Olfat, who alone defied unbearable difficulties, challenged the unchallengeable and gave all possible support to her two sons. To my brother, Mohamed, who has always believed in me. To my father, who inspired me to become an architect. To Dr Aly Gabr, who has been to me my professor, advisor, friend, and father. Lastly but not least, to God the Almighty, whom through which all of this was made possible.

Acknowledgments

Interest in the traditional approach of Islamic architecture began during my undergraduate course work at Cairo University. Discussions raised by Dr Aly Gabr on the different world views and interpretations of modern versus traditional man peaked my interest. Shortly after my graduation and during my graduate course studies, I was introduced to works of Seyyed Hossein Nasr, Titus Burckhardt, Henry Corbin, Martin Lings, and other spiritualists that opened my eyes to a further dimension regarding traditional arts in general. With thoughtful discussions with Dr Aly Gabr and with extensive readings in traditional and post-traditional theories, I began implementing my readings on today's architectural scene. Controversies regarding contemporary Egyptian discourse of architecture strongly influenced my research. Today, three years after my graduation, I realise that this thesis is only a debut to what will be a lifetime's work, from academic research to architectural practice.

Throughout the course of my undergraduate and post-graduate studies, I have been supported, guided and advised by Dr Aly Gabr. Without his insightful and resourceful guidance and mentoring, this work would not have been made possible. I would like to thank him for the books he provided me with throughout this research. I wish to use this opportunity to extend my sincere regards and appreciation to him. I would also like to thank my friends and colleagues who, over the past seven years, have given me advice and assistance: in particular Ibrahim M. El-Hadidi, Rana Adel Zein and Fady Sherif Abdelaziz. I am also deeply indebted to my mentors in the Department of Architecture at Cairo University. I would like to thank the American University in Cairo for opening to me the doors of its prosperous library, in which most of the work of this research was carried out.

Table of Contents

DISCLAIMER.....	I
DEDICATION.....	II
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS.....	III
TABLE OF CONTENTS	IV
LIST OF TABLES.....	VI
LIST OF FIGURES	VII
NOMENCLATURE	XIII
ABSTRACT	XIV
CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION.....	1
1.1. RESEARCH PROBLEM.....	3
1.2. AIM AND OBJECTIVES	3
1.3. HYPOTHESIS.....	4
1.4. THESIS PARAMETERS	4
1.5. METHODOLOGICAL FRAMEWORK.....	5
CHAPTER TWO: RENAISSANCE WORLD VIEW AND ARCHITECTURE	7
2.1. ORIGINS OF THE RENAISSANCE.....	7
2.2. ARCHITECTURAL PRINCIPLES OF THE RENAISSANCE PERIOD	10
2.2.1. <i>Alberti's ideal church</i>	11
2.2.2. <i>Palladio's geometry: the villa</i>	13
2.2.3. <i>Harmonic proportions in Renaissance architecture</i>	17
2.3. POST-RENAISSANCE ARCHITECTURAL THEORY	21
2.3.1. <i>Architectural theory of the 17th century</i>	23
2.3.1. <i>Architectural theory of the 18th and 19th centuries</i>	26
2.4. CONCLUDING SUMMARY	29
CHAPTER THREE: INFLUENCE OF WESTERN ENLIGHTENMENT ON EGYPTIAN POST-TRADITIONAL ARCHITECTURE AND SOCIETY	31
3.1. TRADITION AND TRADITIONAL VALUES IN ISLAMIC ARCHITECTURE	31
3.1.1. <i>The role of the early environment in shaping the normative Islamic world view</i>	33
3.1.2. <i>Principles behind traditional Islamic architecture</i>	34
3.2. THE FRENCH CAMPAIGN AND BELIEF IN EUROPEAN CULTURAL SUPERIORITY.....	37
3.3. RECEPTION OF THE FRENCH CAMPAIGN BY THE TRADITIONAL WORLD VIEW	41
3.4. THE ARCHITECTURE OF EGYPTIAN SOCIETY POST THE FRENCH CAMPAIGN	43
3.4.1. <i>Transformations under Muhammad Ali</i>	44
3.4.2. <i>The transformation under Khedive Isma'īl</i>	51
3.4.3. <i>Preserving and reviving Islamic architecture in the 19th and 20th centuries</i>	54
3.5. CONCLUDING SUMMARY	60
CHAPTER FOUR: THE GENESIS AND EVOLUTION OF THE MOSQUE AND ITS ARCHITECTURAL ELEMENTS	63
4.1. THE MOSQUE AND QIBLA IN ISLAM	63
4.2. ARCHITECTURAL ELEMENTS OF THE MOSQUE.....	66
4.2.1. <i>The portal (al-bāb)</i>	67
4.2.2. <i>The bent corridor (majāz)</i>	69
4.2.3. <i>The courtyard (al-Sahn) and water fountain (fawwāra)</i>	70
4.2.4. <i>The arch (al-'ikd) and iwān</i>	73
4.2.5 <i>The praying hall</i>	74
4.2.6. <i>The qibla niche (mihrāb)</i>	76
4.2.7 <i>The stalactites (muqarnas)</i>	77

4.2.8. <i>The dome (qubba)</i>	80
4.2.9. <i>The minaret (mi'dhana/manāra)</i>	83
4.2.10. <i>The crenellations ('arayis al-samā')</i>	85
4.3. CONCLUDING SUMMARY	86
CHAPTER FIVE: ANALYSIS OF TRADITIONAL AND POST-TRADITIONAL RELIGIOUS ARCHITECTURE	89
5.1. MOSQUE-MADRASA OF SULTĀN HASSAN	89
5.1.1. <i>The portal and external skin</i>	91
5.1.2. <i>The entrance hall and majāz</i>	94
5.1.3. <i>The courtyard and fawwāra</i>	96
5.1.4. <i>The courtyard's flooring</i>	98
5.1.5. <i>The iwāns</i>	101
5.1.6. <i>The mihrāb</i>	103
5.1.7. <i>The minarets</i>	105
5.1.8. <i>The mausoleum chamber</i>	106
5.2. FUNERARY MOSQUE OF AL-RIFA'I.....	108
5.2.1. <i>The portals and external skin</i>	111
5.2.2. <i>The entrance hall</i>	113
5.2.3. <i>The praying hall</i>	114
5.2.4. <i>The mihrāb</i>	115
5.2.5. <i>The domes and minarets</i>	116
5.3. AL-FATTĀH AL-ALĪM MOSQUE	117
5.3.1. <i>The portals and external skin</i>	120
5.3.2. <i>The praying hall</i>	122
5.3.3. <i>The mihrāb</i>	124
5.3.4. <i>The dome and minarets</i>	126
5.3.5. <i>The flooring</i>	127
5.4. CONCLUDING SUMMARY	128
CHAPTER SIX: CONCLUSION	131
6.1. SUMMARY.....	131
6.2. DISCUSSION	142
6.3. PROSPECTS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH	144
REFERENCES	145
المُلخَص.....	أ

List of Tables

Table 6.1	Comparative Analysis of Case Studies: Mosque of Sultān Hassan.....	134
Table 6.1	Comparative Analysis of Case Studies: Mosque of Al-Rifa‘i.....	138
Table 6.1	Comparative Analysis of Case Studies: Mosque of Al-Fattāh Al-Alīm	140

List of Figures

- **Fig.2.1(a)** Proportional rules for the construction of a church, by Francesco di Giorgi. Source: Trattato di Architettura civile e militare.....12
- **Fig.2.1(b)** Leonardo Da Vinci's plan of a church following "proper rules and norms". Source: MS. B, f.52r, Inst. de France.....12
- **Fig.2.2(a)** Vitruvian man by Francesco di Giorgi. Source: Rudolf Wittkower, 1971.13
- **Fig.2.2(b)** Vitruvian man by Francesco Da Vinci. Source: Rudolf Wittkower, 1971.13
- **Fig.2.2(c)** Vitruvian man by Cesariano. Source: Rudolf Wittkower, 1971.....13
- **Fig.2.3(a)** Plan of Villa Farnesina in Rome by Peruzzi (1509-11), where symmetry is not absolute. Source: Rudolf Wittkower, 1971.....14
- **Fig.2.3(b)** Plan of Villa Godi Porto in Lonedo by Palladio, absolute symmetry is applied. Source: Rudolf Wittkower, 1971.....14
- **Fig.2.4** Plans and elevations of Villa Thiene (left) and Villa Sarego (right), showing how Palladio applied one formula in his plans but with different variations. Source: Andrea Palladio, 1570.....15
- **Fig.2.5** Plans of eleven of Palladio's villas featuring his formula. Source: Rudolf Wittkower, 1971.....16
- **Fig.2.6** An allegory on the meaning of geometry as a transcendental revelation, as it was discovered by Aristippus after being shipwrecked on Rhodes island. As a result of the Galilean influence, Perrault rejected this perception over geometry and only viewed it as a tool to achieve positive beauty. Illustration from Jacques Ozanam's *Récréations Mathématiques*. Source: Alberto Pérez Gómez, 1983.....24
- **Fig.2.7** Durand's geometrical method for the combination of plans, which according to him was compatible to all kinds of buildings. Source: J.N.L Durand, 1823.....27
- **Fig.2.8** Durand's comparison between Soufflot's Pantheon (drawings at the top) and a proposal drawn project by Durand (drawings at the bottom) imagining if Soufflot had had abided by rules of economy. Source: J.N.L Durand, 1823.28
- **Fig.3.1** Illustration extracted from Description De L'Égypte, showing contemporary inhabitants use in the book as marginalised accessories. Source: Rare Book Division, The New York Public Library. (1809 - 1828). *Thèbes. Qournah [Qurna]. Vue perspective du palais*. Retrieved from <http://digitalcollections.nypl.org/items/510d47e0-0fb9-a3d9-e040-e00a18064a99>.....39
- **Fig.3.2** Cairo filled with hills and ponds before the projects commissioned by Muhammad Ali. Source: Omar Azzam, 1960.....45
- **Fig.3.3** Pascal Coste's initial design for the mosque of Muhammad Ali. The design was never executed. It strongly presented a classical symmetrical form distant from traditional Mamlūk mosques. Source: <https://sophia.smith.edu/blog/globalcairo/speaking-back-to-egypts-mamluk-past/> (Accessed 9/5/2020).....47

- **Fig.3.4** Pascal Coste's design for the executed mosque of Muhammad Ali. Notice the great difference with the initial design. Source: <https://sophia.smith.edu/blog/globalcairo/speaking-back-to-egypts-mamluk-past/> (Accessed 9/5/2020).....47
- **Fig.3.5(a)** Pascal Coste's drawing of Pompey's pillar in 1817. Source: Eva-Maria Troelenberg, 2015.....48
- **Fig.3.5(b)** Recent picture of Pompey's pillar. Notice the extreme accuracy of Coste's rendering. Source: Daniel Mayer, Wikimedia Commons, 2018.....48
- **Fig.3.6** Pascal Coste's façade and crenellation details of Ibn Tūlūn mosque. Its inaccuracy shows his filtered perspective. Source: Eva-Maria Troelenberg, 2015.....49
- **Fig.3.7** Pascal Coste's stucco ornament details of Ibn Tūlūn mosque. Its relative accuracy shows his perception could easily interpret such details. Source: Eva-Maria Troelenberg, 2015.....49
- **Fig.3.8(a)** Pascal Coste's plan interpretation of complex of al-Mansūr Qlāwūn. Notice the rectilinear grid. Source: Eva-Maria Troelenberg, 2015.....50
- **Fig.3.8(b)** Recent floor plan of the complex of al-Mansūr Qalāwūn, drawn by Saeed Arida in 2003. Source: Eva-Maria Troelenberg, 201550
- **Fig.3.9(a)** Pascal Coste's floor plan of Alexandria mosque, 1825. Notice the orthodox classical symmetry. Source: Eva-Maria Troelenberg, 2015.....51
- **Fig.3.9(b)** Pascal Coste's symmetrical main façade of the mosque of Alexandria. Source: Eva-Maria Troelenberg, 2015.....51
- **Fig.3.10(a)** Old Cairo dense buildings. Source: Omar Azzam, 1960.....53
- **Fig.3.10(b)** Soliman Pasha square in Cairo, showing the newly imported European influence. Source: Omar Azzam, 1960.....53
- **Fig.3.11** Cairo's 19th century neglected domestic architecture. Source: K.A.C Creswell, American University in Cairo, Courtesy Rare Books Special Collections Library.....54
- **Fig.3.12(a)** Minaret of Qādī Abd al-Bāsīt mosque before the *comité's* intervention. Source: Creswell Photographic Collection, The American University in Cairo.....58
- **Fig.3.12(b)** Minaret of Qādī Abd al-Bāsīt mosque after the *comité's* intervention. Source: Matjaž Kačičnik.....58
- **Fig.3.13** Elevation and plan of a residential palace in the new neighbourhood of Heliopolis, adopting the popular Neo-Mamlūk style. The Plan is that of a typical Western one, while the elevation is composed of a superimposed composition of Mamlūk elements. Source: Dobrowolska, A., & Dobrowolski, J., 2006.....59
- **Fig.3.14** Funerary mosque of Abu'l-'Abbas al-Mursi, designed by Mario Rossi and finished in 1945. The design strongly borrows its style from traditional Mamlūk mosques. Source: <http://aathaar.net/en/place/1> (Accessed 10/5/2020).....60
- **Fig.3.15** Al-Sayyida Safiyya mosque designed by Mohammed Eissa in Heliopolis and completed in 1980. The entire mosque follows a Neo-Mamlūk language. Source: Author, 2020.....60
- **Fig. 4.1** Compositional development of congregational mosques throughout the Islamic world. Source: A.B. Prochazka, 1986.....64